

Statewide Low- and Moderate-Income Portfolio 2023 Annual Report

Jointly Filed By:

The Brooklyn Union Gas Company d/b/a National Grid NY
Central Hudson Gas & Electric Corporation
Consolidated Edison Company of New York, Inc.
KeySpan Gas East Corporation d/b/a National Grid
National Fuel Gas Distribution Corporation
NMPC Power Corporation d/b/a National Grid
New York State Electric & Gas Corporation
New York State Energy Research and Development Authority
Orange and Rockland Utilities, Inc.
Rochester Gas and Electric Corporation

April 1, 2024

Table of Contents

1.	Introduction	1
2.	Portfolio Administration and Progress	6
2.1.	LMI Joint Management Committee	6
2.2.	Statewide LMI Portfolio Performance Metrics	6
2.3.	Budgets and Targets	8
2.4.	Data Sharing Between the Program Administrators	9
2.5.	Implementation Contractor Models and Procurement.....	10
3.	Stakeholder Engagement.....	11
3.1.	Summary of Stakeholder Engagement Activity	11
3.2.	LMI Portfolio Stakeholder Engagement Sessions	11
3.3.	AMEEP Participating Contractor and Industry Partner Webinars	12
3.4.	Continuous Stakeholder Input and Integration	12
4.	1-4 Family Homes.....	13
4.1.	Program Summary	13
4.1.1.	EmPower +	13
4.1.2.	Home Energy Affordability Team SM (HEAT SM)	15
4.2.	Program Implementation Milestones.....	16
4.3.	Budgets, Targets, and Metrics	16
4.4.	Findings & Planned Improvements.....	16
5.	Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings.....	17
5.1.	Program Summary	17
5.1.1.	Affordable Multifamily Energy Efficiency Program (AMEEP).....	18
5.1.2.	Technical Assistance for Affordable Multifamily Buildings.....	20
5.1.3.	Multifamily Performance Program (MPP)	21
5.1.4.	RetrofitNY.....	22
5.1.5.	NYSERDA Partnerships with Affordable Housing Agencies	22
5.2.	Program Implementation Milestones.....	23
5.2.1.	Statewide Existing Affordable Multifamily Program.....	23
5.2.2.	Technical Assistance for Affordable Multifamily Buildings.....	24
5.2.3.	RetrofitNY.....	24
5.2.4.	NYSERDA Partnerships with Affordable Housing Agencies	24
5.3.	Budgets, Targets, and Metrics	24

5.4 Findings & Planned Improvements	25
6. Affordable New Construction	26
6.1 Program Summary	26
6.2 Program Implementation Milestones	26
6.3 Budgets, Targets, and Metrics	27
6.4 Findings & Planned Improvements	27
7. Pilots and Demonstrations	28
7.1 Program Summary	28
7.2 Program Implementation Milestones	28
7.3 Budgets, Targets, and Metrics	28
7.4 Findings & Planned Improvements	29
8. Beneficial Electrification in Low- and Moderate-Income Homes	29
8.1 Program Summary	29
8.2 Program Implementation Milestones	29
8.3 Budgets, Targets, and Metrics	30
8.4 Findings & Planned Improvements	30
9. Additional LMI Initiatives	32
9.1 Program Summary	32
9.1.1 New York State Healthy Homes Value-Based Payment Pilot	32
9.1.2 Solar for All	33
9.2 Program Implementation Milestones	34
9.3 Budgets, Targets, and Metrics	34
9.4 Findings & Planned Improvements	35
10. Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement	35
10.1 LMI Portfolio Marketing	35
10.1.1 Statewide Branding	36
10.1.2 NY Energy Advisor	36
10.1.3 Hard Copy Customer Education Collateral and Multilingual Communications	37
10.1.4 Community-Based Marketing and Paid Advertising	37
10.2 Community-Based Outreach, Education, and Engagement Partnerships	38
10.3 Community-Based Customer Engagement and Innovative Outreach Initiatives	39
10.4 Utility Community-Based Customer Engagement Initiatives	39
10.4.1 Utility Innovative Outreach Initiatives	41

10.5 Program Implementation Milestones.....	42
10.5.1 LMI Portfolio Marketing.....	42
10.5.2 Community-Based Outreach, Education, and Engagement Partnerships	42
10.6 Budgets, Targets, and Metrics	43
10.7 Findings & Planned Improvements.....	43
11. Evaluation, Measurement, and Verification	44
11.1 Evaluation, Measurement, and Verification Summary.....	44
11.2 Program Implementation Milestones.....	45
11.3 Budgets, Targets, and Metrics	45
11.4 Findings & Planned Improvements.....	45
12. Appendix A: Achievement to Budgets and Targets by Program Administrator	46
12.1 Central Hudson	46
12.2 Consolidated Edison.....	50
12.3 KEDLI	54
12.4 KEDNY	57
12.5 National Fuel Gas Distribution Company.....	60
12.6 New York State Energy Research & Development Authority	62
12.7 New York State Electric & Gas	66
12.8 NMPC	70
12.9 Orange & Rockland	74
12.10 Rochester Gas & Electric.....	79
13. Appendix B: LMI Portfolio Unit Costs.....	83
14. Appendix C: Measure Mix by Program Administrator	84
15. Appendix D: Realization Rates by Program Administrator	87
15.1 Central Hudson	87
15.2 Consolidated Edison.....	88
15.3 KEDLI	89
15.4 KEDNY	89
15.5 National Fuel Gas Distribution Corporation.....	90
15.6 New York State Energy Research & Development Authority	91
15.7 New York State Electric & Gas	92
15.8 NMPC	93
15.9 Orange & Rockland	94

15.10 Rochester Gas & Electric..... 95

1. Introduction

Pursuant to the January 16, 2020, Order Authorizing Utility Energy Efficiency and Building Electrification Portfolios through 2025 (“2020 NE: NY Order”), the New York State Energy Research and Development Authority (“NYSERDA”) and the New York Utilities¹ (collectively, “Program Administrators”) hereby file this Statewide LMI Portfolio Annual Report for 2023 (“Annual Report” or “Report”).²

In 2023 the Program Administrators continued the implementation and advancement of the Low- and Moderate-Income (“LMI”) statewide³ portfolio of energy efficiency programs and initiatives (the “Statewide LMI Portfolio” or the “Portfolio”), consistent with the Statewide Low- and Moderate-Income Portfolio Implementation Plan (“2022 Implementation Plan” or “2022 Plan”).⁴ The Program Administrators oversee the Portfolio of programs and offerings in the Implementation Plan⁵ in a holistic and coordinated manner to advance energy affordability and access to energy efficiency for New York’s LMI residents and communities while supporting New York State’s nation-leading climate policy to transition to carbon-free electricity systems and dramatically reduce greenhouse gas emissions. The Statewide LMI Portfolio is designed to: (1) improve the experience of and ultimately benefit LMI customers seeking to access clean energy services; (2) reduce administrative costs and increase the impact of ratepayer funding; and (3) provide more consistent and streamlined participation for service providers.

The programs and initiatives in the Portfolio contribute to achieving key goals from the Climate Leadership and Community Protection Act⁶ (“Climate Act”), including the requirement that disadvantaged communities receive no less than 35% (with a goal of 40%) of the overall benefits of spending on clean energy programs, by focusing on the equity issues that can be most directly addressed by clean energy

-
- ¹ Central Hudson Gas & Electric Corporation (“Central Hudson”); Consolidated Edison Company of New York, Inc. (“Con Edison”); KeySpan Gas East Corporation d/b/a National Grid (“KEDLI”), The Brooklyn Union Gas Company d/b/a National Grid NY (“KEDNY”), NMPC Power Corporation d/b/a National Grid (“NMPC”) (collectively “National Grid”); National Fuel Gas Distribution Corporation (“National Fuel Gas” or “NFGDC”); New York State Electric & Gas Corporation (“NYSEG”); Orange and Rockland Utilities, Inc. (“Orange & Rockland”); and Rochester Gas and Electric Corporation (“RG&E”) (collectively, “Utilities”).
- ² Case 18-M-0084, *In the Matter of a Comprehensive Energy Efficiency Initiative* (“NE: NY Proceeding”), Order Authorizing Utility Energy Efficiency and Building Electrification Portfolios Through 2025 (issued January 16, 2020) (“2020 NE: NY Order”), p. 103.
- ³ For the purpose of the Statewide LMI Portfolio, these initiatives serve customers located in the territories of the Utilities defined and do not serve, unless otherwise noted, customers in other utility territories across the state. NYSERDA and the Utilities coordinate and share information on initiatives with utilities not outlined in this Report, to ensure alignment and advancement of energy efficiency initiatives across the state.
- ⁴ NE: NY Proceeding, Statewide Low- and Moderate-Income Implementation Plan, Version 3 (“2022 Implementation Plan”) (June 28, 2023). In general, this 2023 Annual Report makes data and other comparisons to the 2022 Implementation Plan filed on June 28, 2023, in particular for data comparison between planned and actual 2023 performance. The initial Statewide Low- and Moderate-Income Implementation Plan was filed on July 24, 2020 (“2020 Implementation Plan”).
- ⁵ Whereas “2022 Implementation Plan” and “2022 Plan” refer to the Implementation Plan filed, this Annual Report also uses the non-date-specific term “Implementation Plan” to describe more generally the applicable governing plan for the Portfolio, which is to be revised and updated periodically (*i.e.*, “Implementation Plan”).
- ⁶ Chapter 106 of the Laws of 2019. The Climate Act is available at <https://legislation.nysenate.gov/pdf/bills/2019/S6599>.

programs such as energy affordability, reduced fossil fuel combustion to advance environmental justice, and enhanced community engagement. Furthermore, the Statewide LMI Portfolio will incorporate the Disadvantaged Communities criteria as established by the Climate Justice Working Group and informed by public comment into existing programs and new initiative developments where applicable and appropriate. The acceleration of energy efficiency, end-use electrification, and equitable access to these solutions for low-income and disadvantaged communities, as outlined in New York’s Scoping Plan⁷ (“Scoping Plan”) to achieve the mandates of the Climate Act, is core to the work and the outcomes of the LMI portfolio.

On July 20, 2023, the Commission released its Order Directing Energy Efficiency and Building Electrification Proposals (“EE/BE Proposals Order”). This Order established important directives related to the continuation of the Statewide LMI Portfolio.⁸ The Order outlined substantial changes to the Statewide LMI Portfolio to take full effect starting in 2026, after the current plan period which concludes as of December 31, 2025. The Order directed Program Administrators to file individual proposals on November 1, 2023, which, among other things, addressed the post-2025 LMI Portfolio. The Program Administrators each submitted proposals on November 1, 2023; for NYSERDA, Con Edison, and National Grid (for its KEDNY and KEDLI service territories), this included LMI Portfolio-specific proposals.⁹ Following a request from the New York State Department of Public Service (“DPS”) Staff¹⁰, the Program Administrators provided additional requested information on these proposals on January 12, 2024.¹¹ The Program Administrators will continue to work closely with DPS Staff to implement the directives of the EE/BE Proposals Order and any subsequent directives and Commission Orders.¹²

In the administration of the Portfolio, the Program Administrators preserve flexibility of annual budgets and production projections to provide for the ability to respond to increased demand and serve more households or buildings as necessary. Where necessary and feasible (*i.e.*, given regulatory requirements), Program Administrators either: have spent and/or will spend budgets from future years to meet program demand; or have spent and/or will spend budgets from earlier years in later years for the same reason. Any such reallocations applicable to 2023 are reflected in this Annual Report.¹³

In the Portfolio to date, 2020-2023, the Program Administrators collectively spent \$494 million, with estimated annual electric savings of approximately 323,720 megawatt hours (“MWh”)¹⁴ and annual gas

⁷ <https://climate.ny.gov/resources/scoping-plan/>

⁸ NE: NY Proceeding and Case 14-M-0094 (“CEF Proceeding”), Order Directing Energy Efficiency and Building Electrification Proposals (“EE/ BE Proposals Order”) (Issued July 20, 2023).

⁹ NYSERDA, Con Edison, and National Grid (for its KEDNY and KEDLI service territories) filed LMI Portfolio-specific proposals. Per the EE/BE Proposals Order, Central Hudson, NFGDC, NYSEG/ RG&E, Orange & Rockland, and National Grid in its NIMO service territory will not serve as LMI Portfolio Administrators beyond the current period ending in 2025. However, LMI Portfolio topics are included in these proposals, including to reflect continue roles in supporting the LMI Portfolio and the transition to post-2025 period.

¹⁰ NE: NY Proceeding and CEF Proceeding, EE-BE Proposal Supplemental Information Request, New York Department of Public Service (December 14, 2023).

¹¹ See, NE: NY Proceeding and CEF Proceeding for individual filings.

¹² NE: NY Proceeding, Energy Efficiency and Building Electrification Report (“EE BE Report”) (filed December 19, 2022).

¹³ See, NE: NY Proceeding, 2020 NE: NY Order, p. 69-70.

¹⁴ Note savings are represented as “blended” throughout the 2022 Annual Report (*i.e.*, VGS where applicable and gross where no realization rate is available for the particular program), consistent with reporting on the Clean Energy Dashboard.

savings of approximately 3,544,456 million British Thermal Units (“MMBtu”),¹⁵ The Program Administrators served approximately 304,541 participants through the 1-4 Family Homes, Affordable Multifamily, and Affordable New Construction initiatives, and reached approximately 1,340,354 participants through Customer Awareness, Outreach and Engagement initiatives.¹⁶

Table 1 and [Table 2](#) below, provide a summary of Portfolio-level progress in 2023 and towards 2020-2025 targets as detailed in the 2022 Implementation Plan and 2020 NE: NY Order.

Table 1: LMI Portfolio Progress – 2023 Achieved vs. 2022 Implementation Plan Projection

Metric	2023 Achieved	2022 Implementation Plan Projection	2023 Achieved to 2022 Implementation Plan Projection Variance
Total CEF Budget*	\$64,281,247	\$68,031,474	-\$3,750,227.39
Total Utility Electric Budget	9,231,905	\$13,960,459	-\$4,728,553.42
Total Utility Gas Budget	61,507,144	\$58,427,197	\$3,079,946.56
Total Combined Budget	135,020,296	\$140,419,130	-\$5,398,834.25
MWh Annual Savings	58,543	32,350	\$26,193.72
MMBtu Annual Savings	775,219	804,593	-\$29,373.55
<p>* NYSERDA currently manages and reports Administration, EM&V, and NYS Cost Recovery Fees at a broader Clean Energy Fund Market Development Portfolio (“CEF Market Development Portfolio” or “CEF”) level. To ensure that LMI spend expenditures and impact achievements can be assessed comprehensively, DPS has established the following LMI allocations for these costs: Administration + EM&V: 27%; Market Development Cost Recovery Fee: 26%. These allocations increase NYSERDA’s total 2020-2022 Achieved budget to \$287M and the total Implementation Plan Target to \$704M. ** Utility budgets include Administration and EM&V. Utility details can be found in Appendix A.</p>			

¹⁵ Throughout the body of this Annual Report, NYSERDA savings from fuels other than electric and gas are included in MMBtu savings calculations.

¹⁶ The Customer Awareness, Outreach and Engagement initiatives included measures such as energy efficiency kits and LED distribution at food banks. More detail regarding these programs and how metrics are calculated is provided in the sector-specific sections of this report.

Table 2: LMI Portfolio Progress – 2020-2023 Achieved vs. 2020-2023 Projection and Targets

Metric	2020 - 2023 Achieved	Implementation Plan Projection (Utilities 2020-2025; NYSERDA 2020-2030)	% Achieved to Implementation Plan Projection	NE: NY Targets (Ordered and from EE BE Report)	% Achieved to NE:NY Targets
Total CEF Budget*	\$320,850,840	\$650,119,857	49%	\$726,066,776	44%
Total Utility Electric Budget	31,802,695	\$70,951,130	45%	\$89,322,095	36%
Total Utility Gas Budget	141,504,102	\$282,327,892	50%	\$267,409,277	53%
Total Combined Budget	494,157,637	\$1,003,398,880	49%	\$1,082,798,148	46%
MWh Annual Savings	323,720	351,434	92%	511,436	63%
MMBtu Annual Savings	3,544,456	6,474,347	55%	11,301,743	31%
<p>* NYSERDA currently manages and reports Administration, EM&V, and NYS Cost Recovery Fees at a broader Clean Energy Fund Market Development Portfolio (“CEF Market Development Portfolio” or “CEF”) level. To ensure that LMI spend expenditures and impact achievements can be assessed comprehensively, DPS has established the following LMI allocations for these costs: Administration + EM&V: 27%; Market Development Cost Recovery Fee: 26%. These allocations increase NYSERDA's total 2020-2022 Achieved budget to \$287M and the total Implementation Plan Target to \$704M.</p> <p>** Utility budgets include Administration and EM&V. Utility details can be found in Appendix A.</p>					

Table 3, below, provides a brief description and key highlights and takeaways for each major segment of the Statewide LMI Portfolio, organized by Annual Report section.

Table 3: Key Highlights and Takeaways by Annual Report Section

Section Name	Key Highlights and Takeaways
1. Introduction	Continued implementation of Statewide LMI Portfolio for New York
2. Portfolio Administration and Progress	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reporting on status of Performance Metrics for 2023 • Portfolio administration, implementation and program updates
3. Stakeholder Engagement	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Over 250 attendees participated in two formal Portfolio webinar stakeholder input sessions; over 200 attendees participated in five Participating Contractor and Industry Partner (“PC&IP”) webinars for the Affordable Multifamily Energy Efficiency Program (“AMEEP”).
4. 1-4 Family Homes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Combined the EmPower and Assisted Home Performance Programs into the EmPower+ program. • Continued to implement electrification plans and planning for integration of administration of Inflation Reduction Act (“IRA”)” funding into EmPower +
5. Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Continued implementation of the Statewide multifamily program, AMEEP • Continued implementation of FlexTech • Continued partnership between NYSERDA and NYC Housing Preservation and Development (“NYC HPD”), integrating high-efficiency and electrification incentives into affordable housing preservation finance process. • Continued partnership between NYSERDA and New York State Homes and Community Renewal (“HCR”) to provide technical assistance and integrate high efficiency and electrification incentives for existing affordable multifamily projects within the financing application applications.
6. Affordable New Construction	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Continued transformative partnership with HCR to integrate technical assistance and high-efficiency and electrification incentives into affordable new construction finance applications
7. Pilots and Demonstrations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • NYSERDA piloted an LMI-focused marketplace concept through the Innovative Market Strategies
8. Beneficial Electrification in LMI Homes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Continued implementation of Heat Pump Adder Pilot for 1-4 family and multifamily LMI homes • Conducted market research and analysis to inform new heat pump deployment strategies in LMI market segment
9. Additional LMI Initiatives	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Continued the Healthy Homes Pilot
10. Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Continued to support the 13 Regional Clean Energy Hubs in ten economic development regions of the state to provide holistic, multi-disciplinary outreach services to ensure equitable access to the benefits of New York’s clean energy transition. • Each of the Utilities partnered with LMI organizations in their service territory in customized education efforts and distribution of free or discounted measures. • The Utilities, in coordination with NYSERDA, tested and implemented innovative approaches to customer awareness and engagement through leveraging Utility engagement channels
11. Evaluation, Measurement, and Verification	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Continued evaluation of the EmPower+ program, to be completed by end of 2024. • Initiated an RFP process for evaluation of AMEEP. • Completed evaluation of Con Edison’s Efficiency Starter program • Completed a Gross Savings Analysis of New Construction program impacts for 2017-2020

In the sections below, the Program Administrators describe their activities and results in 2023, including data on budgets, savings, and participants, both targeted and actual achievement. This data is provided at a Portfolio level. Data specific to each Program Administrator is provided in [Appendix A](#). The Program Administrators have established key objectives and associated performance metrics for the Statewide LMI Portfolio, described further in [Section 2.2](#).

2. Portfolio Administration and Progress

Effective and robust coordination among the Program Administrators is foundational to the success of the Statewide LMI Portfolio. The Program Administrators' activity in 2023 reflects their focus on this key objective. Central to this continuous improvement is the operation and effectiveness of the LMI Joint Management Committee ("LMI JMC"). Working through the LMI JMC, the Program Administrators coordinate and collaborate in delivering on the goals and outcomes of the Statewide LMI Portfolio framework and addressing complex coordination topics as part of the development and refinement of the Statewide LMI Portfolio.¹⁷ Areas of emphasis in the Portfolio's coordinated administration and progress include performance metrics and budgets and targets.

2.1. LMI Joint Management Committee

The LMI JMC provides a forum for the Program Administrators to jointly develop and coordinate new market offerings and assess and refine ongoing programmatic activity, per the Implementation Plan. The LMI JMC consists of representatives from each of the Utilities and NYSERDA, including a lead representative from each organization who serves as the point of contact for Committee-related communications and administrative matters. The DPS Staff provides an oversight and consultative role for the LMI JMC.

2.2 Statewide LMI Portfolio Performance Metrics

The Program Administrators measure the success of the Statewide LMI Portfolio in meeting objectives¹⁸ by tracking the Performance Metrics shown in [Table 4](#). The Performance Metrics provide a roadmap for future Portfolio evaluation, guiding the investigation of and informing the basis for measuring performance. The objectives and corresponding Performance Metrics will be reviewed on a periodic basis and updated as appropriate to reflect Portfolio maturity. The objectives in [Table 4](#) are not the only key objectives of this Portfolio but have been identified as those that should be tracked to report performance. The Program Administrators track and report the Performance Metrics related to savings and spending in [Table 4](#) quarterly through Scorecards posted on the Clean Energy Dashboard ("CED") (as well as in each Annual Report). The Program Administrators periodically survey stakeholders and customers to gauge their awareness of and satisfaction with the program offerings. The third column in this table, "Status," addresses the current ability and mechanism, as applicable, of the Program Administrators to assess each of the Performance Metrics.

¹⁷ See Footnote 23, below for additional discussion regarding the addressing of complex coordination topics.

¹⁸ NE: NY Proceeding, 2020 Implementation Plan, p. 7, 11-12. Key objectives for the Portfolio listed on p. 7 of the 2020 Implementation Plan are to: Achieve savings goals within budget; Increase the number of customers served annually; Encourage customer adoption of comprehensive efficiency projects; Encourage new affordable housing to adopt more energy efficient profiles; Increase LMI customer and affordable housing owner awareness of the Portfolio's energy efficiency programs and offerings; Achieve high customer satisfaction; Improve energy affordability for LMI customers; and Increase administrative efficiencies

Table 4: Portfolio Objectives and Performance Metrics

Portfolio Objective	Performance Metrics	Status
Portfolio Savings & Spend		
Achieve Portfolio-wide savings goals within budget	MWh annual and lifetime savings achievements	Reported via Clean Energy Dashboard and Annual Report
	MMBtu annual and lifetime savings achievements	Reported via Clean Energy Dashboard and Annual Report
	Budget spent	Reported via Clean Energy Dashboard and Annual Report
Portfolio Participation		
Increase the number of customers served annually	Number of participants ¹⁹ served	Reported via Clean Energy Dashboard, where applicable, and Annual Report
Adopt comprehensive ²⁰ efficiency projects	Energy savings acquired from comprehensive projects	Reported via Annual Report
Portfolio Customer Experience		
Increase customer Portfolio awareness	Percentage of LMI customers that learn about Portfolio initiatives from various sources (<i>e.g.</i> , NY Energy Advisor website, Utility or NYSERDA outreach materials, contractors, etc.)	Program Administrators, including EM&V teams, are currently discussing approaches for assessing, including survey instruments, to be coordinated with evaluation contractors
Achieve high customer satisfaction	Participation satisfaction rating	
Advance energy affordability for LMI customers	Participant bill savings, annual and lifetime	Reported via Clean Energy Dashboard and Annual Report

¹⁹ For the purposes of this Report, “participants” are defined as dwelling units served in statewide programs. Dwelling units that receive both electric and gas measures are counted in both the electric and gas categories in CED scorecards; participant counts are reflected identically in this Annual Report. Prior to the launch of AMEEP, the definition of participants depended on the Multifamily initiative type, and may have referred to households, multifamily buildings, tenants, and/or accounts.

²⁰ NE: NY Proceeding, Accelerated Efficiency Order, p. 36. The Accelerated Efficiency Order states “Comprehensive programs that combine lower cost-effective measures with higher cost-effective measures can optimize the total reduction that can be attained through a single customer transaction. Further, comprehensive building efficiency improvements often result in the installation of measures with longer effective useful lives (EUL), resulting in savings that persist well into the future.”

Portfolio Objective	Performance Metrics	Status
Portfolio Efficiencies		
Increase efficiencies of Portfolio investments ²¹	Cost and burden associated with all Portfolio investments	Reported via Annual Report comparing spend and unit costs (\$/MMBtu-e)

2.3 Budgets and Targets

During 2023, the Program Administrators collectively spent \$133.1 million, with estimated annual electric savings of approximately 58,543 MWh, and annual gas savings of approximately 775,219 MMBtu. Individual Program Administrator budgets and targets, as well as other metrics, are shown in [Appendix A](#). [Appendix A](#) also includes Program Administrator-specific information regarding 2020-2023 spending and savings performance as compared to targets and projections in the 2020 NE: NY Order and the 2022 Implementation Plan. For several Program Administrators, the 2023 savings achieved differ materially from those in the 2022 Implementation Plan and/or from those in the 2020 NE: NY Order, with a primary result being an increase in operating run rate. Program Administrator performance is also updated quarterly in Clean Energy Dashboard scorecards filed with DPS.²²

As noted in the 2022 Annual Report, the budgets and savings targets from the Accelerated Efficiency Order (issued December 2018) and the 2020 NE: NY Order (issued January 2020) were based on historic unit cost data. The historic run rates that informed the ordered budgets and targets are lower than the run rates Program Administrators are currently experiencing with the programs in market today. Therefore, some Program Administrators have included additional funding from non-LMI portfolios to achieve savings targets. Additional funding is identified in the 2022 Implementation Plan, page 105.

The following section summarizes key trends, which are discussed in detail in [Appendix A](#):

Targets

- Achievement of electric Utility Program Administrator targets for 2023 varied from overachievement for several utilities, to alignment for several utilities, to underachievement relative to 2022 Implementation Plan targets.
- Achievement of gas Utility Program Administrator targets for 2023 varied from overachievement, to alignment, to underachievement for several utilities relative to 2022 Implementation Plan targets.
- NYSERDA’s funding is fuel neutral and aligns with the 2020 NE: NY Order and 2022 Implementation Plan budgets.

Budgets:

²¹ Such efficiencies are described in [Section 2.3](#), and may apply to categories including, but not limited to, administration, implementation, marketing, incentives, and EM&V.

²² <https://documents.dps.ny.gov/public/MatterManagement/CaseMaster.aspx?MatterCaseNo=18-M-0084>;
<https://documents.dps.ny.gov/public/MatterManagement/CaseMaster.aspx?MatterCaseNo=14-m-0094>

- Spending of electric and gas Utility Program Administrators was generally in alignment with or less than 2022 Implementation Plan budget, with limited cases of spending above 2022 Implementation Plan budget.
- Utilities shifted funds or plan to shift funds between years to optimize Portfolio performance; some plan to use additional 2023 budgets in future years while others spent future year funding in 2023 to meet demand.

The Program Administrators specifically address instances in which there is substantial variance between portfolio targets as identified in the 2022 Implementation Plan and actual 2023 achievement in [Appendix A](#). Specifically, each Program Administrator provides a narrative description explaining this variance alongside its Program Administrator-specific [Appendix A](#) tables, including the factors that may have caused variance from projected performance, and any actions taken or planned in response.

The Program Administrators remain committed to achieving cost efficiencies to reduce overall costs. Cost efficiencies identified and achieved and/or continuing to be pursued beyond 2023 by the Program Administrators include the following, which are noted in detail throughout this Report:

- Further improving the referrals, lead generation, and customer access for the 1-4 Family LMI Homes sector;
- Formalizing processes and documents for multifamily implementation contractors (“Implementation Contractors”) to be largely consistent statewide and simplified for regions with overlap;
- Collaboration among Program Administrators on a single NY Energy Advisor site and a statewide marketing campaign;
- Collaborating on, sharing, and applying best practices from regional customer awareness and outreach efforts in overlapping and neighboring utilities (e.g., NYSEG and National Grid working together on a direct-to-customer lighting program); and
- Combining and streamlining the EmPower and AHP programs into one new program, EmPower+, that began serving the 1-4 Family LMI sector in 2023, which seeks to streamline customer and contractor experiences and increase operational efficiencies.

2.4 Data Sharing Between the Program Administrators²³

The efficient sharing of data between the Utilities and NYSERDA is an important component of achieving the goals and objectives described in the Implementation Plan. Such sharing must, however, balance the

²³ In prior Statewide LMI Implementation Plans, Annual Reports, and a 2020 Coordination Plan filing, the Program Administrators noted several complex coordination and administration elements that needed to be addressed in the development and implementation of the Portfolio, which were referred to as “Coordination Points.” The Program Administrators filed a Statewide Low- to Moderate-Income Joint Management Committee Coordination Plan (“Coordination Plan”) on November 13, 2020, which detailed progress on and plans for addressing these Coordination Points; the Program Administrators provided additional updates on the topics in the 2020, 2021, 2022 Annual Reports. NE: NY Proceeding, “Statewide Low- to Moderate-Income Joint Management Committee Coordination Plan” (Filed November 13, 2020). NE: NY Proceeding, 2020 Annual Report (filed April 1, 2021), pp. 6-8; 2021 Annual Report (filed April 1, 2022), pp., 12-16. Two of the topics, marketing and EM&V, are now addressed in Sections 10 and 11 of this Annual Report, respectively. Topics related to implementation contractor

improved customer experience and streamlined administration of programs with the need for diligence in rules, processes, and systems that protect customer privacy and security, consistent with Commission and Program Administrator policies, laws, and regulations. The Program Administrators developed the following approach:

- Identify the data sharing needs for the Portfolio to streamline customer access to all eligible programs and minimize administrative friction;
- Develop a comprehensive understanding of the existing data sharing framework in place;
- Determine whether any gaps exist between data needs for the Portfolio and the existing data sharing framework; and
- Identify and implement solutions to address any gaps that are identified.

The Portfolio reflects numerous instances of progress on data sharing in 2023, including in EmPower+ and AMEEP, which are reflected in Sections 4.1 and 5.1. Of particular importance, in the EE/BE Proposal Order, the Program Administrators were directed to develop consistent consent language across programs and to enable ongoing sharing of customer data amongst Program Administrators.²⁴ The consistent consent language enables a customer to provide their attestation to allow the sharing of data among Program Administrators.²⁵ As the Portfolio evolves, the Program Administrators will continue to assess data sharing needs, including identifying any additional high-impact data-sharing use cases to prioritize in 2024 and beyond.

2.5 Implementation Contractor Models and Procurement

The Program Administrators recognize the central function of Implementation Contractors in the Portfolio, noting that a more integrated set of initiatives between the Utilities and NYSERDA provides the potential to assess the role of Implementation Contractors to achieve economies of scale and reduce overall administrative costs within the Statewide LMI Portfolio.²⁶

For 1-4 Family Homes programs, a single Implementation Contractor model is used to deliver the EmPower+ program Statewide. NYSERDA administers the EmPower+ program for most of the state, including municipal territories, where supplemental energy efficiency incentive funding is provided through the RGGI Annual Operating Plan,²⁷ with implementation support provided by a third-party Implementation Contractor. In areas of the state where electric service is not provided by one of the Utilities, close coordination is occurring between the relevant electric providers (*i.e.*, on Long Island, and between NYSERDA and National Grid for the Home Energy Affordability Team (“HEAT”) Program).

(“Implementation Contractor”) procurement and statewide application are reflected in applicable Sections 4.1 Existing 1-4 Family Homes and Section 5.1 Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings. The topics of Data Sharing Among the Program Administrators and Implementation Contractor Models and Procurement are addressed as Sections 2.4 and 2.5, respectively, of this Report.

²⁴ NE: NY Proceeding and CEF Proceeding, EE/ BE Proposal Order, p. 98.

²⁵ NE: NY Proceeding and CEF Proceeding, “Standard Customer Consent Language,” (September 5, 2023)

²⁶ NE: NY Proceeding and CEF Proceeding, Statewide Low- to Moderate-Income Joint Management Committee Coordination Plan (filed November 13, 2020). The Coordination Plan identified and discussed a range of possible topics and solutions, including contracting timelines, Implementation Contractor functions, cost issues, and streamlining of different Implementation Contractor models among Program Administrators.

²⁷ RGGI Meeting and Planning Documents website <https://www.nyserda.ny.gov/Researchers-and-Policymakers/Regional-Greenhouse-Gas-Initiative/Useful-Documents>

Based on an assessment of alternative Implementation Contractor structures, the Program Administrators use two Implementation Contractors for AMEEP, one covering Con Edison, Central Hudson, Orange & Rockland and National Grid’s KEDLI and KEDNY service territories, and one covering, NYSEG, RG&E, and National Grid’s NMPC service territory.²⁸

The LMI JMC will continue to collaborate with Staff and assess opportunities for optimal Implementation Contractor structures.

3. Stakeholder Engagement

3.1 Summary of Stakeholder Engagement Activity

The Program Administrators view engagement with stakeholders as core to the design, implementation, refinement, and overall success of the Portfolio.²⁹ This priority was reflected in 2023 through numerous stakeholder engagement efforts. Stakeholder input provides the foundation for and continues to inform much of what follows in the initiative summaries in Sections 4-11.

3.2 LMI Portfolio Stakeholder Engagement Sessions

The Program Administrators conducted statewide stakeholder engagement sessions on June 22 and November 9, 2023.³⁰ Each session was held virtually, with 140 and 116 individuals attending each webinar, respectively.

Before each session, the Program Administrators posted meeting announcements on the DPS Document and Matter Management website (“DMM”),³¹ and on NYSEDA’s LMI Stakeholder Resources webpage.³² In addition, email invitations soliciting stakeholders to submit questions to LMIForum@nyserda.ny.gov were also sent to a broad distribution list of potential attendees. The invitations included the agenda so that potential attendees would know what would be addressed in each session.

The Program Administrators presented a wide range of topics during these two stakeholder engagement sessions, providing stakeholders with both general background and specific details, as appropriate. Topics included:

- high-level performance updates for the Portfolio, including 1-4 Family, Multifamily, and New Construction initiatives;
- updates on the 1-4 Family initiatives including the launch of EmPower+, results and next step from surveys on outreach and awareness, innovative outreach and marketing campaigns (e.g., social media and text messaging), and a utility moderate-income pilot;

²⁸ See, NE: NY Proceeding, Statewide Low- to Moderate-Income Portfolio 2021 Annual Report (“2021 Annual Report”) (filed April 1, 2022), p. 15, which describes the assessment process the Program Administrators used in selecting this Implementation Contractor structure.

²⁹ NE: NY Proceeding, 2022 Implementation Plan, p. 11.

³⁰ The 2020 NE: NY Order requires the Program Administrators to conduct two stakeholder engagement sessions annually, which are described herein. NE: NY Proceeding, 2020 NE: NY Order, p. 101.

³¹ NE: NY Proceeding, Notice Announcing Statewide LMI Stakeholder Webinar, (filed May 12, 2023 and October 10, 2023, respectively).

³² <https://www.nyserda.ny.gov/All-Programs/Low-to-moderate-Income-Programs/LMI-Stakeholder-Resources-New-Efficiency-New-York>

- updates on Multifamily initiatives, including an AMEEP stakeholder roundtable, an AMEEP case study, and utility specific initiatives and community partnerships;
- NYSERDA’s partnerships with affordable housing agencies;
- Forward-looking planning in light of state budget and IRA funding.

The Program Administrators organized these stakeholder sessions to encourage engagement and feedback from attendees. At both sessions, stakeholders had the opportunity to ask questions and provide comments, during and following the presentations. This provided insights to the presenters regarding areas of interest, attention, or clarification in “real time.” The range of interest in all aspects of the Portfolio was evident in the breadth of the questions and comments raised. Those questions, comments, and responses are found in the summary reports of each session,³³ which the Program Administrators posted following each session, along with meeting slides.³⁴ The Stakeholder Sessions also included a survey that provided the Program Administrators with information regarding the Portfolio and the stakeholder engagement session, as is described in the report for that session.

3.3 AMEEP Participating Contractor and Industry Partner Webinars

In addition, the Program Administrators engaged with stakeholders throughout 2023 regarding the operation of AMEEP by continuing AMEEP Participating Contractor and Industry Partners (PC&IP) webinars. These webinars address changes to the AMEEP program documents, provide education regarding program elements, and solicit input and discussion on the program. The following table provides additional data on the 2023 AMEEP PC&IP webinars.

Table 5: AMEEP PC&IP Webinar Information

Event	Date	Participants
AMEEP PC&IP Webinar Session 6	March 24, 2023	55
AMEEP PC&IP Webinar Session 7	June 28, 2023	55
AMEEP PC&IP Webinar Session 8	September 20, 2023	52
AMEEP PC&IP Webinar Session 9	December 13, 2023	49

3.4 Continuous Stakeholder Input and Integration

At LMI JMC meetings and applicable working groups, the Program Administrators regularly share, discuss, and integrate stakeholder input. One example of this was an AMEEP Roundtable Discussion hosted by the AMEEP Program Administrators in August 2023, which included 40 total participants. In this virtual Roundtable Discussion, experts and key stakeholders in New York State’s affordable multifamily energy efficiency space shared insights about program design and processes. The discussion focused primarily on the AMEEP Comprehensive Pathway and covered topics such as incentives, audits, and customer experience. Attendees were also asked to identify any areas for operational improvement. The Program

³³ NE: NY Proceeding, Statewide Low- to Moderate-Income Portfolio Stakeholder Webinar June 22, 2023 - Summary Report, (filed August 8, 2023); Statewide Low- to Moderate-Income Portfolio Stakeholder Webinar, November 9, 2022 - Summary Report (filed March 20, 2024).

³⁴ <https://www.nyserra.ny.gov/All-Programs/Low-to-moderate-Income-Programs/LMI-Stakeholder-Resources-New-Efficiency-New-York>

Administrators collected useful feedback from the event and plan to host similar discussions in 2024 and 2025 to continue to collect feedback from key AMEEP.

Further, the Program Administrators are regularly engaging with stakeholders through the administration of current programs. Feedback received during such engagement is raised and discussed at the LMI JMC and/or appropriate working groups.

4. 1-4 Family Homes

4.1 Program Summary

In 2023 the EmPower+,³⁵ and HEATSM programs were administered, providing energy efficiency services to LMI households in 1-4 Family homes.³⁶ The Program Administrators expended approximately \$45 million on 1-4 Family homes initiatives in 2023, serving over 9,897 households and achieving over 2,348 annual MWh savings and over 119,822 annual MMBtu savings. The HEAT program underachieved compared to the 2022 Implementation Plan projections for energy savings and overachieved projections for households served.

4.1.1 EmPower +

In July 2023, the EmPower NY program was combined with the Assisted Home Performance program; for purposes of this report EmPower+ will be used to speak about the programs for the entire year.

EmPower+ provides no-cost energy efficiency services to low-income households in all of New York except for Long Island with funding through the CEF, the 2020 NE: NY Order, RGGI, New York State appropriation funding, and the Office for Temporary and Disability Assistance (“OTDA”). The Low-Income tier of EmPower+ provides incentives of up to \$10,000 for home energy upgrades for customers with income below 60% State Median Income (“SMI”). The Moderate-Income tier provides incentives of up to \$5,000 with a 50% customer match required for customers with income between 60 and 80% SMI or Area Median Income (“AMI”). The below table outlines the numerical data of the EmPower+ program.

³⁵ Through the end of 2020, NFGDC’s low-income energy efficiency program was called the Low income usage reduction program (“LIURP”). As of January 1, 2021, NFGDC’s program has become the EmPower+ program, consistent with the other New York utilities.

³⁶ Eligibility for the LMI programs is set as follows: households with annual income below 60% of the State Median Income (“SMI”) meet the low-income threshold; while households with annual incomes over 60% of SMI up to 80% of the Area Median Income (“AMI”) or SMI, whichever is greater, meet the moderate-income threshold.

Table 6: 1-4 Family 2023 Performance³⁷

Metric	2023 Achieved CEF	2023 Achieved NE: NY
Total Funded Incentives	\$15,998,091	\$16,908,400
MWh Annual Savings	1,225	1,123
MMBtu Annual Savings	61,975	57,848
Participants	4,115	5,782

To support awareness of and participation in EmPower+, the Utilities, in coordination with NYSERDA, continued to pursue in 2023 innovative outreach efforts, implemented consistently across Utilities or individually by utility, and complemented by sharing lessons learned and best practices. These initiatives included various awareness, community outreach and education strategies to increase customer participation and further enhance referral screenings. These included, for example: (1) enhanced electronic education and outreach through text messaging and social media campaigns; (2) customer and contractor surveys to gain feedback and insight regarding successful features and potential improvements³⁸; and (3) “profile analysis” of referral customers to help identify success and potential areas of additional focus and improvement. As described further in 4.4, below, the Program Administrators have begun to take steps to address the learnings from such efforts and will continue to do so in 2024.

In July 2023 the program finalized the years long process of combining the EmPower and Assisted Home Performance Programs. Starting with the launch of the Combined Application³⁹ in 2021 and continuing with the program alignment changes in 2022, the program teams have worked with stakeholders including contractors, community groups, and utilities to streamline the two programs and align them into a unified program which delivers a consistent customer experience for both low-income and moderate-income households. The program consolidation process also coincided with the implementation of the New York Home Energy Portal (“NYHEP”), NYSERDA’s new single family project portal. NYHEP functions as a total program administrator source with functions including contractor project assignment, work scope submittal and review, energy savings calculations, document and data storage, and final project submittal and review.

New York is one of the first four states in the nation to submit partial-scope applications for residential rebates as authorized under the Inflation Reduction Act. On December 28, 2023, NYSERDA submitted its partial-scope application to the Department of Energy (DOE) for the first phase of deployment of the IRA Home Energy Rebate programs funding. In this initial phase, NYSERDA has proposed to introduce the IRA

³⁷ Data provided in this table is consistent with CED scorecard data for each Program Administrator. For the purposes of this Report, “participants” are defined as dwelling units served in statewide programs. Dwelling units that receive both electric and gas measures are counted in both the electric and gas categories in CED scorecards; participant counts are reflected identically in this Annual Report.

³⁸ The Utilities sent the survey to approximately 24,000 recipients, i.e., primarily customers who had been referred to NYSERDA for EmPower+, some of whom had participated in EmPower+ and some who had not. Related surveys were also sent to participating EmPower+ contractors. All three surveys provided important information and insights, as is summarized in the November 22, 2023 LMI Portfolio Webinar Presentation. NE: NY Proceeding and CEF Proceeding, LMI Stakeholder Webinar Presentation and Stakeholder Summary Report (filed: March 20, 2024).

³⁹ See: <https://www.nyserdera.ny.gov/All-Programs/EmPower-New-York-Program/EmPower-Application>

Home Electrification and Appliance Rebates (“HEAR”) in combination with the existing EmPower+ program serving low- and moderate-income homeowners. HEAR funding is available to customers with income less than 80% Area Median Income (AMI) through the EmPower+ program. NYSERDA is excited to pursue this critical federal funding and looks forward to expanding our home energy programs based on valuable, stakeholder feedback so that qualified New York State residents’ benefit equitably. The submitted application is currently being reviewed by the DOE and is pending approval. In addition, NYSERDA will submit the second part of the application on program implementation in the near future. Once NYSERDA’s applications are approved, the Inflation Reduction Act residential rebates will become available to eligible New York State residents.

In 2023 NYSERDA also received \$27.9 million in Home Energy Assistant Program (“HEAP”) funding from Office of Temporary and Disability Assistance (“OTDA”) to further the assistance of energy-burdened families with weatherizing their homes. This money will be used on projects through 2023 and 2024. Additional OTDA funding is expected in early 2024. Funding from OTDA goes directly to homeowners who have participated in the HEAP energy assistance program during the funding program year.

In March 2023, the EmPower+ program was awarded \$200M through legislation as part of the NYS budget proceedings.

4.1.2 Home Energy Affordability TeamSM (HEATSM)

In 2023 National Grid administered the EmPower Replacement Program in the counties of Nassau, Suffolk and Far Rockaway – Queens. The program is marketed under the brand name “Home Energy Affordability TeamSM” (HEATSM) program. It was designed to align with the legacy EmPower NY program. The HEAT program provides services to income qualified gas customers such as home energy assessments, health and safety reviews, and the installation of energy efficient measures which may reduce consumption and comfort.

In 2022, the HEATSM program launched a pilot designed to offer services and incentives to moderate-income qualified customers. The incentives are provided on a sliding scale based on income. Income is determined based on the utility bill account holder, and the incentives are as follows:

- Tier 1: 75% work scope covered for customers at 61-70% AMI
- Tier 2: 50% work scope covered for customers at 71-80% AMI
- Tier 3: 25% work scope covered for customers at 81-99% AMI

Calendar year 2022 saw a lower percentage of moderate-income customers in the program than hoped for these pilot incentive levels. Participation from moderate-income customers in HEAT in 2022 was primarily from customers who previously did not meet the guidelines for low-income. This data was not statistically significant enough to provide a meaningful analysis. Therefore, the program decided to continue collecting data for another calendar year, while promoting the incentive tiers, to analyze the effectiveness of this incentive structure.

In 2023, National Grid, through their Implementing Contractor, provided energy efficiency services to over 525 households, providing the installation of energy efficient measures and the mitigation of identified health and safety for completed work scopes. These completed work scopes delivered an estimated savings of 20,201 MMBtus. Out of the 525 total audits completed in 2023, 46% or 243 were moderate-income customers. Participation by income tier are as follows:

- Tier 1: 169 participants
- Tier 2: 22 participants
- Tier 3: 52 participants

4.2 Program Implementation Milestones

Progress on the implementation milestones identified in the 2022 Implementation Plan include the information in the following table.

2023 Milestone from the 2022 Implementation Plan ⁴⁰	Status
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Launch the combined, streamlined LMI program- EmPower+ 	Complete
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increase DAC access to EmPower+ by incorporating DAC geographic eligibility and coordinating with regional Clean Energy Hubs on targeted outreach to DACs 	Complete Geo-eligibility is being phased out of program use to meet rules for IRA funding set by the DOE. The program continues to work with the Hubs to increase access to EmPower+ and assist customers with other household needs.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Integrate EmPower+ and NYS Clean Heat offerings to increase access to incentives for electrification 	In Progress EmPower+ and Clean Heat funds are currently layered by contractors participating in both programs. Full integration is expected in CEF 2.0
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Pursue opportunities to obtain and incorporate funding from the Inflation Reduction Act into LMI programs 	Complete Inflation Reduction Act funding will be integrated into the EmPower+ program in 2024.

4.3 Budgets, Targets, and Metrics

The budgets, targets, and metrics below reflect program spend for the 1-4 Family Homes portfolio.

Metric	2023 Achieved	2022 Implementation Plan Projection	2023 Achieved to 2022 Implementation Plan Projection Variance	2020 - 2023 Achieved	Implementation Plan Projection (Utilities 2020-2025; NYSDA 2020-2030)	% Achieved 2020-2023 to Implementation Plan Projection
Total Budget Spend	\$44,773,865	\$42,115,424	\$2,658,441	\$270,604,905	\$280,983,930	96%
MWh Annual	2,348	2,729	(381)	15,198	21,066	72%
MWh Lifetime	36,480	43,174	(6,694)	221,165	327,325	68%
MMBtu Annual	119,822	138,617	(18,794)	813,719	1,093,310	74%
MMBtu Lifetime	2,710,858	3,127,224	(416,366)	19,473,572	25,659,531	76%
Participants	9,897	9,278	619	61,457	75,022	82%
Leveraged Funds	\$2,827,480	\$6,811,402	-\$3,983,922	\$58,619,863	\$69,128,145	85%

4.4 Findings & Planned Improvements

In July 2023, NYSDA combined the AHP and Empower programs into EmPower+ with a new program portal, NYHEP, serving both moderate- and low-income customers as well as the Residential Energy Assessment program. In 2024, NYHEP will also serve the Comfort Home program, create a single portal for all of NYSDA’s single family programs.

⁴⁰ Milestones identified throughout this Annual Report are from the 2022 Implementation Plan filing.

In 2024, The IRA rebates will provide critical funding to help fill gaps in existing energy efficiency program funding and to overcome barriers such as making necessary electrical upgrades, making comprehensive electrification projects more available and affordable for New York residents. NYSERDA is working toward a goal of making the initial phase of Home Electrification and Appliance Rebates (HEAR) available to homeowners in the summer of 2024 with additional HEAR and Home Energy Rebates (HER) to become available in subsequent phases.

As described above, the moderate-income pilot from the HEAT program reached one full calendar year in the market. Participation in Tier 1 during this period demonstrates that moderate-income customers falling just above the low-income threshold require a higher percentage of project costs covered than the statewide standard of 50% project costs covered. Participation in Tier 3 during this period demonstrates that customers falling above 80% AMI yet at or below 99% AMI still require support for energy efficiency upgrades. The results of this data collection period was positive and the program intends to continue this moderate-income incentive tier structure through the foreseeable life of the program. Data from this pilot will be used to inform recommendations for the transition of this program to NYSERDA in 2026.⁴¹

As described above, the Utilities, in coordination with NYSERDA, undertook numerous initiatives in 2023 to test and implement various awareness, community outreach and education strategies to increase customer participation and further enhance referral screenings. As noted, these included: (1) enhanced electronic education and outreach through text messaging and social media campaigns; (2) customer and contractor surveys to gain feedback and insight regarding successful features and potential improvements; and (3) analysis of referral customers to identify potential areas of subsequent focus and improvement. In 2024 the Program Administrators are continuing to build on the successes and learnings of these initiatives. Potential opportunities for improvement through action include: enhancing Utility and NYSERDA Clean Energy Hub coordination; connecting with landlords and DACs based on 2023 data and findings to encourage participation; enhancing messaging to all energy assistance program (“EAP”) participants as part of enrollment process (NYSEG/RGE); utility specific (reminder) emails to referrals outside of the EAP process; researching potential for “word of mouth” peer referral incentives; other messaging strategies. Additional improvements to the referral database logic will help streamline electronic customer outreach and utility referral management.

5. Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings

5.1 Program Summary

Affordable multifamily housing is a key component of the Statewide LMI Portfolio, as a large proportion of LMI customers in New York State live in multifamily buildings. Improving the performance and sustainability of affordable multifamily housing will benefit disadvantaged communities, as required by the Climate Act. As directed in the 2020 NE: NY Order, at least 40% of the portfolio’s incremental energy efficiency funds must be directed to affordable multifamily initiatives through 2025.⁴² In 2023, the

⁴¹ NE: NY Proceeding and CEF Proceeding, EE/BE Proposals Order, p. 55.

⁴² NE: NY Proceeding, 2020 NE: NY Order, p. 93. Collectively for all Program Administrators, as is noted in the 2022 Implementation Plan, 52% of total Portfolio budgets and 67% of total incremental energy efficiency budgets were allocated to the affordable multifamily market segment. In 2023, approximately 55% of total Portfolio funding and 67% of NE: NY LMI Ordered Funds for 2023 went to multifamily initiatives. The Program Administrators will manage budgets such that at least 40% of incremental funding is directed to affordable multifamily initiatives over the course of 2020-2025, as directed by the 2020 NE: NY Order.

Program Administrators expended approximately \$57 million on Existing Affordable Multifamily Building projects, serving over 134,000 dwelling units and achieving approximately 15,406 annual MWh savings and 534,522 annual MMBtu gas savings.

The sections below describe the affordable multifamily programs in-market during 2023. These initiatives and programs reflect the objectives identified for this segment, which include addressing cost barriers experienced by owners of existing affordable multifamily buildings, increasing awareness of energy efficiency among tenants and building owners, providing a simplified experience to navigate offerings, and addressing the barrier of split incentives between owner and tenant.⁴³

5.1.1 Affordable Multifamily Energy Efficiency Program (AMEEP)

AMEEP is the statewide LMI multifamily program designed and managed collaboratively by the Program Administrators, offering incentives for the installation of energy-efficient equipment and technology in existing affordable multifamily housing. A cornerstone of the Statewide LMI Portfolio, AMEEP provides a consistent framework across the state whereby all existing affordable multifamily building owners, developers, and their representatives have access to enhanced financial incentives for energy efficiency upgrades. AMEEP includes a technical assistance offering, which helps building owners inform capital planning to achieve greater energy efficiency savings. AMEEP's design reflects the key portfolio objectives of helping affordable multifamily buildings reduce energy use and costs, increasing operating efficiency and tenant comfort, and contributing to the State's carbon reduction and climate goals. The Program Administrators began accepting applications through AMEEP in November 2021, and 2023 marks the program's second full year in-market. In 2023, the Program Administrators expended approximately \$43 million on projects through AMEEP, serving over 113,700 dwelling units and achieving 9,741 annual MWh savings and 391,634 annual MMBtu gas savings.

AMEEP Overview and 2023 Updates

The core focus of AMEEP is to maximize energy savings and lower costs to tenants and owners of affordable multifamily buildings by encouraging comprehensive building upgrades while providing project flexibility. AMEEP includes two program pathways: (1) a "Comprehensive Pathway," which encourages whole-building energy retrofits via a measure "points" system; and (2) a "Non-Comprehensive Pathway" for customers who are interested in smaller, measure-level upgrades. Utilities fund the measure installation incentives for AMEEP and serve as the main point of contact for customers applying to the program.

AMEEP also offers streamlined, uniform application materials for the Comprehensive and Non-Comprehensive Pathways to simplify participation for program applicants across the state. The materials include a single "Program Manual," customer application, contractor application, contractor agreement letter, and incentive fact sheet.⁴⁴ Since program launch in late 2021, updates have been made to program documents on a quarterly basis to clarify program requirements and processes, streamline customer journey, and adjust incentives, as needed. In 2023, the Program Administrators updated program documentation to add and adjust incentives, modify Comprehensive Pathway measure points, and align with the most recently released FlexTech PON.

⁴³ NE: NY Proceeding, 2020 Implementation Plan, p. 26.

⁴⁴ <https://www.nyserda.ny.gov/All-Programs/Low-to-moderate-Income-Programs/LMI-Stakeholder-Resources-New-Efficiency-New-York/NYS-Affordable-Multifamily-Energy-Efficiency-Program>

Before publishing updates to program documents each quarter, the Program Administrators hold a PC&IP webinar to describe the planned changes and gather feedback or questions from contractors and other industry partners. In 2023, the Program Administrators held four PC&IP webinars with approximately 200 total participants, as seen in [Table 5](#) above. Topics for 2023 webinars included Program Manual changes, technical assistance updates, training on new downstate offerings and tools, frequently asked questions, and more. The PC&IP webinars are valuable forums for communicating with stakeholders and are expected to continue into 2024.

In 2023, the Program Administrators also conducted the first AMEEP “Roundtable Discussion,” as discussed in Section 3.4, above.

In 2023, as in prior years, the Program Administrators met weekly to align program administration across service territories and develop collaboration opportunities. Throughout the year, the Program Administrators worked together to develop 2023 program milestones, streamline technical assistance for AMEEP Comprehensive projects, and assess statewide program performance. Additionally, the Program Administrators often met as a group with the program Implementation Contractors to develop and discuss Program Manual updates. In 2024, the Program Administrators will continue to explore opportunities for enhancing program performance.

5.1.1.1 Con Edison Initiatives and Community Partnerships

Con Edison continues to operate existing standalone multifamily initiatives and coordinates with NYC HPD and NYCHA, to identify areas of improvement. Con Edison has continued to solidify partnerships with community-based organizations.

AMEEP Eligibility Screener

Con Edison launched an Eligibility Screener initiative in 2022 to fast-track AMEEP customer eligibility by eliminating the need for affordable housing documentation for non-comprehensive electric projects.⁴⁵ Con Edison developed an online screener tool that identifies whether a multifamily building is affordable housing based on customer address or Con Edison account number. If the building qualifies as affordable housing, the customer can download a pre-approval letter and submit it as part of their AMEEP application package in lieu of regulatory agreement, public subsidy, or rent roll documentation. In 2023, LMI eligibility pre-approval letters were used in the majority of non-comprehensive electric projects.

Electric Geotargeting Initiative

In 2021, Con Edison conducted an electric geotargeting initiative that layered publicly available demographic data, multifamily records, and stakeholder feedback. This helped identify location-specific opportunities to engage eligible customers. That year, Bronx Community District 4 was selected to test these methods of determining affordability eligibility other than supporting documentation. The goal was to understand the degree to which the removal of this step in the application process would increase AMEEP program participation. 119 projects were completed in 2021, compared to 10 in 2020, showing a significant increase. Con Edison distributed a participant survey in 2022 to audit the initiative’s performance and understand the affordability status of participating buildings. In 2023, only two projects

⁴⁵ <https://www.coned.com/en/save-money/rebates-incentives-tax-credits/rebates-incentives-for-multifamily-customers/affordable-buildings/eligibility-screener>

were in the geotargeting pipeline. Expanded outreach and marketing efforts will be explored to boost awareness and increase participation.

NYC HPD

Con Edison has an initiative in partnership with NYC HPD and New York City Accelerator to help buildings identify and install the prescriptive energy conservation measures required by LL97 Article 321. Con Edison and NYC HPD co-developed the prescriptive measure package for NYC HPD asset managed buildings between 25,000 – 75,000 square feet. Con Edison provides incentives on a dollar-per-dwelling unit basis based on the building’s vintage. NYC Accelerator leads outreach efforts for this initiative by engaging directly with building owners. Participation in the program has been limited thus far. Con Edison plans to examine barriers to participation and further develop the program to increase project enrollment.

Relatedly, Con Edison continued its partnership with NYC HPD and NYSERDA on the Retrofit Electrification Pilot, which aims to reduce barriers to electrification adoption in existing affordable multifamily buildings by increasing retrofit opportunities in the NYC HPD Preservation pipeline. Con Edison provides project scope support, electrical service upgrade coordination with internal departments, and will coordinate program incentives to fill funding gaps for these projects.

NYCHA

Con Edison continues to meet regularly with NYCHA to provide additional AMEEP project support and worked with NYCHA to acquire seven projects in 2023.

Community Based Partnerships

From 2021 through 2023, Con Edison partnered with a community-based organization in NYC, UHAB, to drive customer participation in AMEEP and for Con Edison and UHAB to promote, jointly, the benefits of energy efficiency with LMI customers. UHAB is an organization that works with and advocates for cooperative buildings incorporated as Housing Development Fund Corporations (HDFCs) that own properties and provide affordable housing to low- and moderate-income families. In 2023, Con Edison finalized an agreement with UHAB through 2024 to continue the partnership to drive customer participation and collaborate on a few strategic initiatives.

Additionally, Con Edison works on AMEEP with Kinetic Communities Consulting (“KC³”), a women- and minority-owned business and certified social enterprise Benefit Corporation. KC³ supports Con Edison by facilitating complementary AMEEP referral partnership opportunities with UHAB and the Association of Neighborhood and Housing Development (“ANHD”), a coalition of community-based groups across New York City. In 2023, the referrals made by KC³, ANHD, and UHAB accounted for over 90 AMEEP completed projects.

5.1.2 Technical Assistance for Affordable Multifamily Buildings

Technical assistance helps building owners inform capital planning to achieve greater energy efficiency savings and simultaneously maximize program incentive opportunities. The FlexTech program partners with housing agencies and the Utilities to streamline the FlexTech program process with the AMEEP and Integrated Physical Needs Assessments (“IPNA”) programs. In 2023, NYSERDA continued to offer technical assistance for affordable multifamily buildings via the FlexTech program. An information sheet was created for customers participating in the IPNA and AMEEP programs to highlight opportunities for overlap with the FlexTech process. FlexTech ensures that FlexTech reports are comprehensive reports

that are useful to the customer for current and future planning needs. In November 2019, the NYSERDA Flexible Technical Assistance Program (FlexTech) extended its services to multifamily buildings in PON4192, and funding was approved in the Statewide LMI Portfolio Implementation Plan in September 2020. Technical assistance helps building owners plan projects to achieve greater energy efficiency savings and simultaneously maximize program incentive opportunities.

In June 2021, the Low Carbon Capital Planning Support program (“LCCP”) was launched as a primary service of FlexTech for multifamily buildings. LCCP follows the FlexTech delivery model, but the projects must also include an assessment of electrification or electrification-ready measures.

In February 2022, FlexTech updated its PON4192 which adjusted the eligibility of multifamily buildings for the different FlexTech services. This PON update prepared guidelines to receive affordable housing verification documentation through a Seamless application.⁴⁶ This Seamless application has streamlined the process for verifying housing as affordable and facilitated affordable housing participation in LCCP and other FlexTech services.

In November 2023, the FlexTech program, PON 4192 was modified to reflect several updates in the Multifamily sector. The PON was updated to consolidate the Multifamily and Low Carbon Capital Planning offerings into a single pathway for Multifamily customers under FlexTech. These updates included flexibility around applicant eligibility allowing a customer, FlexTech consultant, or Independent Service Provider to be the Applicant. The Applicant is the party that is reimbursed directly by NYSERDA for the study cost share. Customers can work with a provider of their choice, a FlexTech consultant or Independent Service Provider, for all study types. The revised program offering includes updated cost share cap amounts based on affordability status of the building. Affordable buildings are eligible for up to a 75% cost share and market rate buildings are eligible for up to a 50% cost share regardless of study type. There is also limited funding available for affordable projects that do not pay into the electric System Benefits Charge (SBC). In 2023, there were 101 affordable applications received and 36 existing affordable projects completed a FlexTech study.

5.1.3 Multifamily Performance Program (MPP)

MPP closed to new applications on February 4, 2022, due to the launch of AMEEP. MPP projects may transfer to AMEEP provided they did not receive incentives from NYSERDA. As a result, approximately 21 MPP projects have already transferred to AMEEP as of the end of 2023. On June 30th 2023, MPP reached its deadline for “stage 1 – Workslope development” approvals. As a result, 4 projects were cancelled. NYSERDA continues to support the remaining 54 active projects.

In December 2020, NYSERDA launched the Heat Pump Demonstration Study under MPP. The Study aims to provide proof points of heat pump installations in existing multifamily building retrofits, understand the market and technical barriers to these installations in affordable multifamily buildings, and inform future program design. Under this study, \$5 million was originally provided as incentives for 23 MPP projects with heat pumps in their work scopes. The heat pumps must meet the technical requirements of the NYS Clean Heat Program. A project approved for the Study is eligible to receive incentives from MPP, the NYS Clean Heat Program, and the MPP Heat Pump Demonstration. The HPDS provides two types of incentives on a per dwelling unit basis – an incentive for installing approved heat pump equipment and an incentive for electric service upgrade, if deemed necessary for the building. As of the end of 2023, there

⁴⁶ <https://nyserda.seamlessdocs.com/f/AffordabilityVerification>

are currently 13 MPP projects that remain enrolled in the HPDS program, and of those, three projects have completed construction. The Heat Pump Demonstration Study also requires projects to submit deliverables to assess electrical panel needs and asks building owners to confirm that they will keep rents affordable in consideration of the upgrade.

Lastly, NYSERDA supports the adoption of Integrated Physical Needs Assessments (IPNA). The IPNA Management Committee, composed of representatives from NYC HPD, NYC Housing Development Corporation (“NYC HDC”), and HCR, continued to meet throughout 2023 and finalized updated versions of the IPNA Tool, the IPNA Standard and the IPNA Provider Request for Qualifications (“RFQL”). The current version of the Tool and Standard was released in February 2023 and an updated version is planned to be released in Q1 of 2024. A new IPNA Provider RFQL will be released in Q1 of 2024.

5.1.4 RetrofitNY

In 2018, under the first RetrofitNY pilot round, NYSERDA selected six design-build teams to each design a retrofit solution for a specific building. All designs were completed in 2019, and the first pilot project started construction in mid-2019. RiseBoro Community Partnership owns the project, part of the Casa Pasiva development. The design team was led by Chris Benedict, R.A. HCR, NYC HPD and NYSERDA financed the project. The construction faced some delays due to COVID-19 and was completed in November 2022. The second awarded project is located in Phoenix NY and is anticipating completing construction by October 2024. In addition, NYSERDA released a round-2 solicitation in November of 2021 totaling \$5 million. The first project under round 2 is nearing the end of the design phase, and anticipating closing on financing in June 2024.

In 2021, the program also worked with NYCHA on a RetrofitNY-style project funded by NYCHA. Bids came back higher than budgeted on the second Request for Quote in 2023, and the project was subsequently discontinued by NYCHA.

The RetrofitNY program was closed to new applications at the end of 2023. NYSERDA is currently working to support previous awarded projects through the construction periods and perform monitoring and verification. The program is working to compile lessons learned to date and will publish when vetted and approved for public release.

5.1.5 NYSERDA Partnerships with Affordable Housing Agencies

In 2023 the Program Administrators made significant progress in building partnerships with state and local affordable housing agencies and public housing authorities, which in turn continued to demonstrate vital leadership on climate action and building decarbonization. NYSERDA and HCR announced a transformative partnership called the Clean Energy Initiative (“CEI”), providing CEF funding to create state-of-the-art all-electric affordable homes and creating streamlined access to technical assistance and electrification funding integrated directly into HCR’s affordable housing finance applications.

The CEI launched in 2021, starting with affordable new construction and adaptive reuse projects and expanded to encompass existing affordable multifamily retrofits in 2022. In 2022, NYSERDA committed \$25 million to HCR to be awarded under HCR’s 9% and 4% financing RFPs, and seven new construction projects were selected. In 2023, NYSERDA committed an additional \$16 million in CEI incentive funds for HCR to award to new construction, adaptive reuse, and existing building projects. 17 new construction and adaptive reuse projects and four existing building projects were awarded CEI incentives in 2023. To date, a total of \$27.85M in CEI incentives have been awarded to HCR projects.

In a similar effort, NYSERDA also partnered with NYC HPD to create the Retrofit Electrification Pilot, with NYSERDA providing \$24M to support space heating and cooling and/or domestic hot water electrification for existing multifamily building rehabilitation projects in NYC HPD’s preservation programs and bring the comfort and health benefits of electrification to roughly 1,200 LMI households. These partnerships demonstrate scalable models for integrating efficiency and electrification technical assistance and incentives into affordable housing refinancing by giving owners direct access to decarbonization resources and funding as part of their refinancing process. In 2022, NYC HPD and NYSERDA selected six projects to receive incentives for space heating electrification scopes. In 2023, an additional six projects were selected by the HPD and NYSERDA program teams. This partnership between NYC HPD and NYSERDA supported the development of HPD’s new construction design guidelines, released September 2023, that require all new construction projects to reach the LL97 2050 ghg emissions targets.

In 2021, NYSERDA also joined forces with the NYCHA – the largest public housing authority in the country and the largest landlord in New York City – and NYPA to create the Clean Heat for All (“CH4A”) Challenge, a heating and cooling industry competition to create a packaged, cold climate heat pump that can be mounted in a window opening and provide comfortable, efficient heating and cooling to NYCHA residents on a room-by-room basis. The partnership leverages RGGI funding and technical assistance from NYSERDA, NYPA’s procurement vehicle and project management, and NYCHA’s portfolio size and funding commitment to invest \$70M in a proven solution to advance their electrification agenda.

Consequently, NYSERDA, NYPA, and NYCHA issued an RFP soliciting the packaged window heat pump (“PWHP”) solution at the end of 2021. In Q1 of 2022, the three authorities received responses to the RFP, hosted a scoring committee, and evaluated the proposals. In August of 2022, Governor Hochul, Mayor Adams, and executives from NYSERDA, NYCHA, and NYPA announced the selection of two manufacturers, Gradient and Midea, to be awarded purchase orders of 10,000 and 20,000 window heat pumps, respectively.

In 2023, the CH4A team initiated the “Demonstration Phase” of CH4A. Under that Phase, a total of 72 PWHPs (36 from each manufacturer) were installed in 24 apartments in NYCHA’s Woodside Houses in Queens. NYSERDA is funding evaluation of PWHPs over the 2023/24 heating season to assess their viability and performance relative to the RFP specifications and tenant experience with the PWHPs. Pending the outcome of the Demonstration Phase, NYCHA, NYSERDA and NYPA will move forward with purchasing 30,000 PWHPs—10,000 from Gradient and 20,000 from Midea—over the following years (2025 and beyond).

Additional partnerships with housing agencies by Con Edison are outlined in [Section 5.1.1.1](#).

5.2 Program Implementation Milestones

The charts below outline the implementation milestones from the 2022 Implementation Plan that the JMC targeted for completion in 2023, as well as progress towards achieving those milestones.

5.2.1 Statewide Existing Affordable Multifamily Program

2023 Milestone from 2022 Implementation Plan	Status
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Organize stakeholder interviews on AMEEP design and operations based on the first full year of operation to get 	Complete

feedback to guide analysis and potential program changes, and adapt program eligibility to reflect final DAC criteria	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Program Administrators held an AMEEP Roundtable in August 2023 to collect stakeholder feedback regarding AMEEP design and operations Adapting AMEEP eligibility to reflect final DAC criteria is an ongoing objective for the LMI Portfolio
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Review program objectives and operations to enable alignment with potential policy changes scheduled to take place in 2022 and 2023 (e.g., NE: NY Interim Review, Climate Act definition of providing benefits to DACs) 	<p>Delayed</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> As of the filing of the 2023 LMI Implementation Plan, this milestone has been moved to 2024 and may extend into 2025, given ongoing policy changes and dialogue

5.2.2 Technical Assistance for Affordable Multifamily Buildings

2023 Milestone from 2022 Implementation Plan	Status
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Provide technical assistance resources to housing agencies to build in-house capacity to assess and support sustainability as part of core mission 	<p>Completed</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Quarterly ongoing engagement and participation in IPNA management committee meetings with housing agencies Q4 2023 creation of one-pager for FlexTech-IPNA and FlexTech-AMEEP process alignment
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Require consideration of electrification and/or electrification-readiness as part of any subsidized technical assistance to enable long-term building decarbonization efforts 	<p>In Progress</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Q4 2023 PON modification continues to support electrification and/or electrification readiness studies.

5.2.3 RetrofitNY

2023 Milestone from 2022 Implementation Plan	Status
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Integration of retrofit solutions in the public housing authorities' strategies 	Removed- Program has closed

5.2.4 NYSERDA Partnerships with Affordable Housing Agencies

2023 Milestone from 2022 Implementation Plan	Status
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Issue initial small purchase order for and install packaged window heat pumps in NYCHA properties as part of 'demonstration phase' of Clean Heat for All initiative 	Complete

5.3 Budgets, Targets, and Metrics

The savings, budgets, and acquired savings broken out by project types reported for 2023 existing affordable multifamily initiatives are described below.

Direct Savings^{47,48}

Metric	2023 Achieved	2022 Implementation Plan Projection	2023 Achieved to 2022 Implementation Plan Projection Variance	2020 - 2023 Achieved	Implementation Plan Projection (Utilities 2020-2025; NYSERDA 2020-2030)	% Achieved 2020-2023 to Implementation Plan Projection
Total Budget Spend	\$56,848,544	\$60,736,843	-\$3,888,299	\$133,642,695	\$389,723,342	34%
MWh Annual	15,406	14,522	884	50,885	136,736	37%
MWh Lifetime	242,056	181,706	60,350	649,122	1,866,618	35%
MMBtu Annual	534,522	610,337	(75,814)	1,272,997	4,644,209	27%
MMBtu Lifetime	9,859,829	8,048,042	1,811,787	19,659,029	66,745,274	29%
Participants	134,417	106,311	28,106	230,868	453,539	51%
Leveraged Funds	\$100,147,752	\$282,467,727	-\$182,319,975	\$225,689,122	\$1,671,096,113	14%

Indirect Savings

Metric	2020 - 2023 Evaluated	2020-2030 Implementation Plan Projection	% Achieved to Implementation Plan Projection
MWh Annual	-	118,244	-
MWh Lifetime	-	2,048,148	-
MMBtu Annual	-	3,255,356	-
MMBtu Lifetime	-	52,311,885	-

2023 AMEEP Comprehensive Savings

AMEEP-Specific	MWh	MMBtu
Annual Comprehensive Savings	413	6066
Annual Non-Comprehensive Savings	9327	385569
Total Annual Savings	9741	391634

5.4 Findings & Planned Improvements

In 2024, the Program Administrators plan to assess AMEEP operations and streamline program administration, where possible. To help guide streamlining efforts, the Program Administrators plan to gather stakeholder feedback at PC&IP webinars and other events throughout the year. The Program

⁴⁷ NYSERDA had both direct and indirect MWh and MMBtu savings projections for Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings in the 2022 Implementation Plan. Indirect savings have been broken out into a separate table, as is the case throughout this report where NYSERDA had savings projections in the 2022 Implementation Plan.

⁴⁸ In 2023, NYSERDA's closed Multifamily Performance Program had 93 projects that were either canceled or deemed partially completed and closed out due to; increased material costs and other inflationary effects from COVID making the scopes no longer affordable, reduced scope of works resulting in program required minimum savings not being met, and construction delays due workforce or supply chain issues exceeding the programs allowable timelines. These contract cancelations and the refile, detailed in Section 12.6, drove the negative variance seen in the direct and indirect savings tables.

Administrators also plan to prepare for the launch of the 2026-2030 EE/BE Portfolio and align AMEEP with 2026-2030 Portfolio policy objectives, where possible and applicable.

NYSERDA's affordable housing agency partnerships with HCR and NYC HPD will continue to drive progress in the electrification of LMI households. Most notably, in 2024 NYSERDA and HCR will be rolling out a multiyear collaboration that will leverage \$100 million of NYSERDA NYS Clean Heat/CEF (and other RGGI funds) along with \$750 million of HCR funds included in their 5-year capital plan to support electrification in affordable housing. The partnerships with NYC HPD will expand to support affordable new construction electrification.

6. Affordable New Construction

6.1 Program Summary

Under the CEF, NYSERDA has administered the New Construction Housing Program and the Buildings of Excellence initiative, which target the development of higher-performance, affordable new construction. These initiatives continued in 2023.

In 2023, 2,372 units of high-performance affordable housing were completed through the New Construction Housing Program. In addition, NYSERDA held the awards event for round 3 of the Buildings of Excellence competition⁴⁹ in March 2023, and the launch of round 4 of the competition in July 2023, to support early-stage design and demonstration projects of high-performance affordable housing, which features an all-electric design. NYSERDA also engaged in 78 outreach and education events related to high-performance new construction.

The New Construction Team also furthered its partnership with HCR to implement the second phase of the Clean Energy Initiative, a groundbreaking partnership to embed decarbonization incentives directly inside of HCR's programs. The program's pilot phase launched in 2021 and successfully created a carbon neutral level of performance eligibility and provided funding for the first round of projects. NYSERDA worked with NYC HPD to implement a similar program, which launched in 2023 and expects to announce the first round of awarded projects in early 2024.

6.2 Program Implementation Milestones

In 2023, the Program Administrators achieved the following implementation milestones, as outlined in the 2020 Implementation Plan.

⁴⁹ More information on the Buildings of Excellence competition, including details on the award-winning projects can be found here: <https://www.nyserdera.ny.gov/All-Programs/Programs/Multifamily-Buildings-of-Excellence/Winners>

2023 Milestone from 2022 Implementation Plan	Status
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Continue expanded integration with public housing agencies 	<p>Complete</p> <p>NYSERDA has committed a total of \$19,941,500 for a planned 2,431 units of affordable new construction through HCR's Clean Energy Initiative program. In addition, NYSERDA provides funding for technical assistance services to projects and to support HCR's review and management of the program requirements.</p>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Utilize data and successful solution sets from decarbonization projects to deploy information through Channel Partners, conferences and other general awareness activities 	<p>Complete</p> <p>NYSERDA has worked with architects, designers, and developers that participate in the programs to produce and post technical articles and blog posts on projects. NYSERDA has worked with market channel partners to produce and post a variety of marketing materials on projects such as podcasts, technical articles, case studies, and project spotlight videos. Many of these marketing materials were recirculated by other members of the design and developer community, channel partners, and the press.</p>

6.3 Budgets, Targets, and Metrics

Direct Savings

Metric	2023 Achieved	2022 Implementation Plan Projection	2023 Achieved to 2022 Implementation Plan Projection Variance	2020 - 2023 Achieved	Implementation Plan Projection (Utilities 2020-2025; NYSERDA 2020-2030)	% Achieved 2020-2023 to Implementation Plan Projection
Total Budget Spend	\$18,974,225	\$6,569,699	\$12,404,526	\$48,388,014	\$145,318,979	33%
MWh Annual	4,789	3,000	1,789	19,043	88,634	21%
MWh Lifetime	108,237	66,250	41,987	425,986	2,147,766	20%
MMBtu Annual	52,769	32,150	20,619	211,906	647,257	33%
MMBtu Lifetime	1,231,224	706,750	524,474	4,862,292	15,573,620	31%
Participants	2,690	2,075	615	12,216	41,990	29%
Leveraged Funds	\$11,761,571	\$10,150,000	\$1,611,571	\$57,016,937	\$180,873,016	32%

Indirect Savings

Metric	2020 - 2023 Evaluated	2020-2030 Implementation Plan Projection	% Achieved to Implementation Plan Projection
MWh Annual	31,935	18,757	170%
MWh Lifetime	798,375	468,913	170%
MMBtu Annual	283,441	111,694	254%
MMBtu Lifetime	7,086,025	2,792,338	254%

6.4 Findings & Planned Improvements

Although economic uncertainty and supply chain issues for developers resulting from the global pandemic continued to impact expected affordable new construction across the state, nearly all participation and efficiency-related targets were met in the multifamily sector of the New Construction Housing Program. Affordable new construction for the single-family sector continues to experience project delays resulting in dwelling unit and efficiency target shortfalls. In addition to developing a coordinated set of affordable new construction offerings between NYSERDA and the Utilities scheduled

for 2022, NYSERDA continues to work with HCR and NYC HPD to deliver clean energy incentives into the capital stack for projects financed through those respective programs. With the passage of zero emissions new construction legislation in May 2023, NYSERDA's Affordable New Construction activity will be transitioning from providing financial incentives for buildings to delivering technical assistance to stakeholders, especially those involved in early stages of design.

7. Pilots and Demonstrations

7.1 Program Summary

To continuously improve the programs and offerings under the Statewide LMI Portfolio, the Program Administrators will incorporate the piloting and demonstration of new technologies and approaches for serving LMI customers and communities. Through pilot activities, the Program Administrators will seek to:

- Identify and test technologies and/or approaches for addressing the barriers to improving energy efficiency in the LMI market segment;
- Test approaches that can scale the adoption of energy efficiency solutions in the LMI market segment;
- Prove models for improving the delivery of energy efficiency solutions across the LMI market segment that can reduce the administrative burden for customers and administrators; and
- Determine innovative approaches for improving awareness and access to energy efficiency solutions for LMI or otherwise disadvantaged communities.

7.2 Program Implementation Milestones

In 2023, NYSERDA piloted an LMI-focused marketplace concept through the Innovative Market Strategies⁵⁰ initiative to pilot, with the intention to test whether a holistic marketplace that combines education on the high-efficiency products, access to low-interest financing, and targeted incentives can provide an effective complement to traditional energy efficiency retrofit programs to advance equitable access to clean energy solutions and lower barriers to adoption of higher efficiency products. The pilot concluded Q1 2024. NYSERDA will publish pilot findings on its website.

7.3 Budgets, Targets, and Metrics

The 2022 Implementation Plan outlined the projected achievements for Pilots and Demonstrations to begin in 2022.⁵¹

⁵⁰ <https://www.nysesda.ny.gov/All-Programs/Innovative-Market-Strategies-Program>

⁵¹ There is a negative variance of \$362,383 in 2023 Achieved expenditures. This negative variance is due to: (i) milestones completed earlier than expected, resulting in higher than planned spending in 2022, and (ii) delay in launch of pilot funded with this budget, resulting in a 3-month contract extension.

Metric	2023 Achieved	2022 Implementation Plan Projection	2023 Achieved to 2022 Implementation Plan Projection Variance	2020 - 2023 Achieved	Implementation Plan Projection (Utilities 2020-2025; NYSERDA 2020-2030)	% Achieved 2020-2023 to Implementation Plan Projection
Total Budget Spend	\$277,116	\$639,499	-\$362,383	\$746,082	\$2,443,532	31%
MWh Annual	-	-	-	-	-	-
MWh Lifetime	-	-	-	-	-	-
MMBtu Annual	-	-	-	-	-	-
MMBtu Lifetime	-	-	-	-	-	-
Participants	-	-	-	-	-	-
Leveraged Funds	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	

7.4 Findings & Planned Improvements

In 2024, NYSERDA anticipates sharing the findings of the IMS pilot. Additionally, NYSERDA and the Utilities will develop a protocol for identifying and approving pilot initiatives that address the pilot objectives outlined in Section 7.1.

8. Beneficial Electrification in Low- and Moderate-Income Homes

8.1 Program Summary

NYSERDA is investing \$30 million to address the financial and institutional barriers⁵² that pose a challenge to the widespread adoption of heat pumps in LMI households or affordable housing, as well as deployment of heat pumps for LMI households and subsequent analysis of bill impacts and customer experience. These efforts include research and analysis towards identifying solutions to address institutional barriers and financial models in the LMI market segment; pilots and demonstrations to identify replicable models for heat pump installation; incentives to allow for the incorporation of heat pumps into LMI energy efficiency projects, where feasible; and consumer education to enable LMI consumers to maximize the benefit of a heat pump installation. The Program Administrators expect these investments to inform the long-term strategy for advancing beneficial electrification for LMI households and affordable housing.

8.2 Program Implementation Milestones

The Program Administrators achieved the following implementation milestones, as outlined in the 2022 Implementation Plan:

2023 Milestone from 2022 Implementation Plan	Status
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Publish interim learnings from the single family LMI heat pump demonstration study (short term incentives) 	In progress. Completion is delayed due to insufficient household consumption data.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Publish interim learnings from the multifamily LMI heat pump demonstrations study (short term incentives) 	Not yet started. There has been significant attrition among projects selected for the study, and few of the projects have reached construction completion.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Revise program rules to incorporate learnings from affordability and consumer protections research 	In progress

⁵² For example, the potential for cost shift from building owners to tenants when an affordable multifamily building converts from a central heating system to in-unit air source heat pumps.

8.3 Budgets, Targets, and Metrics

The LMI Beneficial Electrification expenditures were for research and analysis, which did not have direct savings attributed to the activities. Performance metrics for the LMI beneficial electrification initiatives were not included in the 2020 Implementation Plan or in the revised Implementation Plan filed in 2022.

There is a negative variance of roughly \$2.77 million in 2023 Achieved expenditures vs 2022 Plan Projections, as shown in the table below. This negative variance is due to: (i) project attrition from the MPP portion of the Heat Pump Demonstration Study, and (ii) delay in launch of pilots funded with this budget. These delays were largely due to a longer than expected planning timeline because of lack of staff capacity.

Metric	2023 Achieved	2022 Implementation Plan Projection	2023 Achieved to 2022 Implementation Plan Projection Variance	2020 - 2023 Achieved	Implementation Plan Projection (Utilities 2020-2025; NYSERDA 2020-2030)	% Achieved 2020-2023 to Implementation Plan Projection
Total Budget Spend	\$1,805,326	\$4,580,000	-\$2,774,674	\$7,866,062	\$30,000,000	26%
MWh Annual	-	-	-	-	-	-
MWh Lifetime	-	-	-	-	-	-
MMBtu Annual	-	-	-	-	-	-
MMBtu Lifetime	-	-	-	-	-	-
Participants	-	-	-	-	-	-
Leveraged Funds	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	

8.4 Findings & Planned Improvements

The initial round of market research was completed in late 2023. The work included (1) utility bill modeling to assess the bill affordability impacts of electrification in sub-segments based on size, existing heating system type, metering configuration, regulatory/subsidy status, vintage, region, and other variables, and (2) complementary qualitative research assessing the electrification-readiness of sub-segments based on similar variables.

Research findings indicate that nearly all buildings heated with gas will face utility bill affordability concerns if converted to heat pumps. This holds true even when building shell upgrades are included as part of a retrofit package. Installing deep efficiency measures and more efficient heat pump systems (e.g., ground source heat pumps) significantly alleviates the bill affordability concerns, but these retrofit packages face steep hurdles in terms of upfront costs. As nearly two-thirds of New York households use gas heat, this finding has significant implications for policies and programs supporting heat pump adoption, as well as for affordable housing agencies for whom higher utility costs would negatively impact budgets and production targets.

Findings also indicate that utility rates customized for electric heat customers are a promising tool for supporting growth in heat pump adoption. When customers are switched onto these rates (currently available in Long Island and Con Edison territories) as they convert to heat pumps, utility bill affordability concerns are significantly decreased and, in many cases, eliminated outright.

On the other hand, nearly all buildings heated with fuels other than gas will experience favorable shifts in utility costs as a result of electrification. These segments of the LMI housing stock are most ripe for heat pump conversion at the present time. However, in the multifamily sector, even if utility costs decrease on a building level, individual residents may still face affordability concerns due to the phenomenon of cost

shifting. Nearly all multifamily buildings face the risk of shifting heating costs from building owner to individual apartment meters as heat pumps are installed, depending on the building's metering configuration and the design of the heat pump system. These cost shifts present sudden and drastic increases in tenant's utility bills and similar reductions in the owner's bills. Solutions for avoiding and mitigating cost shifting will remain a major focus of electrification policy and programs for years to come. Early findings indicate that technical solutions exist to eliminate cost shifting, but the adoption of these solutions are contingent upon the building owner's decisions in selecting a design for their heat pump retrofit.

Qualitative findings indicate that agency policies, rules, and regulations often hinder or block a heat pump retrofit in subsidized affordable housing. Even if a building owner is financially and otherwise prepared to convert to heat pumps, they may be barred from doing so and likely will not understand how to navigate the arcane processes needed to achieve agency approval for their project. This indicates that interagency discussions to review and, in some cases, propose modifications to existing rules and policies, are urgently needed if existing affordable housing is to adopt electrification. Many of these rules are in place for the protection of tenants, and any proposed modifications to facilitate heat pumps will have to maintain an equivalent level of protection.

Findings also indicate that electrification of cooking may become an important intervention point in future efforts to scale heat pumps. Cooking is often the last system to be electrified when a building moves toward full decarbonization, though the resulting cost savings from eliminating the monthly meter charge (for customers eliminating natural gas use) generally improve project economics. Additionally, due to the everyday interactions that residents tend to have with their stoves, cooking electrification is a useful entry point for raising awareness and acceptance among LMI residents on topics related to building decarbonization more broadly. Finally, reports are increasing of older multifamily buildings shutting off cooking gas to tenants for lengthy periods, due to failed pressure tests in the building's gas distribution piping. The urgency of restoring this basic service leads building owners to de-prioritize heat pump projects in utilizing a limited capital budget. Program offerings that pair heat pumps with cooking electrification measures may be attractive to buildings such as these.

Findings from this research continue to inform the development of pilots and demonstrations, as well as standard offer programmatic activity between NYSERDA and the Utilities to increase the adoption of heat pump solutions in the LMI market segment. Additional research is being scoped now, to tackle questions that have not yet been answered, or that were raised in the findings from the initial round of research.

Other activities undertaken in 2023 centered on developing pilots, demonstrations to test novel solutions to complex challenges to electrification in LMI housing. These pilots include an initiative supporting rapid response heat pump conversions for homes whose existing fossil fuel system fails in heating season, as well as an initiative supporting cooking electrification and wiring upgrades in multifamily LMI housing.

In 2024, market research and analysis in concert with DPS and the housing agencies will remain a heavy focus. Interagency engagement is expected to begin regarding the existing rules and policies described above. Pilots as described above will be developed and launched by the end of the year.

9. Additional LMI Initiatives

9.1 Program Summary

In addition to the Statewide LMI Portfolio initiatives, NYSERDA administers other initiatives to increase access to clean energy solutions and improve energy affordability for LMI residents and communities as part of the CEF Market Development Portfolio. The New York State Healthy Homes Value-Based Payment Pilot and Solar for All were initially filed as part of the LMI Chapter of the CEF but were transitioned to the LMI Implementation Plan in 2020.

9.1.1 New York State Healthy Homes Value-Based Payment Pilot

Approved in 2019, the NYS Healthy Homes Value-Based Payment (“VBP”) Pilot seeks to develop a framework that allows New York’s managed care organizations (“MCOs”) to fund residential healthy homes interventions⁵³ as part of their value-based payment arrangements with healthcare providers within the Medicaid Healthcare Delivery System.⁵⁴ By validating impacts such as healthcare cost savings and benefits to residents, as well as providing market development support, including specification of services and guidance related to VBP contracting, the Healthy Homes Pilot facilitates the adoption of healthy homes treatments by MCOs as part of their Medicaid VBP Arrangements that incorporate social determinants of health. Adopting this approach addresses avoidable medical costs associated with respiratory conditions such as asthma and household injury while encouraging third-party capital investment in residential energy efficiency through MCO adoption of healthy home interventions within the VBP social determinants of health framework after the completion of the Pilot.

The Pilot is a partnership between NYSERDA and the NYS Department of Health (“DOH”). It has a budget of \$9.6 million and aims to provide the pilot intervention in 500 Medicaid member homes, with NYSERDA and DOH jointly evaluating the associated Medicaid cost savings and benefits for participants.

NYSERDA and DOH targeted the pilot launch for late 2020, however, due to complications of the COVID-19 pandemic, the field launch was delayed until late 2021, with projects anticipated for completion in 2024. Upon launch, there were delays in enrolling participants in part due to limited capacity of

⁵³ A residential healthy homes intervention combines energy efficiency and weatherization measures (*e.g.*, insulation and air sealing) with measures that address persistent respiratory health conditions such as asthma (*e.g.*, ventilation, moisture/mold mitigation, carpet removal), and includes additional measures aimed at home injury prevention (smoke and carbon monoxide alarms, stair repair, electrical outlet covers). When implemented together, these interventions can improve occupant health, reduce energy bills and healthcare costs, and improve the comfort and safety of a home. The Pilot intervention includes community health worker visits providing education related to asthma self-management and may include asthma-focused nursing visits, as determined necessary and available.

⁵⁴ New York State Medicaid has transitioned the managed care healthcare delivery system from a fee-for-service to a VBP model that links healthcare provider performance and reimbursement through a pre-determined set of value metrics. Under the VBP model, managed care organizations (“MCO”) (*i.e.*, healthcare plans such as Empire Blue Cross Blue Shield) enter into arrangements with healthcare providers or provider networks. To support local investment in activities that address social determinants of health (“SDH”), most VBP arrangements require incorporation of a community-based organization (“CBO”) engaging in work focused on SDH. Among the five social determinants of health categories established within the VBP system, the Neighborhoods and Environment category includes “substandard housing” as a determinant and includes funded interventions and standard metrics associated with healthy homes interventions within the established SDH Intervention Menu. The substandard housing determinant places energy efficiency and weatherization measures, when incorporated within a Healthy Homes intervention, within the DOH VBP model.

community health workers, which stemmed from shifting healthcare industry priorities and lower staffing coming out of the COVID-19 pandemic. However, managed care organizations that are participating in the pilot and community health workers are continuing outreach and intake activities and the pace of enrollment has improved.

Given these challenges and expecting that reaching the pilot goal of 500 projects would remain challenging under post-pandemic conditions, NYSEDA and NYS Department of Health leadership made modifications to pilot eligibility, which previously was limited to Medicaid members who are attributed to value-based payment (VBP) arrangements through Pilot-participating managed care organizations. To encourage higher levels of enrollment, the allowable eligibility has been broadened to include Medicaid members regardless of VBP arrangement, with all other participation criteria remaining constant. The modifications streamlined participant consent and enrollment processes, resulting in increased numbers of consented participants and numbers of referrals to NYSEDA for housing intervention services accordingly. In February 2023, managed care organizations began outreach to newly eligible members using their expanded eligibility lists. Improved participation rates associated with the expanded eligibility began in Q2 2023 and continue currently.

Initially, NYSEDA and DOH partnered with four MCOs covering service areas within all New York City boroughs and Erie, Chautauqua, and Niagara counties. In 2023, to further increase numbers of consented participants and facilitate robust housing intervention opportunities across single-family and multifamily housing types, the pilot expanded eligibility and service areas to include Onondaga county. In addition, arrangements were made with a pilot-participating MCO to expand service areas further to five additional Hudson Valley counties, including Dutchess, Orange, Sullivan, Ulster, and Westchester. Outreach to eligible Hudson Valley Medicaid members is expected to begin in Q1 2024. To accommodate expanded regional coverage, NYSEDA onboarded additional contractors to cover Onondaga County and expects to onboard more contractors to cover the Hudson Valley counties. A corresponding increase in referrals to NYSEDA is expected by Q2 2024, with intervention completions continuing in all pilot regions throughout 2024.

9.1.2 Solar for All

The Solar for All initiative, also administered by NYSEDA, was designed to allow low-income customers access to the community solar market by: (1) developing a community solar subscription model specifically for low-income customers; (2) issuing solicitations for community solar projects to commit project capacity to subscriptions for low-income customers; and (3) working with low-income energy efficiency programs, utilities, community agencies, solar project developers, investors and other market actors to market the program to low-income customers and develop a strategy for a post-initiative transition.

The Solar for All initiative was launched under the CEF Market Development Portfolio in 2018 and community solar project procurement was funded under the CEF Market Development Portfolio through 2020. A single solicitation round was conducted in 2018, which resulted in 9 MWdc of community solar projects being procured for this purpose. No additional solicitation rounds under this model are anticipated. A Solar for All subscription was added as an eligible measure on the EmPower NY application in 2020, to help streamline access to energy efficiency and solar benefits for low-income households. Approximately 4,700 low-income customers are currently enrolled in Solar for All. In January 2022, the Public Service Commission approved with modifications an Expanded Solar for All proposal (E-SFA), filed

jointly by National Grid and NYSERDA, that proposed launch in 2022 and will ultimately serve over 160,000 low-income National Grid electric customers. New York’s 10 GW Distributed Solar Roadmap, filed by NYSERDA in December 2021, articulates the go-forward strategies to grow this market. It includes a Solar Energy Equity Framework to benefit low- and moderate-income customers and disadvantaged communities.⁵⁵

9.2 Program Implementation Milestones

In 2022, key achievements for the Program Administrators include:

NYS Healthy Homes VBP Pilot

2023 Milestone from 2022 Implementation Plan	Status
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Commence interim reporting on Year One intervention implementation process 	Complete

9.3 Budgets, Targets, and Metrics

NYS Healthy Homes VBP Pilot

Direct Savings

Metric	2023 Achieved	2022 Implementation Plan Projection	2023 Achieved to 2022 Implementation Plan Projection Variance	2020 - 2023 Achieved	Implementation Plan Projection (Utilities 2020-2025; NYSERDA 2020-2030)	% Achieved 2020-2023 to Implementation Plan Projection
Total Budget Spend	\$633,205	\$3,813,001	-\$3,179,795	\$2,369,138	\$9,824,687	24%
MWh Annual	7	150	(143)	8	300	3%
MWh Lifetime	100	2,100	(2,000)	127	4,206	3%
MMBtu Annual	40	5,000	(4,960)	41	10,000	0%
MMBtu Lifetime	995	100,000	(99,005)	1,036	200,000	1%
Participants	4	250	(246)	8	501	2%
Leveraged Funds	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	

Indirect Savings

Metric	2020 - 2023 Evaluated	Implementation Plan Target 2020-2030	% Achieved to Implementation Plan Target
MWh Annual	-	28,000	-
MWh Lifetime	-	392,000	-
MMBtu Annual	-	935,000	-
MMBtu Lifetime	-	18,700,000	-

⁵⁵ 10 GW Solar Roadmap. <https://documents.dps.ny.gov/public/Common/ViewDoc.aspx?DocRefId=%7B4C42AAFF-0EB9-4890-AA0D-21C70B088F4B%7D>

Solar for All

Metric	2023 Achieved	2022 Implementation Plan Projection	2023 Achieved to 2022 Implementation Plan Projection Variance	2020 - 2023 Achieved	Implementation Plan Projection (Utilities 2020-2025; NYSEDA 2020-2030)	% Achieved 2020-2023 to Implementation Plan Projection
Total Budget Spend	\$1,228,538	\$1,300,000	-\$71,462	\$4,242,644	\$11,712,619	36%
MWh Annual	-	-	-	-	-	-
MWh Lifetime	-	-	-	-	-	-
MMBtu Annual	-	-	-	-	-	-
MMBtu Lifetime	-	-	-	-	-	-
Participants	-	-	-	765	-	-
Leveraged Funds	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	-

9.4 Findings & Planned Improvements

Going forward, the Solar for All initiative and other initiatives designed to increase access to solar for LMI households, affordable housing, and disadvantaged communities will be funded as part of the Solar Equity Framework of NY Sun, as outlined in the NY Sun 2020-2025 Operating Plan,⁵⁶ filed with the DPS on June 1, 2020.

As noted in Section 9.1.2, service areas for the NYS Healthy Homes VBP Pilot have been expanded to include Onondaga county and five additional Hudson Valley counties, including Dutchess, Orange, Sullivan, Ulster, and Westchester. This modification is intended to increase the number of consented participants and facilitate robust housing intervention opportunities across single-family and multifamily housing types.

10. Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement

Awareness and education initiatives play a crucial role in making energy efficiency and energy affordability programs accessible to LMI customers. The success of the Statewide LMI Portfolio depends on a successful customer awareness, outreach, and engagement campaign. The following key initiatives comprise the Statewide LMI Portfolio’s Customer Awareness, Outreach and Engagement approach: 1. LMI Portfolio Marketing, 2. Community-Based Outreach, Education, and Engagement Partnerships, 3. Community-Based Customer Engagement and Innovative Outreach Initiatives. This comprehensive approach allows the Program Administrators to reach residents and communities with opportunities for improving energy affordability, accessing clean energy solutions, improving awareness and education of clean energy opportunities, connecting with essential services⁵⁷, and otherwise accessing the full range of benefits of the clean energy economy. Progress and key milestones for Customer Awareness, Outreach, and Engagement initiatives are provided below.

10.1 LMI Portfolio Marketing

Statewide LMI Portfolio marketing includes four broad elements: (1) statewide branding; (2) the NY Energy Advisor website; (3) branded hard-copy program outreach and informational materials to

⁵⁶ <http://documents.dps.ny.gov/public/Common/ViewDoc.aspx?DocRefId=%7B4F3CB5E3-BA5A-4182-AA44-94C3C24C2441%7D>.

⁵⁷ These are services outside of the LMI initiative that facilitate participation in the initiative, which may be referred to as “wraparound.” For example, a customer may need a new roof in order to qualify for attic insulation under the EmPower+ initiative and receives the new roof from a community program that funds such repairs.

complement the online NY Energy Advisor website; and (4) delivery of community-based marketing and paid advertising.

10.1.1 Statewide Branding

The Program Administrators continued to develop statewide branding and a coordinated marketing strategy for the Statewide LMI Portfolio to drive LMI customers and affordable building owners to available programs and resources. The Statewide Marketing efforts dedicated to raising awareness for LMI programs, offers and resources continue to be evident by user behaviors on the NY Energy Advisor site. The Program Administrators can glean from insights and real-time dashboard that there is an increase in traffic from paid media but also from the use of the energyadvisor.ny.gov URL directly, showing brand recognition and recall.

10.1.2 NY Energy Advisor

In 2021, the Program Administrators launched the full NY Energy Advisor website, a platform that offers streamlined access to initiatives and services for LMI customers, affordable multifamily property owners and managers, contractors, and stakeholders throughout the State. The completed NY Energy Advisor is designed to provide clear, consistent, and easy-to-find information on all relevant LMI initiatives and services, including energy efficiency, renewable energy, and energy education materials. Statewide marketing began for NY Energy Advisor in January 2022 with a plan that was built in collaboration between NYSERDA and the Utilities. 2022 was the benchmark year for website analytics. In-market activities will be optimized year over year as NY Energy Advisor continues in the market.

Analytics for the website are tracked via a comprehensive dashboard that reports on demographics, site usage metrics, advertising referral sources, event actions (defined as a click on any action), Paid Search Keyword analysis, and dayparting. All this data helps inform optimizations to statewide marketing efforts. This data is shared between Program Administrators monthly, and a metrics chart reflecting on-site actions (or events) is generated so program interaction can be monitored. The data shows how many times a user clicks “Learn More,” or “Apply Now” to the programs listed. To-date, NY Energy Advisor has been the host of over 800,000 website sessions for nearly 600,000 users. The quiz on the main page, which is the heart of the website that generates solutions for users, saw a 14.1% increase in quiz starts in 2023 when compared to 2022. The data also reflects a 9.8% increase in quiz completions when compared to the prior year. The statewide marketing plan continues to yield impressive metrics. The use of paid search, digital banners and social media, all working together have created some above industry benchmark performance results. The campaign saw over 140 million impressions across all channels, and nearly 4 million video views.

In 2023 the NY Energy Advisor statewide marketing campaign added the use of a Public Service Announcement (“PSA”) speaking to the benefits of the NY Energy Advisor website. The PSA was created in a 60- and 30-second version for both broadcast television and radio. As of the end of January 2024, the PSA was picked up by 6 broadcast television stations and aired 224 times. The airing of the broadcast spot represents a fair market value (meaning the cost it would correlate to if the Program Administrators had to pay to place an ad) of over \$200,000. The PSA was created in English and translated to Spanish.

In addition to the Statewide Marketing Plan, a comprehensive toolkit of online and offline collateral materials was developed and posted on the NYSERDA site. The toolkit is comprised of NY Energy Advisor Posters, Fact Sheets, Talking Points, Newsletter Blurbs, and Imagery locked up with a NY Energy Advisor

Logo for credibility. This toolkit was made public for any organization to use its contents to help facilitate discussions with potential income-eligible customers and it serves as an access point for those who may not have access to the internet. Moving forward, the toolkit content and copy are currently being updated to maintain fresh messaging that resonates with customers better (based on interaction with paid media and click-through rates during the active campaign).

10.1.3 Hard Copy Customer Education Collateral and Multilingual Communications

While the online NY Energy Advisor is a critical resource for providing information to LMI customers, approximately 7% of adults nationwide, of which 25% are aged 65 and older,⁵⁸ do not have access to a computer or mobile device in their home. To address this fact, the Program Administrators complement the NY Energy Advisor website with written materials that provide similar branded messaging about Portfolio offerings. These materials are distributed for use by contractors and community-based partners to hand out to their clients. The focus of the materials is providing initiative information and encouragement for customers to take action by calling their utility, NYSERDA's customer service center, or Clean Energy Hub to receive assistance in applying for participation. Currently, NY Energy Advisor-specific collateral is available in several languages (English, Chinese, Russian, and Spanish). In an effort to continue to be as accessible to all income-eligible New Yorkers, we also have ensured that NYSERDA's program application for EmPower + is available to meet the needs of potential customers. That is why, in 2023, the EmPower + application was translated into a total of 14 languages. With the introduction of the Clean Energy Hubs, materials on LMI offerings and NY Energy Advisor are being made available to the Hubs, ensuring that NY Energy Advisor and other LMI programs are consistently communicated.

10.1.4 Community-Based Marketing and Paid Advertising

To complement the NY Energy Advisor and the community-based outreach and education elements described above, the Program Administrators continue to conduct multi-lingual marketing through local media, with an emphasis on marketing delivered through local news outlets and community officials and opinion leaders. The Program Administrators look to leverage their community-based partners' relationships with local media and ability to garner earned media to promote programs.

One significant development in 2023 was the addition of a PSA for NY Energy Advisor. The PSA was created in both :60 and :30 formats for both broadcast television and radio. The PSA was produced in both Spanish and English and as of the end of December it ran 225+ times in a total of six Markets across the State. The PSA runs at no-cost after it is pitched to the PSA Directors at Broadcast TV and Radio stations and is voluntarily picked up by those entities. The NY Energy Advisor PSA has aired reaching an equivalent value of \$200,000 in media space (at no paid-media cost).

Additional local marketing may include paid advertising to raise awareness about the LMI programs. Examples of paid advertising that may be considered are:

- Public transportation posters and billboards
- Google searches
- Social media
- Local electronic and print media

⁵⁸ Pew Research Center – April 2, 2021 "7% of Americans don't use the internet and who they are"

- Direct mail/email campaigns tailored to LMI customers who have been identified as categorically eligible based on geographic eligibility guidelines, or who are identified in utility customer databases as being eligible for HEAP or low-income rate discounts
- Geotargeted paid media
- Streaming Radio
- Paid Social Media (Both Static and Video)
- Public Service Announcement

10.2 Community-Based Outreach, Education, and Engagement Partnerships

In 2020 and 2021, NYSERDA undertook a co-design process with 30 organizations to identify opportunities to improve the reach and effectiveness of the Community Energy Engagement Program. As a result of the co-design process, NYSERDA issued an RFP in 2021 to establish the Regional Clean Energy Hubs. In December 2022, the Regional Clean Energy Hubs were announced, with one hub in each of the ten economic development regions across the state except for the New York City region, where three hubs were established. The Regional Clean Energy Hubs are a team of trusted, knowledgeable, community-based organizations in and from New York State with an aim to assist communities and residents with accessing clean energy programs and solutions and participating in the clean energy economy. The Regional Clean Energy Hubs will play an instrumental role in positioning disadvantaged communities to benefit from the clean energy transition by:

- Acting as a trusted local resource for community members to learn more about the energy-related programs and services available to them.
- Increasing awareness of these programs and services by leveraging the expertise and trust of local community organizations - particularly those with a proven track record of engaging disadvantaged communities.
- Developing outreach and engagement strategies to elevate the needs of communities and residents into program and policy development.
- Addressing gaps in and advancing diversity of the clean energy workforce by connecting residents with educational, training, and job opportunities and by connecting small businesses with resources to support economic development.

In 2023, the Regional Clean Energy Hubs completed their first program year with a focus on foundational program development, project coordination, and outreach and awareness. During the first four to six months of program initiation the Hubs executed their subcontractor agreements, hired and trained staff, and developed processes for operationalizing Hub activities. The Hubs have provided 2,477 program and loan application referrals to customers across New York State by working with partner organizations to assist customers with coordinating NYSERDA and non-NYSERDA funded projects, programs, and resources. Hubs have also conducted outreach targeted towards disadvantaged communities by hosting or participating in 1,308 community events (farmers markets, town halls, food pantries etc.) and developing targeted marketing materials relevant to the local communities. Additionally, to strengthen coordination and collaboration among NYSERDA and Non-NYSERDA programs Hubs were connected to the utilities part of the Joint Management Committee (JMC). These meetings consisted of introductions, program overviews and discussion on best practices for coordination.

10.3 Community-Based Customer Engagement and Innovative Outreach Initiatives

In addition to their collaboration in administering statewide LMI portfolio initiatives, the New York Utilities partner with organizations in their service territories who directly or indirectly serve or advocate on behalf of the LMI community. These partnerships to engage eligible LMI customers through customized educational efforts and the distribution of free or discounted direct install measures directly or through trusted local organizations on an opt-in basis.⁵⁹ These engagement initiatives provide customers with easy access to energy efficiency information, promote proven technology (*e.g.*, installation of LED lighting measures), and increase awareness of other efficiency programs offered in the Portfolio, including direct install measures, behavioral action recommendations, and general efficiency education.

Further, the Utilities, in coordination with NYSERDA, test and implement innovative approaches to customer awareness and engagement through leveraging Utility engagement channels.

10.4 Utility Community-Based Customer Engagement Initiatives

Con Edison

Con Edison has conducted efforts focused on increasing education and awareness about energy efficiency, as well as providing energy efficient equipment for use in the home. In 2023, as part of Con Edison's Efficiency Starter Program, 7,464 kits were distributed to customers participating in Con Edison's Energy Affordability Program which provides bill assistance. The Efficiency Starter Program is an opt-in only program where eligible customers can claim a kit online. Kits can contain three LED lightbulbs, two faucet aerators, a low-flow showerhead, and weatherization measures such as window insulation, foam tape, and a self-adhesive door sweep. Con Edison also collaborated with food pantries to distribute 153,408 packs of four LEDs to low-income customers, effectively doubling the number of kits provided in 2022. In 2023, Con Edison's LMI Portfolio incorporated the Smart Kids program. The program targets Title 1 schools and teaches students energy savings practices through integrated lesson plans and energy efficiency kits. Since being added to the portfolio last year, Smart Kids provided 29,910 energy efficiency kits to students.

NFGDC

In 2023, NFGDC provided 17,360 weatherization kits to area block clubs, community-based organizations, and non-profits. Although this program benefited LMI customers, the funding related to this effort came from non-LMI sources, so associated savings and participant numbers are not included in this report. The pandemic created a need to promote greater awareness of newly implemented payment assistance programs, the HEAP Residential Supplement Plan, and the NYS Emergency Rental Assistance Program. NFGDC created a slip sheet placed into a door hanger for customer homes to alert customers of the various assistance programs available and urging a phone call if anyone was struggling to pay their bill.

National Grid

In 2023, National Grid continued its Food Bank LED Program with its primary objective to increase awareness of programs and services available to its customers and to encourage customers to utilize

⁵⁹ Sponsoring utilities avoid distribution of unsolicited measures, which can lead to low installation rates and customer complaints.

them. National Grid continued collaborating with NYSEG to distribute LED lightbulbs and brochures that contained information on energy efficiency and payment assistance programs such as EmPower+, HEAP, National Grid's Energy Affordability Program (EAP) and assistance provided by National Grid's Consumer Advocates. National Grid and NYSEG partnered on this initiative due to their overlapping service territory to utilize resources most efficiently and ensure there were no redundancies. In addition, National Grid collaborated with the newly established Capital Region Clean Energy Hub and provided 1,500 LED bulbs to be handed out at Hub events. National Grid will continue to explore opportunities to work with the Hubs in the future. In 2023 this program delivered 2,202 gross MWh of electric savings. Overall, this initiative will continue into 2024.

In January 2023, National Grid launched a Gas Food Bank pilot in its downstate, KEDLI service territory, providing vouchers for fully paid natural gas fired heating equipment clean & tune services performed by selected qualified local HVAC contractors. All vouchers had definitive expiration dates, as applicable to their stage of rollout. The program was administered in two stages in Spring and then Fall of 2023. The program served as a first step in engaging income eligible customers to get a taste of the larger KEDLI HEAT program on a smaller scale and ultimately proceed to apply for broader weatherization services of the KEDLI HEAT program, including and starting with the home energy assessment. This Food Bank initiative has been successful and has brought a significant pipeline of interested customers to participate in KEDLI HEAT. Initially, the program delivery concept was to leverage the food pantries network which is being extensively utilized by the LMI customer segment. Hence, the name – Long Island LMI Food Bank. This approach yielded limited success and was slow to scale participation. As a result, another broader method of outreach was used to send text messages to prequalified low-income customers from our EAP participants database as well as a market researched moderate-income customer base, using the voucher pdf as an attachment. This approach produced significant uptick of interest in the program and ultimately became the focal strategy, with food pantries and community outreach becoming more supplementary in nature. Overall, the program had 255 participants since inception in March 2023 through December 2023, delivering 812 MMBTU of gross natural gas savings, with additional customers scheduled in January and February 2024. This pilot will close after the customers scheduled in February 2024 are served and learnings from this method of outreach will be incorporated into the broader strategy for the KEDLI HEAT program.

Orange & Rockland

In 2023, Orange & Rockland continued its partnership with local FoodBanks to distribute 11,496 LED light bulb kits. Each LED kit included 4 LED bulbs and messaging to educate the customer about energy efficiency. The Orange & Rockland LMI marketplace was open for the complete 2023 year. The LMI Marketplace provided enhanced rebates on thermostats, LED lightbulbs, Energy Kits, Air Purifiers and Smart devices. In 2023 the LMI marketplace sold 135 thermostats, 47 Air purifiers, 308 LED light bulbs, and 16 APS devices among many others. The LMI Marketplace contributed 72.56 MWh and 850.09 Dth in savings to the Orange & Rockland portfolio. As part of the Customer Engagement and Outreach programs, Orange & Rockland participated in nine school presentations at local schools ranging from K to 12th grade. Presentations done at Title 1 schools included an additional coupon for discounted Energy Kits from our ORU Marketplace. The topics ranged based on grade, but all included information on Energy Efficiency, Renewable Energy, and the programs available through the utilities. Program information was sent home with the students along with educational collateral. Along with in school presentations, Orange & Rockland participated in presentations at two local senior community centers. These

presentations were also focused on informing the audience about the existing programs available, as well as educating them on Energy Efficiency and Renewable Energy. Orange & Rockland will be increasing these in-person events in 2024.

Central Hudson

In 2023, Central Hudson continued its partnership with local food pantries and the United Way to distribute 5,000 LEDs. A printed sleeve was included with the packaging, highlighting the ENERGY STAR LED contents, and providing guidance on income-eligible programs such as EmPower+, HEAP, and other Low-Income Bill Discount programs.

NYSEG/ RG&E

In 2023, NYSEG/RG&E continued outreach to local food pantries providing energy saving measures with referrals and endorsements directing customers to sign up for Empower+ and the AMEEP program. NYSEG/RG&E also partnered with its government relations team and low-income customer advocates to attend community-based events located within DAC tracts. NYSEG/RG&E distributed over 7,700 energy saving kits, LED's and door sweeps during these events while promoting Empower+ and other energy efficiency programs. In addition, deep price reductions on energy saving measures were also provided at local discount retailers and thrift stores located within DAC census tract neighborhoods identified as low-income. In 2023 NYSEG/RG&E launched the LivingWise school kit program. This program provided students and parents within NYSEG and RG&E service territories with an education program that is cost-effective and produces energy savings. Title 1 schools were offered free kits with energy savings products such as LED bulbs, shower heads and door sweeps. In 2023 NYSEG served over 13,000 households and RG&E served over 2,500 through our school kit program.

10.4.1 Utility Innovative Outreach Initiatives

As described in Section 4.1.1, in 2023 the Utilities, in coordination with NYSERDA, tested and implemented innovative approaches to customer awareness and engagement through leveraging Utility engagement channels. Combined efforts across all Utilities, in coordination with NYSERDA, included EmPower+ customer referral profile analyses and surveys of EmPower+ referral customers and contractors. Examples of utility specific initiatives include social media and text message campaigns by National Grid, and food bank outreach by NYSEG RG&E.

National Grid launched a continuous monthly text messaging campaign in October 2023, as part of the outreach strategy for increasing customer participation in the Empower+ program and raising the conversion rate of utility referrals. Each month, customers that are part of that particular month's referral batch receive a pre-emptive text message from the company, typically on the 2nd Wednesday of the month. The main underlying assumption is that the customers are not familiar with the program and as a result are invited to find out more on the National Grid dedicated webpage for the Empower+ program. While there, the customers can familiarize themselves with high level key program facts, offerings, benefits, and requirements and then click on the *Apply Now* button to proceed to NYSERDA's online registration to complete the application.

Once NYSERDA processes National Grid's monthly referral batch, they send out a paper application in the mail which usually arrives a week or two after National Grid's pre-emptive text and serves as a second touch point with the customer.

The following month, at the same time as the new monthly referral batch customers are receiving the pre-emptive text, last month’s batch of customers receive a follow-up text message that serves as a reminder with the call to action to directly apply into Empower+ program via NYSERDA’s webpage and completes a third touch point with the customer.

Finally, customers without active cell phones on file, receive a quarterly email if one is available, otherwise a mailed postcard. This way all referrals get at least one piece of outreach marketing collateral.

While it is fairly early to assess the exact impact of this strategy on the utility referrals conversion rate, the overall awareness of the program is certainly increasing as all referrals are receiving outreach. National Grid plans to continue this strategy into the foreseeable future, to evaluate and refine messaging to ultimately increase participation in the Empower+ program.

In addition, National Grid has successfully leveraged the text messaging strategy in the KEDLI Gas Foodbank program to distribute the clean and tune vouchers for natural gas heating equipment, as was outlined in detail in National Grid’s portion of the Section 10.4.1 above.

10.5 Program Implementation Milestones

10.5.1 LMI Portfolio Marketing

2023 Milestone from 2022 Implementation Plan	Status
<p>NY Energy Advisor:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Review NY Energy Advisor analytics determining effectiveness of marketing campaigns Make adjustment to paid media campaigns if needed Continue to support the Program Administrators and stakeholders' efforts to obtain earned media 	In Progress

10.5.2 Community-Based Outreach, Education, and Engagement Partnerships

2023 Milestone from 2022 Implementation Plan	Status
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Regional Clean Energy Hubs fully in market and working with local communities to support and streamline program engagement 	Complete

10.6 Budgets, Targets, and Metrics

Direct Savings

Metric	2023 Achieved	2022 Implementation Plan Projection	2023 Achieved to 2022 Implementation Plan Projection Variance	2020 - 2023 Achieved	Implementation Plan Projection (Utilities 2020-2025; NYSERDA 2020-2030)	% Achieved 2020-2023 to Implementation Plan Projection
Total Budget Spend	\$8,583,597	\$16,084,354	-\$7,500,756	\$17,910,973	\$69,921,395	26%
MWh Annual	35,994	11,948	24,045	110,845	104,698	106%
MWh Lifetime	499,026	141,912	357,114	1,172,634	1,114,509	105%
MMBtu Annual	68,065	18,490	49,576	112,028	79,570	141%
MMBtu Lifetime	674,288	24,713	649,575	904,962	400,624	226%
Participants	427,162	198,048	229,114	1,340,354	1,464,430	92%
Leveraged Funds	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$3,055,714	\$3,055,714	100%

10.7 Findings & Planned Improvements

Looking ahead, the 2024 Marketing Plan relaunched in January 2024 and will continue to optimize throughout the year. The Program Administrators are working to determine additional channels that can be added to continue the momentum NY Energy Advisor has seen thus far. The Program Administrators are also working to increase the use of Spanish-language assets as user insights have informed us that the Spanish-language audience tends to engage at a higher rate. In addition, the website is available in 22 languages, as well as the website self-translating in Russian, Spanish, and Chinese for those who are clicking on ads that are served in those languages. This lends to a better user experience and makes the site more accessible to those who may not have English as a first language.

Orange and Rockland have found that the costs associated with the EmPower+ program are running higher than planned, and in order to balance the portfolio, plan to grow Customer Engagement Programs. These plans include continuing our previous community-based customer initiatives with the local food banks and including gas savings kits in the future.

National Grid found success expanding their offering to Albany and Syracuse and with collaborating with NYSEG R&GE in neighboring territories. National Grid plans to continue this initiative in 2024 and consider if there are any other energy savings measures that make sense to be offered within this initiative. Also, in 2024 National Grid is exploring expanding this initiative's reach into Goodwill's and Habitat for Humanity organizations in the service territory.

National Grid has found text messaging to be an effective medium of outreach and plans to continue utilizing text messaging in promoting energy efficiency programs. Initial results of the Empower+ text messaging campaign suggest an additional 1.25% increase to the current conversion rate of customers referred to completed applications. Furthermore, this campaign may impact the completion of paper applications sent by NYSERDA, but empirical evidence is still being explored. National Grid anticipates that overall awareness of the program has increased due to most referrals by the Company now being accompanied by text messages before and after receiving a paper application.

11. Evaluation, Measurement, and Verification

11.1 Evaluation, Measurement, and Verification Summary

Consistent with the Coordination Plan and the Approval Letter⁶⁰, the Program Administrators initially filed VGS Specifications for the Statewide LMI Portfolio in December 2020 for the following initiatives:

- Existing 1-4 Family Homes
- Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings
- Affordable New Construction
- Additional LMI Initiatives⁶¹

Throughout 2023, the Program Administrators' EM&V experts continued to coordinate on EM&V topics, including with DPS Staff. This work contributed to revisions to the VGS Specifications, filed on November 1, 2023.⁶² VGS Specifications filings include the name and description of each initiative, gross savings methodology, realization rates, planned VGS approach, and an indication of whether the initiative had an exemption status from a utility's earnings adjustment mechanism ("EAM").⁶³ Aside from the updates to the VGS Specifications, key EM&V activity from 2023 includes the following:

- An evaluation of the EmPower+ program continued through 2023 and is on track to be completed by end of 2024.
- The Program Administrators will be evaluating AMEEP with a joint, statewide evaluation, beginning with the 2022 program year. As of the end of 2023, the Program Administrators are in the midst of awarding a vendor for this work and moving through the procurement process.
- Con Edison conducted an impact and process evaluation of their Efficiency Starter program and completed a final report in Q4 2023. The evaluation study period was from program launch in Program Year ("PY") 2020 through PY2022. Verified gross savings realization rates (VGS RRs) were established through the evaluation activities that included a review of database tracking spreadsheets, assessing other similar programs through a literature review, and conducting participant surveys. The resulting evaluation established new verified gross savings realization rates (VGS RRs) for electric, gas, and lifetime acquired savings beginning PY2020.
- In Q4 2023. The evaluation study period was from program launch in PY2020 through PY2022. New Construction program impacts underwent a Gross Savings Analysis for the program period 2017-2020. A contractor was procured by NYSERDA in Q1 2021 to perform this analysis. Details related to the Gross Savings Analysis methodology were submitted in an EM&V Plan filed in Q3 2021. Results of the single-family analysis were complete in Q2 2023 and filed in Q3 2023.

⁶⁰ Guidance was provided to the Program Administrators regarding the filing of VGS Specification in the DPS Staff letter approving the 2020 Implementation Plan. NE: NY Proceeding, "Statewide LMI Implementation Plan Approval Letter," (Filed September 14, 2020) ("Approval Letter"),

⁶¹ The initial VGS Specifications were filed in December 2020. NE: NY Proceeding, "Consolidated LMI VGS Specifications." (Filed December 14, 2020). Updated VGS Specifications were filed with the revised Implementation Plan filing on Nov. 1, 2023.

⁶² NE: NY Proceeding, "Consolidated LMI VGS Specifications." (Filed November 1, 2023).

⁶³ See, Clean Energy Guidance CE-08: Gross Savings Verification Guidance (issued August 23, 2019)

11.2 Program Implementation Milestones

In 2023, the Program Administrators achieved the following implementation milestones, as outlined in the 2022 Implementation Plan.

2023 Milestone from 2022 Implementation Plan	Status
<ul style="list-style-type: none">Develop the workplan and conduct statewide evaluation for AMEEP, as operated in 2022	In Progress
<ul style="list-style-type: none">Begin EmPower+ evaluation process	In Progress

11.3 Budgets, Targets, and Metrics

Budgets, targets, and metrics related to Portfolio EM&V for each Program Administrator can be found in [Appendix A](#). NYSERDA currently manages and reports Administration, EM&V, and NYS Cost Recovery Fees at a broader CEF portfolio level. To ensure that LMI spend and impact can be assessed comprehensively, DPS has established the following LMI allocations for these costs: Administration + EM&V: 27%; Market Development Cost Recovery Fee: 26%.

The percentage of gross savings verified in the LMI Portfolio is as follows:

Metric	Percent of Gross Savings Verified
Direct Annual Gross MWh Savings	19%
Direct Annual Gross MMBtu Savings	77%

11.4 Findings & Planned Improvements

Going forward into 2024, the EM&V subcommittee plans to continue work in developing evaluations for AMEEP and EmPower+, along with continuing their routine activities.

12. Appendix A: Achievement to Budgets and Targets by Program Administrator⁶⁴

12.1 Central Hudson

Electric Budget						
	2023 Spend	2022 Implementation Plan Projection	2023 Spend to 2022 Implementation Plan Projection Variance	2020 - 2023 Spend	2020 - 2025 Implementation Plan Projection	% Achieved to Implementation Plan Projection
Existing 1-4 Family Homes						
Incentives & Services	\$80,770	\$80,403	\$367	\$161,724	\$432,641	37%
Program Implementation	\$17,379	\$10,308	\$7,071	\$24,585	\$52,294	47%
Total Budget	\$98,149	\$90,711	\$7,438	\$186,309	\$484,935	38%
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings						
Incentives & Services	\$0	\$44,711	-\$44,711	\$0	\$175,634	0%
Program Implementation	\$0	\$12,250	-\$12,250	\$0	\$48,119	0%
Total Budget	\$0	\$56,961	-\$56,961	\$0	\$223,753	0%
Affordable New Construction						
Incentives & Services	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Program Implementation	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Total Budget	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement						
Incentives & Services	\$0	\$1,735	-\$1,735	\$0	\$5,205	0%
Program Implementation	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Total Budget	\$0	\$1,735	-\$1,735	\$0	\$5,205	0%
Portfolio Administration	\$0	\$16,493	-\$16,493	\$0	\$58,663	0%
Portfolio EM&V	\$0	\$8,825	-\$8,825	\$0	\$34,966	0%
Total Portfolio Budget	\$98,149	\$174,726	-\$76,576	\$186,309	\$807,522	23%

⁶⁴ Please note descriptions of variance between Implementation Plan budgets and targets and Ordered budgets and targets may be found in the 2022 Implementation Plan, pp. 17-20.

Gas Budget						
	2023 Spend	2022 Implementation Plan Projection	2023 Spend to 2022 Implementation Plan Projection Variance	2020 - 2023 Spend	2020 - 2025 Implementation Plan Projection	% Achieved to Implementation Plan Projection
Existing 1-4 Family Homes						
Incentives & Services	\$239,957	\$184,660	\$55,297	\$457,521	\$904,425	51%
Program Implementation	\$45,375	\$23,674	\$21,701	\$66,897	\$109,581	61%
Total Budget	\$285,332	\$208,335	\$76,998	\$524,418	\$1,014,005	52%
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings						
Incentives & Services	\$7,500	\$260,100	-\$252,600	\$7,500	\$1,054,980	1%
Program Implementation	\$730	\$40,460	-\$39,730	\$730	\$164,108	0%
Total Budget	\$8,230	\$300,560	-\$292,330	\$8,230	\$1,219,088	1%
Affordable New Construction						
Incentives & Services	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Program Implementation	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Total Budget	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement						
Incentives & Services	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Program Implementation	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Total Budget	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Portfolio Administration	\$0	\$28,523	-\$28,523	\$0	\$97,337	0%
Portfolio EM&V	\$0	\$20,884	-\$20,884	\$0	\$78,977	0%
Total Portfolio Budget	\$293,562	\$558,302	-\$264,740	\$532,648	\$2,409,407	22%

Electric Savings (MWh)						
	2023 Savings	2022 Implementation Plan Projection	2023 Savings to 2022 Implementation Plan Projection Variance	2020-2023 Savings	2020-2025 Implementation Plan Projection	% Achieved to Implementation Plan Projection
Existing 1-4 Family Homes	40	49	(10)	90	266	34%
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings	-	71	(71)	-	281	0%
Affordable New Construction	-	-	-	-	-	N/A
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement	148	273	(125)	752	1,424	53%
Total	188	394	(206)	842	1,972	43%

Gas Savings (MMBtu)						
	2023 Savings	2022 Implementation Plan Projection	2023 Savings to 2022 Implementation Plan Projection Variance	2020-2023 Savings	2020-2025 Implementation Plan Projection	% Achieved to Implementation Plan Projection
Existing 1-4 Family Homes	529	631	(102)	1,171	2,983	39%
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings	52	2,023	(1,971)	52	8,206	1%
Affordable New Construction	-	-	-	-	-	N/A
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement	-	-	-	-	-	N/A
Total	581	2,654	(2,073)	581	11,189	5%

Implementation Plan Projections vs. NE: NY Ordered Budgets & Targets

Electric	2020-2025 Electric Budget	2020-2025 Target (MWh)
LMI Implementation Plan	807,522	1,972
NENY Order(s)	910,438	1,579
Difference	(102,916)	393
Difference (%)	-12%	22%

Gas	2020-2025 Gas Budget	2020-2025 Target (MMBtu)
LMI Implementation Plan	2,409,407	11,189
NENY Order(s)	2,124,356	19,667
Difference	285,051	(8,478)
Difference (%)	13%	-55%

Significant 2023 Expenditures and Achievement Variance Relative to Implementation Plan Budgets & Targets Explanation

Existing 1-4 Family Homes:

During 2023, most of Central Hudson's LMI budgets for both electric and gas were invested in EmPower NY. The Program unit costs of EmPower NY have run 4x higher than Ordered unit costs, resulting in a savings shortfall.

Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings:

Central Hudson has seen low participation in the Affordable Multifamily Energy Efficiency Program (AMEEP).

Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement:

The Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement category, which includes the food banks and kits programs, scaled down in 2023 from prior years however still supported an overachievement of electric savings relative to the NENY Order target due to the success of the Community Lighting Program.

12.2 Consolidated Edison

Electric Budget						
	2023 Spend	2022 Implementation Plan Projection	2023 Spend to 2022 Implementation Plan Projection Variance	2020 - 2023 Spend	2020 - 2025 Implementation Plan Projection	% Achieved to Implementation Plan Projection
Existing 1-4 Family Homes						
Incentives & Services	\$0	\$265,200	-\$265,200	\$733,200	\$1,279,200	57%
Program Implementation	\$0	\$34,000	-\$34,000	\$94,000	\$164,000	57%
Total Budget	\$0	\$299,200	-\$299,200	\$827,200	\$1,443,200	57%
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings						
Incentives & Services	\$2,143,736	\$4,730,122	-\$2,586,387	\$11,072,947	\$26,892,452	41%
Program Implementation	\$414,100	\$575,437	-\$161,337	\$1,735,506	\$3,345,234	52%
Total Budget	\$2,557,836	\$5,305,559	-\$2,747,724	\$12,808,453	\$30,237,686	42%
Affordable New Construction						
Incentives & Services	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Program Implementation	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Total Budget	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement						
Incentives & Services	\$576,435	\$761,676	-\$185,241	\$2,091,212	\$4,101,833	51%
Program Implementation	\$394,655	\$330,361	\$64,294	\$1,966,594	\$2,399,711	82%
Total Budget	\$971,090	\$1,092,037	-\$120,947	\$4,057,806	\$6,501,544	62%
Portfolio Administration	\$91,108	\$834,330	-\$743,223	\$1,483,893	\$4,087,833	36%
Portfolio EM&V	\$165,035	\$173,348	-\$8,313	\$792,334	\$1,111,624	71%
Total Portfolio Budget	\$3,785,068	\$7,704,474	-\$3,919,406	\$19,969,687	\$43,381,887	46%

Gas Budget						
	2023 Spend	2022 Implementation Plan Projection	2023 Spend to 2022 Implementation Plan Projection Variance	2020 - 2023 Spend	2020 - 2025 Implementation Plan Projection	% Achieved to Implementation Plan Projection
Existing 1-4 Family Homes						
Incentives & Services	\$0	\$853,125	-\$853,125	\$2,388,750	\$3,935,039	61%
Program Implementation	\$0	\$109,375	-\$109,375	\$306,250	\$504,492	61%
Total Budget	\$0	\$962,500	-\$962,500	\$2,695,000	\$4,439,531	61%
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings						
Incentives & Services	\$31,751,665	\$20,407,761	\$11,343,903	\$63,790,112	\$101,993,023	63%
Program Implementation	\$3,146,875	\$4,163,266	-\$1,016,390	\$9,702,687	\$20,629,824	47%
Total Budget	\$34,898,540	\$24,571,027	\$10,327,513	\$73,492,798	\$122,622,847	60%
Affordable New Construction						
Incentives & Services	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Program Implementation	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Total Budget	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement						
Incentives & Services	\$447,898	\$26,512	\$421,386	\$805,239	\$421,977	191%
Program Implementation	\$130,454	\$17,339	\$113,115	\$627,186	\$537,352	117%
Total Budget	\$578,353	\$43,851	\$534,501	\$1,432,425	\$959,329	149%
Portfolio Administration	\$263,207	\$636,376	-\$373,168	\$2,165,674	\$3,311,316	65%
Portfolio EM&V	\$526,160	\$634,303	-\$108,143	\$1,745,904	\$2,966,351	59%
Total Portfolio Budget	\$36,266,260	\$26,848,057	\$9,418,203	\$81,531,800	\$134,299,375	61%

Electric Savings (MWh)						
	2023 Savings	2022 Implementation Plan Projection	2023 Savings to 2022 Implementation Plan Projection Variance	2020-2023 Savings	2020-2025 Implementation Plan Projection	% Achieved to Implementation Plan Projection
Existing 1-4 Family Homes	105	185	(80)	224	874	26%
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings	7,158	7,105	53	21,560	34,817	62%
Affordable New Construction	-	-	-	-	-	N/A
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement	20,743	5,830	14,913	76,207	71,243	107%
Total	28,007	13,121	14,886	97,992	106,935	92%

Gas Savings (MMBtu)						
	2023 Savings	2022 Implementation Plan Projection	2023 Savings to 2022 Implementation Plan Projection Variance	2020-2023 Savings	2020-2025 Implementation Plan Projection	% Achieved to Implementation Plan Projection
Existing 1-4 Family Homes	4,106	3,314	791	6,358	15,398	41%
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings	347,118	226,283	120,835	959,699	1,171,356	82%
Affordable New Construction	-	-	-	-	-	N/A
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement	21,112	1,210	19,903	62,072	36,675	169%
Total	372,336	230,807	141,530	1,028,129	1,223,429	84%

Implementation Plan Projections vs. NE: NY Ordered Budgets & Targets

Electric	2020-2025 Electric Budget	2020-2025 Target (MWh)
LMI Implementation Plan	43,381,887	106,935
NENY Order(s)	61,649,935	106,935
Difference	(18,268,048)	(0)
Difference (%)	-35%	0%

Gas	2020-2025 Gas Budget	2020-2025 Target (MMBtu)
LMI Implementation Plan	134,299,375	1,223,429
NENY Order(s)	116,031,327	1,074,165
Difference	18,268,048	149,264
Difference (%)	15%	13%

Significant 2023 Expenditures and Achievement Variance Relative to Implementation Plan Budgets & Targets Explanation

At a portfolio level in 2023, Con Edison's electric expenditures were 50% lower and gas expenditures were 35% higher than planned values from the Statewide Low- to Moderate-Income Implementation Plan (LMI IP) filed in June 2023. Savings for both commodities were higher than planned. The savings variance is the result of AMEEP, which remained unevaluated in 2023. Con Edison ("Company") reports unevaluated savings in gross, consistent with the blended savings methodology applied throughout this report. The Company applies a 70% placeholder realization rate ("RR") to unevaluated, planned savings in the LMI IP. When applying the 70% placeholder RR to unevaluated gross AMEEP savings, total savings exceed planned values by 97% for electric and 17% for gas. The increased savings are also attributed to moving the Smart Kids educational kit program from the non-LMI to LMI portfolio in Fall 2023, as well as increased lightbulb distribution through Con Edison's Food Banks program (formally known as Retail Lighting LMI).

For the multifamily category, the Company underspent electric funds and overspent gas funds while exceeding planned savings targets. When applying the 70% placeholder RR, the Company underachieved for electric and overachieved for gas. The primary driver behind this variance was a significant uptick in projects installing building envelope measures. Lighting continued to represent the largest share of electric savings, with building envelope savings representing the next largest portion. Building envelope savings similarly represented an outsized portion of overall gas savings. Additionally, the Company completed twenty-one AMEEP Comprehensive projects in 2023.

For the Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement category—which includes Con Edison's Food Banks, Efficiency Starter, and Smart Kids programs—the Company exceeded expectations. The Company acquired more electric savings than planned through the Smart Kids and Food Banks programs, as mentioned above, however, expenditures appear lower due to the distribution of funds at year end (cash accounting). The Company overspent on gas and exceeded gas savings expectations due to the addition of Smart Kids.

For the 1-4 Family Homes category, EmPower+ savings for electric were lower, and gas savings were higher than planned. In January 2024, Con Edison paid NYSERDA \$1,958,942 for 2024 EmPower+ and Energy Advisor costs. As a result, these costs are not reflected as planned EmPower+ and administration expenditures for 2023. The Company paid the 2023 EmPower+ budget in 2022, as reflected in the 2022 Statewide LMI Annual Report. As a result of the January 2024 EmPower+ payment and an underspend in marketing and strategy, the Company overestimated administration expenditure for 2023.

12.3 KEDLI

Gas Budget						
	2023 Spend	2022 Implementation Plan Projection	2023 Spend to 2022 Implementation Plan Projection Variance	2020 - 2023 Spend	2020 - 2025 Implementation Plan Projection	% Achieved to Implementation Plan Projection
Existing 1-4 Family Homes						
Incentives & Services	\$5,963,087	\$3,277,744	\$2,685,343	\$11,818,879	\$17,326,774	68%
Program Implementation	\$889,467	\$1,007,685	-\$118,218	\$2,198,818	\$4,952,406	44%
Total Budget	\$6,852,554	\$4,285,429	\$2,567,125	\$14,017,697	\$22,279,180	63%
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings						
Incentives & Services	\$79,040	\$899,500	-\$820,460	\$79,040	\$3,104,700	3%
Program Implementation	\$0	\$321,250	-\$321,250	\$0	\$1,108,821	0%
Total Budget	\$79,040	\$1,220,750	-\$1,141,710	\$79,040	\$4,213,521	2%
Affordable New Construction						
Incentives & Services	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Program Implementation	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Total Budget	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement						
Incentives & Services	\$125,896	\$558,275	-\$432,379	\$125,896	\$1,383,275	9%
Program Implementation	\$135,074	\$461,423	-\$326,349	\$205,793	\$1,334,362	15%
Total Budget	\$260,970	\$1,019,698	-\$758,728	\$331,689	\$2,717,637	12%
Portfolio Administration	\$1,222	\$48,259	-\$47,037	\$27,620	\$179,317	15%
Portfolio EM&V	\$29	\$198,746	-\$198,717	\$8,137	\$711,476	1%
Total Portfolio Budget	\$7,193,814	\$6,772,882	\$420,932	\$14,464,183	\$30,101,131	48%

Gas Savings (MMBtu)						
	2023 Savings	2022 Implementation Plan Projection	2023 Savings to 2022 Implementation Plan Projection Variance	2020-2023 Savings	2020-2025 Implementation Plan Projection	% Achieved to Implementation Plan Projection
Existing 1-4 Family Homes	20,201	23,268	(3,067)	51,731	115,650	45%
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings	623	5,997	(5,374)	623	20,698	3%
Affordable New Construction	-	-	-	-	-	N/A
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement	812	7,617	(6,805)	812	18,873	4%
Total	21,636	36,882	(15,246)	53,166	155,221	34%

Implementation Plan Projections vs. NE: NY Ordered Budgets & Targets

Gas	2020-2025 Gas Budget	2020-2025 Target (MMBtu)
LMI Implementation Plan	30,101,131	155,221
NENY Order(s)	30,101,131	278,667
Rate Case	10,000,000	92,580
Difference	(10,000,000)	(216,026)
Difference (%)	-28%	-82%

Significant 2023 Expenditures and Achievement Variance Relative to Implementation Plan Budgets & Targets Explanation

In the KEDLI service territory, the KEDLI HEAT program (1-4 Family Homes) overspent and underachieved program year 2023 plans from the 2022 Implementation Plan. While KEDLI HEAT continues to grow in terms of outreach strategies to customers, ultimately fewer customers were served through the program than planned. KEDLI HEAT had fewer participants in 2023 than in 2022 and a higher average project cost, leading to less energy savings realized and a higher program spend. A contributing factor to this dynamic is that although budgets increased in 2023 compared to 2022, the unit cost increased at a rate higher than the budget increase. Also, restrictions from the COVID-19 pandemic were lifted in 2022, allowing a backlog of customers to be served by the program. Finally, the Weatherization Health & Safety Pilot ran primarily in program year 2022. This pilot enabled more customers to participate in the KEDLI HEAT program as their health and safety barriers were removed.

In Existing Affordable Multifamily, AMEEP underspent and underachieved the planned 2023 budget and target. The program saw its first completed projects this year due to the outreach provided by the implementation contractor. While the implementation contractor continues to do direct and

targeted outreach to stakeholders in KEDLI, AMEEP has struggled to build a significant pipeline, especially when compared to National Grid's other Downstate NY territory, KEDNY. This is due in part to the KEDLI service territory having one tenth of the multifamily coded accounts that KEDNY does; a smaller potential for multifamily energy efficiency projects. The pipeline of projects in AMEEP in KEDLI continues to grow, however more will be needed to reach energy savings targets. In 2024 National Grid plans to continue direct and target outreach to stakeholders such as property managers and owners, community boards, and contractors as well as build a relationship between multifamily offerings at PSEG LI and National Grid's AMEEP program to spur further program activity.

The Customer Awareness, Outreach, & Engagement category reflects underspend and underachievement of target for 2023 compared to the 2022 Implementation Plan. The spend reflected represents funds paid to NYSERDA to support the implementation of the Energy Advisor website as well as a new initiative to spur interest in energy efficiency. This initiative, the KEDLI Gas Foodbank program, is described above in section 10.3. The KEDLI Gas Foodbank program experienced a slow ramp up in 2023, causing the underspend and underachievement of 2023 plans from the 2022 Plan. More than half of this initiative's planned projects will be realized in Q1 2024.

12.4 KEDNY

Gas Budget						
	2023 Spend	2022 Implementation Plan Projection	2023 Spend to 2022 Implementation Plan Projection Variance	2020 - 2023 Spend	2020 - 2025 Implementation Plan Projection	% Achieved to Implementation Plan Projection
Existing 1-4 Family Homes						
Incentives & Services	\$399,191	\$399,218	-\$27	\$1,299,192	\$2,302,212	56%
Program Implementation	\$8,120	\$164,918	-\$156,798	\$92,736	\$663,876	14%
Total Budget	\$407,311	\$564,136	-\$156,825	\$1,391,928	\$2,966,088	47%
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings						
Incentives & Services	\$2,771,117	\$4,044,381	-\$1,273,264	\$3,112,003	\$14,625,375	21%
Program Implementation	\$146,406	\$1,159,389	-\$1,012,983	\$146,406	\$4,094,886	4%
Total Budget	\$2,917,523	\$5,203,770	-\$2,286,247	\$3,258,410	\$18,720,261	17%
Affordable New Construction						
Incentives & Services	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Program Implementation	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Total Budget	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement						
Incentives & Services	\$0	\$230,400	-\$230,400	\$0	\$806,400	0%
Program Implementation	\$48,058	\$107,458	-\$59,400	\$131,873	\$409,760	32%
Total Budget	\$48,058	\$337,858	-\$289,800	\$131,873	\$1,216,160	11%
Portfolio Administration	\$0	\$81,126	-\$81,126	\$84,616	\$759,189	11%
Portfolio EM&V	\$34	\$184,030	-\$183,996	\$84,650	\$734,077	12%
Total Portfolio Budget	\$3,372,927	\$6,370,920	-\$2,997,993	\$4,951,477	\$24,395,776	20%

Gas Savings (MMBtu)						
	2023 Savings	2022 Implementation Plan Projection	2023 Savings to 2022 Implementation Plan Projection Variance	2020-2023 Savings	2020-2025 Implementation Plan Projection	% Achieved to Implementation Plan Projection
Existing 1-4 Family Homes	1,884	1,551	333	5,604	9,167	61%
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings	29,914	29,037	877	33,274	114,606	29%
Affordable New Construction	-	-	-	-	-	N/A
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement	-	-	-	-	-	N/A
Total	31,799	30,588	1,211	38,878	123,773	31%

Implementation Plan Projections vs. NE: NY Ordered Budgets & Targets

Gas	2020-2025 Gas Budget	2020-2025 Target (MMBtu)
LMI Implementation Plan	24,395,776	123,773
NENY Order(s)	24,395,776	225,844
Difference	(0)	(102,071)
Difference (%)	0%	-58%

Significant 2023 Expenditures and Achievement Variance Relative to Implementation Plan Budgets & Targets Explanation

In the KEDNY territory, the 1-4 Family Program over-achieved their 2023 savings target from the Implementation Plan. For this program, National Grid provides funding to NYSERDA's Empower+ program to fund projects within the service territory and claim the associated savings.

For Existing Affordable Multifamily, AMEEP 2023 actuals reflect underspend and slight overachievement from the 2022 Implementation Plan. AMEEP built a significant pipeline of projects during the first full year the program was in market and many of those projects were completed in 2023. Most of the projects that were completed were lower unit cost, non-comprehensive projects with measures like energy management systems and pipe insulation. In 2024 and 2025 AMEEP anticipates higher unit cost projects such as comprehensive and non-comprehensive projects upgrading envelope measures.

The Customer Awareness, Outreach, & Engagement category reflects underspend for 2023. The spend reflected represents funds paid to NYSERDA to support the implementation of the Energy Advisor website. The remaining underspend is due to a slow ramp up in the launch of an additional customer outreach initiative. The spend for this initiative will be realized and reflected in 2024 program activity.

12.5 National Fuel Gas Distribution Company

Gas Budget						
	2023 Spend	2022 Implementation Plan Projection	2023 Spend to 2022 Implementation Plan Projection Variance	2020 - 2023 Spend	2020 - 2025 Implementation Plan Projection	% Achieved to Implementation Plan Projection
Existing 1-4 Family Homes						
Incentives & Services	\$4,909,502	\$4,903,523	\$5,979	\$21,671,236	\$31,116,438	70%
Program Implementation	\$1,066,501	\$896,606	\$169,895	\$1,783,844	\$3,365,136	53%
Total Budget	\$5,976,002	\$5,800,129	\$175,874	\$23,455,080	\$34,477,974	68%
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings						
Incentives & Services	\$4,689	\$405,841	-\$401,152	\$4,689	\$1,477,172	0%
Program Implementation	\$17,041	\$102,163	-\$85,122	\$20,641	\$380,522	5%
Total Budget	\$21,730	\$508,004	-\$486,274	\$25,330	\$1,857,694	1%
Affordable New Construction						
Incentives & Services	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Program Implementation	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Total Budget	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement						
Incentives & Services	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Program Implementation	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Total Budget	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Portfolio Administration	\$543,081	\$556,323	-\$13,242	\$920,316	\$1,637,046	56%
Portfolio EM&V	\$0	\$178,982	-\$178,982	\$0	\$523,258	0%
Total Portfolio Budget	\$6,540,813	\$7,043,437	-\$502,624	\$24,400,726	\$38,495,972	63%

Gas Savings (MMBtu)						
	2023 Savings	2022 Implementation Plan Projection	2023 Savings to 2022 Implementation Plan Projection Variance	2020-2023 Savings	2020-2025 Implementation Plan Projection	% Achieved to Implementation Plan Projection
Existing 1-4 Family Homes	13,122	47,169	(34,047)	65,537	247,517	26%
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings	161	7,288	(7,127)	161	31,310	1%
Affordable New Construction	-	-	-	-	-	N/A
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement	-	-	-	-	-	N/A
Total	13,282	54,457	(41,175)	65,698	278,827	24%

Implementation Plan Projections vs. NE: NY Ordered Budgets & Targets

Gas	2020-2025 Gas Budget	2020-2025 Target (MMBtu)
LMI Implementation Plan	38,495,972	278,827
NENY Order(s)	42,130,455	409,257
Difference	(3,634,483)	(130,430)
Difference (%)	-9%	-38%

Significant 2023 Expenditures and Achievement Variance Relative to Implementation Plan Budgets & Targets Explanation

In 2023, most of National Fuel Gas Distribution Corporation’s (NFGDC) LMI budget was invested in EmPower. Program unit costs of EmPower have been higher than ordered unit costs, resulting in a savings shortfall. The shortfall to the Affordable Multifamily Energy Efficiency Program (AMEEP) was due to no comprehensive and non-comprehensive projects coming to fruition in 2023. Additionally, NFGDC recorded no EM&V in the program year 2023.

12.6 New York State Energy Research & Development Authority

CEF Budget						
	2023 Spend	2022 Implementation Plan Projection	2023 Spend to 2022 Implementation Plan Projection Variance	2020 - 2023 Spend	2020 - 2030 Implementation Plan Projection	% Achieved to Implementation Plan Projection
Existing 1-4 Family Homes						
Incentives & Services	\$15,998,091	\$15,035,785	\$962,307	\$179,356,805	\$182,370,372	98%
Program Implementation	\$6,642,044	\$6,352,261	\$289,783	\$29,274,889	\$33,686,881	87%
Research and Technology Studies	\$0	\$275,000	-\$275,000	\$0	\$350,000	0%
Tools, Training, and Replication	\$14,167	\$353,833	-\$339,667	\$42,500	\$473,000	9%
Business Support	\$265,349	\$150,000	\$115,349	\$314,781	\$150,000	210%
Total Budget	\$22,919,651	\$22,166,879	\$752,772	\$208,988,975	\$217,030,253	96%
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings						
Incentives & Services	\$11,583,156	\$13,577,810	-\$1,994,654	\$30,782,220	\$150,106,527	21%
Program Implementation	\$1,476,609	\$3,004,412	-\$1,527,802	\$7,285,441	\$20,289,484	36%
Research and Technology Studies	\$52,737	\$1,513,535	-\$1,460,798	\$58,711	\$10,136,866	1%
Tools, Training, and Replication	\$796,186	\$0	\$796,186	\$1,900,804	\$3,000,000	63%
Total Budget	\$13,908,688	\$18,095,757	-\$4,187,068	\$40,027,175	\$183,532,877	22%
Affordable New Construction						
Incentives & Services	\$17,453,126	\$5,550,000	\$11,903,126	\$43,553,766	\$135,132,096	32%
Program Implementation	\$678,738	\$469,699	\$209,039	\$2,931,579	\$3,706,312	79%
Tools, Training, and Replication	\$842,361	\$550,000	\$292,361	\$1,902,670	\$6,480,570	29%
Total Budget	\$18,974,225	\$6,569,699	\$12,404,526	\$48,388,014	\$145,318,979	33%
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement						
Incentives & Services	\$88,667	\$525,000	-\$436,333	\$1,093,017	\$4,052,051	27%
Program Implementation	\$696,055	\$1,618,755	-\$922,701	\$1,675,755	\$7,017,746	24%
Tools, Training, and Replication	\$3,749,775	\$8,722,885	-\$4,973,110	\$5,453,977	\$39,187,114	14%
Total Budget	\$4,534,498	\$10,866,640	-\$6,332,143	\$8,222,749	\$50,256,911	16%
Pilots and Demonstrations						
Program Implementation	\$277,116	\$0	\$277,116	\$746,082	\$0	N/A
Tools, Training, and Replication		\$639,499	-\$639,499		\$2,443,532	
Total Budget	\$277,116	\$639,499	-\$362,383	\$746,082	\$2,443,532	31%
LMI Solar						
Incentives & Services	\$1,202,861	\$1,200,000	\$2,861	\$3,928,801	\$10,962,472	36%
Program Implementation	\$25,677	\$100,000	-\$74,323	\$313,843	\$750,148	42%
Total Budget	\$1,228,538	\$1,300,000	-\$71,462	\$4,242,644	\$11,712,619	36%
Electrification						
Incentives & Services	\$1,223,077	\$4,000,000	-\$2,776,923	\$6,116,662	\$26,654,968	23%
Program Implementation	\$571,112	\$380,000	\$191,112	\$1,685,892	\$2,345,032	72%
Tools, Training, and Replication	\$11,136	\$200,000	-\$188,864	\$63,509	\$1,000,000	6%
Total Budget	\$1,805,326	\$4,580,000	-\$2,774,674	\$7,866,062	\$30,000,000	26%
Heathy Homes VBP						
Incentives & Services	\$97,731	\$116,370	-\$18,638	\$122,025	\$137,248	89%
Program Implementation	\$26,708	\$75,000	-\$48,292	\$175,322	\$365,207	48%
Research and Technology Studies	\$508,766	\$3,621,631	-\$3,112,865	\$2,071,790	\$9,322,232	22%
Total Budget	\$633,205	\$3,813,001	-\$3,179,795	\$2,369,138	\$9,824,687	24%
Total Portfolio Budget	\$64,281,247	\$68,031,474	-\$3,750,227	\$320,850,840	\$650,119,857	49%

Electric Savings (MWh) - Direct						
	2023 Savings	2022 Implementation Plan Projection	2023 Savings to 2022 Implementation Plan Projection Variance	2020-2023 Savings	2020-2030 Implementation Plan Projection	% Achieved to Implementation Plan Projection
Existing 1-4 Family Homes	1,225	1,002	223	11,818	11,894	99%
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings	5,666	5,384	282	24,642	89,199	28%
Affordable New Construction	4,789	3,000	1,789	19,043	88,634	21%
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement	-	-	-	-	-	N/A
Pilots and Demonstrations	-	-	-	-	-	N/A
Healthy Homes VBP	7	150	(143)	8	300	3%
Total	11,687	9,536	2,151	55,512	190,028	29%

Gas Savings (MMBtu) - Direct						
	2023 Savings	2022 Implementation Plan Projection	2023 Savings to 2022 Implementation Plan Projection Variance	2020-2023 Savings	2020-2030 Implementation Plan Projection	% Achieved to Implementation Plan Projection
Existing 1-4 Family Homes	40,042	31,779	8,263	426,343	416,751	102%
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings	135,749	223,301	(87,551)	215,597	2,300,909	9%
Affordable New Construction	52,244	32,150	20,094	209,436	629,468	33%
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement	-	-	-	-	-	N/A
Pilots and Demonstrations	-	-	-	-	-	N/A
Healthy Homes VBP	3	4,100	(4,097)	3	8,200	0%
Total	228,039	291,330	(63,291)	851,380	3,355,328	25%

Other Fuels Savings (MMBtu) - Direct						
	2023 Savings	2022 Implementation Plan Projection	2023 Savings to 2022 Implementation Plan Projection Variance	2020-2023 Savings	2020-2030 Implementation Plan Projection	% Achieved to Implementation Plan Projection
Existing 1-4 Family Homes	21,933	14,851	7,082	223,529	211,833	106%
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings	7,138	74,924	(67,786)	44,759	804,366	6%
Affordable New Construction	525	-	525	2,470	17,789	14%
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement	-	-	-	-	-	N/A
Pilots and Demonstrations	-	-	-	-	-	N/A
Healthy Homes VBP	37	900	(863)	38	1,800	2%
Total	29,633	90,675	(61,042)	270,796	1,035,789	26%

Electric Savings (MWh) - Indirect			
	2020 - 2023 Savings	2020-2030 Implementation Plan Projection	% Achieved to Implementation Plan Projection
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings	-	118,244	0%
Affordable New Construction	31,935	18,757	170%
Healthy Homes VBP	-	28,000	0%
Total	31,935	165,001	19%

Gas Savings (MMBtu) - Indirect			
	2020 - 2023 Savings	2020-2030 Implementation Plan Projection	% Achieved to Implementation Plan Projection
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings	-	2,495,907	0%
Affordable New Construction	283,441	106,563	266%
Healthy Homes VBP	-	748,000	0%
Total	283,441	3,350,470	8%

Significant 2023 Expenditures and Achievement Variance Relative to Implementation Plan Budgets & Targets Explanation

In 2023, NYSERDA made significant investments in the LMI sector through existing program delivery, new initiative development, and in cultivating long-term partnerships that will help accelerate the adoption of efficiency and electrification in the long term. Variances from the 2023 implementation plan are addressed below and will be reflected in the next LMI Implementation Plan.

As noted in [Section 4.1.1](#), the EmPower+ programs continued to experience significant demand in 2023. The program collectively administered over \$153M in incentives to serve nearly 22,700 homes. NYSERDA has entered into agreements with each utility to administer utility funding through EmPower+. Additionally, NYSERDA leveraged other funding sources including federal HEAP, NY State Legislature 2023 budget, RGGI to serve low-income customers through the EmPower+ program infrastructure.

The Existing Affordable Multifamily program (MPP) exceeded its electric MWh planned targets but fell short on achieving its MMBTU and Expenditures planned targets from the implementation plan. The MPP Program closed to new applications in 2022 and on June 30th 2023, reached its deadline for “P1 – Workslope development” stage approvals. As a result, some projects were canceled or transferred to the active AMEEP program. The shortfall in the MMBTU and Expenditures planned targets is driven by the cancelation of many projects that had reached the P1 approved stage including some of the program’s largest projects. These cancelations were due to the following key factors:

- Increased material costs and other inflationary effects from COVID making the scopes no longer affordable
- Reduced scope of works resulting in program required minimum savings not being met
- Construction delays due workforce or supply chain issues exceeding the programs allowable timelines

The MPP program also performed a refile on its CEF scorecard. This refile was performed due to an issue with the acquired metrics reported not accounting for the percentage of installation for measures. This resulted in a reduction in the acquired savings and leveraged funds, also contributing to the shortfalls above.

The Affordable New Construction program achieved significant expenditure and electric savings achievement relative to Implementation Plan budgets and targets due to the strong response to the HCR Clean Energy Incentive solicitations in 2022 and 2023, expending nearly \$8M of new construction incentives reserved for the program. Additionally, several affordable projects participating in NYSERDA's New Construction Housing program progressed through design and construction triggering \$6M of incentive payments for the achievement of those milestones.

As noted in Section 9.1.2, Healthy Homes Pilot field launch was delayed due to complications of the COVID-19 pandemic, which in turn delayed service delivery and associated spending. As the Pilot rolled out, consented referrals NYSERDA received for Pilot services were disproportionately located in multi-family buildings in New York City. Lack of landlord permission to implement the full suite of in-unit intervention measures is a barrier, resulting in smaller project work scopes. To address this barrier, in 2023 and again in 2024, Pilot service areas were expanded to include counties in Central New York and the Hudson Valley, both areas that include higher proportions of single-family homes where larger works scopes are possible.

12.7 New York State Electric & Gas

Electric Budget						
	2023 Spend	2022 Implementation Plan Projection	2023 Spend to 2022 Implementation Plan Projection Variance	2020 - 2023 Spend	2020 - 2025 Implementation Plan Projection	% Achieved to Implementation Plan Projection
Existing 1-4 Family Homes						
Incentives & Services	\$704,337	\$832,799	-\$128,462	\$1,845,496	\$4,803,187	38%
Program Implementation	\$91,103	\$10,524	\$80,579	\$248,283	\$201,970	123%
Tools, Training, and Replication	\$925	\$0	\$925	\$5,000	\$4,074	123%
Total Budget	\$796,365	\$843,323	-\$46,958	\$2,098,778	\$5,009,231	42%
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings						
Incentives & Services	\$247,535	\$369,007	-\$121,472	\$747,711	\$2,529,091	30%
Program Implementation	\$13,036	\$4,831	\$8,205	\$105,693	\$120,362	88%
Tools, Training, and Replication	\$2,099	\$0	\$2,099	\$5,141	\$3,042	169%
Total Budget	\$262,670	\$373,838	-\$111,168	\$858,545	\$2,652,496	32%
Affordable New Construction						
Incentives & Services	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Program Implementation	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Total Budget	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement						
Incentives & Services	\$560,151	\$797,386	-\$237,235	\$919,096	\$1,696,543	54%
Program Implementation	\$265,770	\$11,018	\$254,752	\$418,361	\$171,073	245%
Tools, Training, and Replication	\$21,302	\$0	\$21,302	\$78,977	\$57,674	137%
Total Budget	\$847,223	\$808,404	\$38,819	\$1,416,433	\$1,925,290	74%
Portfolio Administration	\$36,547	\$77,094	-\$40,547	\$109,321	\$321,944	34%
Portfolio EM&V	\$45,680	\$117,801	-\$72,121	\$98,749	\$387,626	25%
Total Portfolio Budget	\$1,988,486	\$2,220,460	-\$231,974	\$4,581,827	\$10,296,587	44%

Gas Budget						
	2023 Spend	2022 Implementation Plan Projection	2023 Spend to 2022 Implementation Plan Projection Variance	2020 - 2023 Spend	2020 - 2025 Implementation Plan Projection	% Achieved to Implementation Plan Projection
Existing 1-4 Family Homes						
Incentives & Services	\$2,360,778	\$1,965,618	\$395,160	\$4,028,790	\$10,322,723	39%
Program Implementation	\$198,437	\$29,964	\$168,473	\$400,560	\$334,102	120%
Tools, Training, and Replication	\$5,569	\$0	\$5,569	\$6,114	\$545	1123%
Total Budget	\$2,564,784	\$1,995,582	\$569,202	\$4,435,464	\$10,657,369	42%
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings						
Incentives & Services	\$138,379	\$626,430	-\$488,051	\$191,623	\$4,868,679	4%
Program Implementation	\$30,077	\$43,351	-\$13,274	\$122,896	\$425,670	29%
Tools, Training, and Replication	\$1,273	\$0	\$1,273	\$2,907	\$1,634	178%
Total Budget	\$169,729	\$669,781	-\$500,052	\$317,426	\$5,295,983	6%
Affordable New Construction						
Incentives & Services	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Program Implementation	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Total Budget	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement						
Incentives & Services	\$199,512	\$611,207	-\$411,695	\$260,020	\$2,007,987	13%
Program Implementation	\$70,123	\$31,733	\$38,390	\$106,053	\$93,811	113%
Tools, Training, and Replication	\$2,643	\$0	\$2,643	\$2,643	\$0	N/A
Total Budget	\$272,279	\$642,940	-\$370,661	\$368,716	\$2,101,798	18%
Portfolio Administration	\$126,313	\$51,098	\$75,215	\$273,012	\$382,227	71%
Portfolio EM&V	\$220	\$86,376	-\$86,156	\$38,005	\$456,645	8%
Total Portfolio Budget	\$3,133,325	\$3,445,777	-\$312,452	\$5,432,623	\$18,894,023	29%

Electric Savings (MWh)						
	2023 Savings	2022 Implementation Plan Projection	2023 Savings to 2022 Implementation Plan Projection Variance	2020-2023 Savings	2020-2025 Implementation Plan Projection	% Achieved to Implementation Plan Projection
Existing 1-4 Family Homes	325	669	(344)	1,180	3,371	35%
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings	694	706	(12)	1,763	6,614	27%
Affordable New Construction	-	-	-	-	-	N/A
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement	8,369	2,798	5,571	14,936	12,861	116%
Total	9,389	4,173	5,216	17,879	22,846	78%

Gas Savings (MMBtu)						
	2023 Savings	2022 Implementation Plan Projection	2023 Savings to 2022 Implementation Plan Projection Variance	2020-2023 Savings	2020-2025 Implementation Plan Projection	% Achieved to Implementation Plan Projection
Existing 1-4 Family Homes	6,822	6,634	188	12,884	34,343	38%
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings	2,831	6,494	(3,663)	4,232	43,549	10%
Affordable New Construction	-	-	-	-	-	N/A
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement	27,724	6,266	21,458	30,221	14,668	206%
Total	37,377	19,394	17,983	47,337	92,560	51%

Implementation Plan Projections vs. NE: NY Ordered Budgets & Targets

Electric	2020-2025 Electric Budget	2020-2025 Target (MWh)
LMI Implementation Plan	10,296,587	22,846
NENY Order(s)	10,296,587	17,862
Difference	(0)	4,984
Difference (%)	0%	24%

Gas	2020-2025 Gas Budget	2020-2025 Target (MMBtu)
LMI Implementation Plan	18,894,023	92,560
NENY Order(s)	18,894,023	174,910
Difference	(0)	(82,350)
Difference (%)	0%	-62%

Significant 2023 Expenditures and Achievement Variance Relative to Implementation Plan Budgets & Targets Explanation

The **1-4 Family Residential program** fully invested all gas funding in 2023 and invested @\$500K above target derived from uninvested 2023 gas funds in the AMEEP program. The energy savings achieved did not align with the original ordered savings targets or planned savings targets. This is due to misalignment of actual costs of the 1-4 family homes program compared to the targeted costs per savings in our orders. It should be noted that the actual costs of 1-4 family program appear to be in alignment with national costs/industry standard. While we plan to maintain full investment of Targeted Ordered Expenditures, the reality of the costs per savings will result in shortfalls on Ordered Savings Targets specific to LMI 1-4 Family.

Specific to **AMEEP**, NYSEG did not meet the 2023 planned expenditures or savings targets, but there was an increase in spend and savings in 2023 vs. 2022. As stated above, we identified mid-year that @\$500K dollars could be repurposed over to Empower+. NYSEG had more participation in the AMEEP programs in 2023 including 1 comprehensive project in Q2. The projects signed and turned around faster from adding on additional project installers. NYSEG also ran an air sealing and insulation promotion in Q3 that peaked the interest of many property managers/owners. Property managers/owners are looking for larger incentives so they can afford the energy efficiency measures for their buildings, such as air sealing and insulation. NYSEG continues to identify and contact LMI multifamily buildings and building owners, using a combination of in-person solicitation, creating relationships with housing authorities, participation in industry events, direct mail, and email campaigns.

Additional uninvested LMI dollars from 2019-2023 were repurposed into supplemental **Customer Awareness and Outreach Engagement programs**. This is done to help cross promote Empower and AMEEP in the community while also helping to offset savings because of low participation in AMEEP and relatively high costs per savings in Empower+.

12.8 NMPC

Electric Budget						
	2023 Spend	2022 Implementation Plan Projection	2023 Spend to 2022 Implementation Plan Projection Variance	2020 - 2023 Spend	2020 - 2025 Implementation Plan Projection	% Achieved to Implementation Plan Projection
Existing 1-4 Family Homes						
Incentives & Services	\$541,373	\$534,436	\$6,937	\$1,005,309	\$2,762,608	36%
Program Implementation	\$24,324	\$153,467	-\$129,143	\$83,601	\$719,357	12%
Total Budget	\$565,698	\$687,903	-\$122,205	\$1,088,911	\$3,481,965	31%
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings						
Incentives & Services	\$367,134	\$672,308	-\$305,174	\$367,134	\$2,673,136	14%
Program Implementation	\$121,496	\$238,538	-\$117,042	\$121,496	\$1,017,587	12%
Total Budget	\$488,630	\$910,846	-\$422,216	\$488,630	\$3,690,723	13%
Affordable New Construction						
Incentives & Services	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Program Implementation	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Total Budget	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement						
Incentives & Services	\$239,948	\$225,293	\$14,655	\$609,818	\$988,685	62%
Program Implementation	\$66,208	\$35,938	\$30,270	\$97,639	\$123,918	79%
Total Budget	\$306,156	\$261,231	\$44,925	\$707,457	\$1,112,604	64%
Portfolio Administration	\$0	\$67,466	-\$67,466	\$53,879	\$337,554	16%
Portfolio EM&V	\$44	\$68,387	-\$68,343	\$17,978	\$277,233	6%
Total Portfolio Budget	\$1,360,527	\$1,995,833	-\$635,306	\$2,356,854	\$8,900,079	26%

Gas Budget						
	2023 Spend	2022 Implementation Plan Projection	2023 Spend to 2022 Implementation Plan Projection Variance	2020 - 2023 Spend	2020 - 2025 Implementation Plan Projection	% Achieved to Implementation Plan Projection
Existing 1-4 Family Homes						
Incentives & Services	\$1,122,822	\$1,108,459	\$14,363	\$2,124,624	\$5,769,417	37%
Program Implementation	\$44,924	\$318,302	-\$273,378	\$139,110	\$1,463,241	10%
Total Budget	\$1,167,746	\$1,426,761	-\$259,015	\$2,263,734	\$7,232,658	31%
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings						
Incentives & Services	\$124,861	\$2,043,850	-\$1,918,989	\$124,861	\$8,321,493	2%
Program Implementation	\$133,818	\$791,168	-\$657,350	\$133,818	\$3,221,223	4%
Total Budget	\$258,680	\$2,835,018	-\$2,576,338	\$258,680	\$11,542,716	2%
Affordable New Construction						
Incentives & Services	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Program Implementation	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Total Budget	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement						
Incentives & Services	\$0	\$108,857	-\$108,857	\$0	\$403,071	0%
Program Implementation	\$43,552	\$60,068	-\$16,516	\$119,509	\$243,208	49%
Total Budget	\$43,552	\$168,925	-\$125,373	\$119,509	\$646,279	18%
Portfolio Administration	\$0	\$140,728	-\$140,728	\$94,186	\$695,492	14%
Portfolio EM&V	\$18	\$134,296	-\$134,278	\$94,204	\$649,706	14%
Total Portfolio Budget	\$1,469,995	\$4,705,728	-\$3,235,733	\$2,830,312	\$20,766,851	14%

Electric Savings (MWh)						
	2023 Savings	2022 Implementation Plan Projection	2023 Savings to 2022 Implementation Plan Projection Variance	2020-2023 Savings	2020-2025 Implementation Plan Projection	% Achieved to Implementation Plan Projection
Existing 1-4 Family Homes	289	295	(6)	670	1,648	41%
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings	1,528	815	713	1,528	3,479	44%
Affordable New Construction	-	-	-	-	-	N/A
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement	2,202	1,040	1,163	9,807	10,369	95%
Total	4,020	2,150	1,870	12,005	15,495	77%

Gas Savings (MMBtu)						
	2023 Savings	2022 Implementation Plan Projection	2023 Savings to 2022 Implementation Plan Projection Variance	2020-2023 Savings	2020-2025 Implementation Plan Projection	% Achieved to Implementation Plan Projection
Existing 1-4 Family Homes	4,073	1,551	2,522	6,997	8,372	84%
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings	2,828	25,014	(22,186)	2,828	101,845	3%
Affordable New Construction	-	-	-	-	-	N/A
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement	-	-	-	-	-	N/A
Total	6,900	26,565	(19,665)	9,824	110,217	9%

Implementation Plan Projections vs. NE: NY Ordered Budgets & Targets

Electric	2020-2025 Electric Budget	2020-2025 Target (MWh)
LMI Implementation Plan	8,900,079	15,495
NENY Order(s)	8,900,079	15,439
Difference	(0)	56
Difference (%)	0%	0%

Gas	2020-2025 Gas Budget	2020-2025 Target (MMBtu)
LMI Implementation Plan	20,766,851	110,217
NENY Order(s)	20,766,851	192,251
Difference	-	(82,034)
Difference (%)	0%	-54%

Significant 2023 Expenditures and Achievement Variance Relative to Implementation Plan Budgets & Targets Explanation

In the NMPC territory, the 1-4 Family Homes program slightly under-spent and under-achieved in the electric portfolio and under-spent and over-achieved in the gas portfolio the 2023 spend and savings plans from the 2022 Implementation Plan. For this program, NMPC provides funding to NYSERDA's Empower+ program to fund projects within the service territory and claim the associated savings. The spend and energy savings achievement variance is not significant in electric. The program's spend variance is not significant in the gas portfolio, however the program achieved more than double the planned gas energy savings from the 2022 Implementation Plan.

For Existing Affordable Multifamily, AMEEP under-spent and over-achieved in the electric portfolio and under-spent and under-achieved in the gas portfolio the 2023 spend and savings plans from the 2022 Implementation Plan did not spend or achieve any of its 2022 planned budget or target in NMPC. The variance in the electric portfolio can be attributed to projects with lower unit cost light touch measures, such as lighting and in-unit water saving measures. The under-spend and under-achievement in gas is attributed to a small pool of completed projects. While the overall pipeline for AMEEP in NMPC has been minimal, it has been stronger in the electric territory than the gas territory. This presents a challenge since funding in NMPC is primarily in the gas portfolio. To build a stronger pipeline, National Grid works closely with NFG and NYSEG RG&E and the joint implementation contractor to build awareness of the program in those territories. Emphasis will be given to gas reduction measures in outreach in 2024.

Within the Customer Awareness, Outreach, & Engagement category, NMPC over-spent and over-achieved in the electric portfolio and under-spent in the gas portfolio the 2023 spend and savings plans from the 2022 Implementation Plan. In the electric territory, NMPC continued to operate the LED Foodbank program. As the program planned expanded customer outreach, such as coordinating with the Capital Region Clean Energy Hub, additional spending was required to provide the LED bulbs and brochures to food pantries and non-profit stakeholders. In the gas territory, the under-spend for this program category can be attributed to a slow ramp up in the launch of an additional customer outreach initiative. The spend for this initiative will be realized and reflected in 2024 program activity.

12.9 Orange & Rockland

* In 2023, O&R brought in additional funding to re-fund the Empower program. Initial funds of \$550,000 for Electric in Dec. of 2022. An additional \$800,000 for Electric was sent in October of 2023.

Electric Budget						
	2023 Spend	2022 Implementation Plan Projection	2023 Spend to 2022 Implementation Plan Projection Variance	2020 - 2023 Spend	2020 - 2025 Implementation Plan Projection	% Achieved to Implementation Plan Projection
Existing 1-4 Family Homes						
Incentives & Services	\$800,000	\$550,000	\$250,000	\$1,860,000	\$1,798,103	103%
Program Implementation	\$3,814	\$0	\$3,814	\$3,814	\$0	N/A
Total Budget	\$803,814	\$550,000	\$253,814	\$1,863,814	\$1,798,103	104%
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings						
Incentives & Services	\$0	\$30,000	-\$30,000	\$0	\$90,000	0%
Program Implementation	\$0	\$8,000	-\$8,000	\$0	\$24,000	0%
Total Budget	\$0	\$38,000	-\$38,000	\$0	\$114,000	0%
Affordable New Construction						
Incentives & Services	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Program Implementation	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Total Budget	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement						
Incentives & Services	\$74,865	\$60,000	\$14,865	\$134,034	\$238,630	56%
Program Implementation	\$13,871	\$20,000	-\$6,129	\$30,361	\$76,490	40%
Total Budget	\$88,736	\$80,000	\$8,736	\$164,394	\$315,119	52%
Portfolio Administration	\$3,009	\$39,436	-\$36,427	\$22,446	\$79,436	28%
Portfolio EM&V	\$1,539	\$5,000	-\$3,461	\$1,539	\$15,000	10%
Total Portfolio Budget	\$897,097	\$712,436	\$184,661	\$2,052,193	\$2,321,659	88%

Customer Awareness & Engagement expenditures during 2023 were for O&R's Foodbank Program and the first year of its LMI enhanced rebates on the MYORU store.

Electric Savings (MWh)						
	2023 Savings	2022 Implementation Plan Projection	2023 Savings to 2022 Implementation Plan Projection Variance	2020-2023 Savings	2020-2025 Implementation Plan Projection	% Achieved to Implementation Plan Projection
Existing 1-4 Family Homes	212	140	72	371	715	52%
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings	-	53	(53)	-	163	0%
Affordable New Construction	-	-	-	-	-	N/A
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement	1,302	500	802	2,951	3,149	94%
Total	1,514	693	821	3,322	4,027	83%

* 1260 MWh through unevaluated Foodbank program in 2023. An additional, 41 MWh was brought in from LMI enhanced rebates on the MYORU store.

* In 2023, O&R brought in additional funding to re-fund the Empower program. Initial funds of \$1.3 M for Gas were sent in Dec. of 2022. An additional \$616,067 for Gas was sent in October of 2023.

Gas Budget						
	2023 Spend	2022 Implementation Plan Projection	2023 Spend to 2022 Implementation Plan Projection Variance	2020 - 2023 Spend	2020 - 2025 Implementation Plan Projection	% Achieved to Implementation Plan Projection
Existing 1-4 Family Homes						
Incentives & Services	\$616,067	\$816,470	-\$200,403	\$3,288,067	\$3,297,283	100%
Program Implementation	\$3,814	\$0	\$3,814	\$3,814	\$0	N/A
Total Budget	\$619,881	\$816,470	-\$196,589	\$3,291,881	\$3,297,283	100%
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	
Incentives & Services	\$15,000	\$60,000	-\$45,000	\$15,000	\$180,000	8%
Program Implementation	\$3,400	\$15,000	-\$11,600	\$3,400	\$45,000	8%
Total Budget	\$18,400	\$75,000	-\$56,600	\$18,400	\$225,000	8%
Affordable New Construction	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	
Incentives & Services	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Program Implementation	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Total Budget	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	
Incentives & Services	\$15,837	\$30,000	-\$14,163	\$16,167	\$90,000	18%
Program Implementation	\$0	\$10,000	-\$10,000	\$0	\$30,000	0%
Total Budget	\$15,837	\$40,000	-\$24,163	\$16,167	\$120,000	13%
Portfolio Administration	\$810	\$19,419	-\$18,609	\$10,229	\$39,419	26%
Portfolio EM&V	\$1,539	\$10,000	-\$8,461	\$1,539	\$30,000	5%
Total Portfolio Budget	\$656,466	\$960,889	-\$304,423	\$3,338,216	\$3,711,702	90%

* In 2023, 850 Dth was brought in from LMI enhanced rebates on the MYORU store.

Gas Savings (MMBtu)						
	2023 Savings	2022 Implementation Plan Projection	2023 Savings to 2022 Implementation Plan Projection Variance	2020-2023 Savings	2020-2025 Implementation Plan Projection	% Achieved to Implementation Plan Projection
Existing 1-4 Family Homes	3,459	3,500	(41)	6,146	13,187	47%
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings	243	6,500	(6,257)	243	19,675	1%
Affordable New Construction	-	-	-	-	-	N/A
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement	850	500	350	850	1,500	57%
Total	4,552	10,500	(5,948)	7,239	34,362	21%

Implementation Plan Projections vs. NE: NY Ordered Budgets & Targets

Electric	2020-2025 Electric Budget	2020-2025 Target (MWh)
LMI Implementation Plan	2,321,659	4,027
NENY Order(s)	2,321,659	4,027
Difference	(0)	(0)
Difference (%)	0%	0%

Gas	2020-2025 Gas Budget	2020-2025 Target (MMBtu)
LMI Implementation Plan	3,711,702	34,362
NENY Order(s)	3,711,702	34,362
Difference	0	(0)
Difference (%)	0%	0%

Significant 2023 Expenditures and Achievement Variance Relative to Implementation Plan Budgets & Targets Explanation

In 2023, Orange & Rockland continued its partnership with local Foodbanks to distribute 11,496 LED light bulb kits. The kits included messaging to educate customers about energy efficiency and included a link to Orange & Rockland’s EmPower+ Webpage to drive awareness of the program.

Orange & Rockland referred 16,579 pre-identified LMI customers directly to the EmPower+ program in 2023. 1,013 customers enrolled and completed projects in both the Gas and Electric program. In December 2022, Orange and Rockland Launched its LMI enhanced rebates on its MYORU

Store. Customers that are pre-qualified as LMI are eligible for an enhanced rebate at checkout for various energy saving devices. Since that launch, 206 customers have taken advantage of the enhanced rebates.

The above-mentioned programs have been ramping up steadily in 2023 and we expect them to perform much better against their Implementation Plan budgets and targets in 2024.

O&R closed its first AMEEP projects in 2023. O&R was able to identify a large sector of residential developments that are now qualified for the AMEEP program. Many of these properties are in the process of completing work in 2024.

O&R continues to see the Empower+ program run at higher-than-expected costs. An additional \$800,000 for Electric and \$616,067 for Gas was sent in October of 2023 after funding ran out early in 2023.

12.10 Rochester Gas & Electric

Electric Budget						
	2023 Spend	2022 Implementation Plan Projection	2023 Spend to 2022 Implementation Plan Projection Variance	2020 - 2023 Spend	2020 - 2025 Implementation Plan Projection	% Achieved to Implementation Plan Projection
Existing 1-4 Family Homes						
Incentives & Services	\$374,952	\$415,993	-\$41,041	\$990,873	\$2,271,963	44%
Program Implementation	\$45,969	\$5,257	\$40,712	\$139,331	\$113,634	123%
Tools, Training, and Replication	\$913	\$0	\$913	\$3,971	\$3,058	130%
Total Budget	\$421,834	\$421,250	\$584	\$1,134,175	\$2,388,655	47%
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings		\$0	\$0		\$0	
Incentives & Services	\$178,178	\$202,880	-\$24,702	\$608,006	\$1,408,480	43%
Program Implementation	\$7,128	\$2,656	\$4,472	\$72,642	\$78,064	93%
Tools, Training, and Replication	\$1,451	\$0	\$1,451	\$3,489	\$2,039	171%
Total Budget	\$186,757	\$205,536	-\$18,779	\$684,137	\$1,488,583	46%
Affordable New Construction		\$0	\$0		\$0	
Incentives & Services	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Program Implementation	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Total Budget	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement		\$0	\$0		\$0	
Incentives & Services	\$287,518	\$418,013	-\$130,495	\$468,560	\$902,007	52%
Program Implementation	\$143,175	\$5,776	\$137,399	\$200,604	\$67,392	298%
Tools, Training, and Replication	\$14,594	\$0	\$14,594	\$53,025	\$38,431	138%
Total Budget	\$445,287	\$423,789	\$21,498	\$722,189	\$1,007,830	72%
Portfolio Administration	\$20,104	\$40,429	-\$20,325	\$62,682	\$166,344	38%
Portfolio EM&V	\$25,320	\$61,526	-\$36,206	\$49,364	\$191,985	26%
Total Portfolio Budget	\$1,099,300	\$1,152,530	-\$53,230	\$2,652,547	\$5,243,397	51%

Gas Budget						
	2023 Spend	2022 Implementation Plan Projection	2023 Spend to 2022 Implementation Plan Projection Variance	2020 - 2023 Spend	2020 - 2025 Implementation Plan Projection	% Achieved to Implementation Plan Projection
Existing 1-4 Family Homes						
Incentives & Services	\$1,185,653	\$981,849	\$203,804	\$2,113,488	\$4,982,728	42%
Program Implementation	\$108,757	\$14,967	\$93,790	\$227,515	\$181,581	125%
Tools, Training, and Replication	\$4,147	\$0	\$4,147	\$4,352	\$205	2123%
Total Budget	\$1,298,558	\$996,816	\$301,742	\$2,345,355	\$5,164,513	45%
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings		\$0	\$0		\$0	
Incentives & Services	\$1,057,343	\$361,014	\$696,329	\$1,236,020	\$2,503,891	49%
Program Implementation	\$16,506	\$5,422	\$11,084	\$83,041	\$162,558	51%
Tools, Training, and Replication	\$1,642	\$0	\$1,642	\$1,779	\$137	1302%
Total Budget	\$1,075,491	\$366,436	\$709,055	\$1,320,840	\$2,666,586	50%
Affordable New Construction		\$0	\$0		\$0	
Incentives & Services	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Program Implementation	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Total Budget	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	N/A
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement		\$0	\$0		\$0	
Incentives & Services	\$128,051	\$277,699	-\$149,648	\$164,320	\$991,164	17%
Program Implementation	\$41,759	\$19,546	\$22,213	\$53,496	\$44,526	120%
Tools, Training, and Replication	\$1,750	\$0	\$1,750	\$1,750	\$0	N/A
Total Budget	\$171,560	\$297,245	-\$125,685	\$219,565	\$1,035,689	21%
Portfolio Administration	\$41,519	\$20,338	\$21,181	\$122,790	\$176,415	70%
Portfolio EM&V	\$68	\$40,370	-\$40,302	\$20,782	\$210,454	10%
Total Portfolio Budget	\$2,587,195	\$1,721,205	\$865,990	\$4,029,331	\$9,253,656	44%

Electric Savings (MWh)						
	2023 Savings	2022 Implementation Plan Projection	2023 Savings to 2022 Implementation Plan Projection Variance	2020-2023 Savings	2020-2025 Implementation Plan Projection	% Achieved to Implementation Plan Projection
Existing 1-4 Family Homes	152	389	(237)	844	2,298	37%
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings	359	388	(29)	1,392	2,182	64%
Affordable New Construction	-	-	-	-	-	N/A
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement	3,228	1,507	1,721	6,191	5,652	110%
Total	3,740	2,284	1,456	8,427	10,131	83%

Gas Savings (MMBtu)						
	2023 Savings	2022 Implementation Plan Projection	2023 Savings to 2022 Implementation Plan Projection Variance	2020-2023 Savings	2020-2025 Implementation Plan Projection	% Achieved to Implementation Plan Projection
Existing 1-4 Family Homes	3,653	4,368	(715)	7,418	18,108	41%
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings	7,864	3,476	4,388	11,532	27,689	42%
Affordable New Construction	-	-	-	-	-	N/A
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement	17,567	2,897	14,670	18,072	7,854	230%
Total	29,084	10,741	18,343	37,022	53,651	69%

Implementation Plan Projections vs. NE: NY Ordered Budgets & Targets

Electric	2020-2025 Electric Budget	2020-2025 Target (MWh)
LMI Implementation Plan	5,243,397	10,131
NENY Order(s)	5,243,397	9,096
Difference	(0)	1,035
Difference (%)	0%	11%

Gas	2020-2025 Gas Budget	2020-2025 Target (MMBtu)
LMI Implementation Plan	9,253,656	53,651
NENY Order(s)	9,253,656	85,666
Difference	0	(32,015)
Difference (%)	0%	-46%

Significant 2023 Expenditures and Achievement Variance Relative to Implementation Plan Budgets & Targets Explanation

The 1-4 Family Electric/Gas Residential program fully invested both electric and gas funding in 2023. Due to the strong run rates early in the year an additional \$300K of gas dollars was made available from underperforming programs within the RGE portfolio. P. The energy savings achieved did not align with the original ordered savings targets or planned savings targets. This is due to misalignment of actual costs of the 1-4 family homes program compared to the targeted costs per savings in our orders. It should be noted that the actual costs of 1-4 family program appear to be in alignment with national costs/industry standard. While we plan to maintain full investment of Targeted Ordered Expenditures the reality of the costs per savings will result in shortfalls on Ordered Savings Targets. Future Implementation Plans will be adjusted to reflect those costs.

Specific to AMEEP, RG&E ran an air sealing and insulation promotion in Q3. This promotion raised interest of property owners/managers and resulted in exceeding targeted spend and savings for RG&E gas in 2023. Property managers/owners are looking for larger incentives so they can afford the energy efficiency measures for their buildings, such as air sealing and insulation. RG&E also completed 2 comprehensive projects in Q2. Although RG&E did not meet the planned electric spend and savings, there was an increase in projects completed which produced an increase in spend and savings in 2023 vs 2022. RG&E continues to identify and contact LMI multifamily buildings and building owners, using a combination of in-person solicitation, creating relationships with housing authorities, participation in industry events, direct mail, and email campaigns.

Uninvested LMI dollars from 2019-2023 were repurposed into supplemental Customer Awareness and Outreach Engagement programs. This is done to help cross promote Empower and AMEEP in the community while also helping to offset savings because of low participation in AMEEP and relatively high costs per savings in Empower+.

13. Appendix B: LMI Portfolio Unit Costs

Table 1: Utility Electric LMI Energy Efficiency Portfolio Unit Costs

Program Administrator	Planned 2020-2025 NE:NY (\$/MWh)	Actual to date 2020-2023 (\$/MWh)	Difference between Actual to date and Planned NE:NY	Projected 2020-2025 per Statewide Implementation Plan	Difference between Statewide Implementation Plan and Planned 2020-2025 NE:NY
Central Hudson	577	221	-89%	410	-34%
Con Edison	577	204	-96%	406	-35%
NMPC	577	196	-98%	574	0%
NYSEG	577	256	-77%	451	-24%
O&R	577	619	7%	577	0%
RG&E	577	315	-59%	518	-11%

Table 2: Utility Gas LMI Energy Efficiency Program Unit Costs

Program Administrator	Planned 2020-2025 NE:NY (\$/MMBtu)	Actual to date 2020-2023 (\$/MMBtu)	Difference between Actual to date and Planned NE:NY	Projected 2020-2025 per Statewide Implementation Plan	Difference between Statewide Implementation Plan projection and Planned 2020-2025 NE:NY
Central Hudson	108	435	120%	215	66%
Con Edison	108	79	-31%	110	2%
KEDLI	108	272	86%	194	57%
KEDNY	108	127	16%	197	58%
NFG	114	371	106%	138	19%
NMPC	108	288	91%	188	54%
NYSEG	108	115	6%	204	62%
O&R	108	460	124%	108	0%
RG&E	108	109	1%	172	46%

Table 3: NYSERDA LMI Unit Costs

Program Administrator	Actual to date 2020-2023 (Acquired Direct + Indirect) (\$/MMBtu-e)	2020-2030 Unit Cost Target from EE/BE Report (Direct + Indirect) (\$/MMBtu-e)	Projected 2020-2030 per Statewide Implementation Plan (Direct) (\$/MMBtu-e)	Projected 2020-2030 per Statewide Implementation Plan (Direct + Indirect) (\$/MMBtu-e)
NYSERDA	111	142	142	72

As summarized in Appendix A: NYSERDA, acquired savings and expenditures to date for the NYSERDA LMI portfolio are heavily weighted by 1-4 family homes production, which carries higher relative project costs and lower energy savings potential than multifamily and new construction. 49% of savings projected are indirect savings 88% of direct portfolio savings are comprised of multifamily and new construction initiatives which have longer project completion timelines. In addition, 15% of the budget is allocated to initiatives that do not report energy savings under the CEF LMI portfolio (outreach, education, solar, LMI electrification pilots).

14. Appendix C: Measure Mix by Program Administrator

1-4 Family Homes (MWh)

Program Administrator	2023 MWh Savings	Lighting	Appliances	Building Shell	Domestic Hot Water	Domestic Hot Water - Control	HVAC	HVAC Control	Motors and Drives	Other
Central Hudson	40	21%	11%	66%	0%	2%	0%	0%		
Con Edison	105	60%	28%	11%	0%	0%	0%	1%		
NYSERDA	3,983	4%	26%	65%	0%	3%	1%	1%		
NYSEG	323	28%	17%	37%	13%	3%	0%	2%		
National Grid (NMPC)	289	28%	16%	33%	16%	3%	4%	0%		
Orange & Rockland	211	30%	41%	23%	0%	0%	1%	3%		
RGE	150	67%	22%	12%	-4%	2%	0%	0%		
Total	5,101	11%	25%	57%	2%	3%	1%	1%	0%	0%

1-4 Family Homes (MMBtu)

Program Administrator	2023 MMBtu Savings	Lighting	Appliances	Building Shell	Domestic Hot Water	Domestic Hot Water - Control	HVAC	HVAC Control	Motors and Drives	Other
Central Hudson	529			94%	0%	0%	1%	4%		
Con Edison	4,106			97%	0%	0%	1%	2%		
National Grid (KEDLI)	20,202			80%	9%	0%	3%	7%		0%
National Grid (KEDNY)	1,884			99%	0%	0%	0%	1%		
NFG	13,122			69%	5%	0%	24%	3%		
NYSERDA	216,663		0%	75%	4%	0%	19%	2%		
NYSEG	6,822			88%	3%	0%	7%	1%		
National Grid (NMPC)	4,073		0%	82%	7%	1%	8%	2%		
Orange & Rockland	3,459			90%	0%	4%	1%	5%		0%
RGE	3,653			69%	7%	2%	21%	2%		
Total	274,512	-	0%	76%	4%	0%	17%	2%	0%	0%

Existing Affordable Multifamily (MWh)

Program Administrator	2023 MWh Savings	Lighting	Appliances	Building Shell	Domestic Hot Water	Domestic Hot Water - Control	HVAC	HVAC Control	Motors and Drives	Other
Central Hudson	-									
Con Edison	7,158	52%	0%	41%	0%	0%	0%	0%	7%	
NYSERDA	3,098	38%	13%	25%	2%	0%	22%	0%	0%	0%
NYSEG	694	76%	0%	6%	0%	17%	0%	0%	0%	
National Grid (NMPC)	1,528	79%	0%	0%	0%	21%	0%	0%	0%	
Orange & Rockland	-									
RGE	360	84%	0%	11%	0%	5%	0%	0%	0%	
Total	12,838	54%	3%	30%	1%	4%	5%	0%	4%	0%

Existing Affordable Multifamily (MMBtu)

Program Administrator	2023 MMBtu Savings	Lighting	Appliances	Building Shell	Domestic Hot Water	Domestic Hot Water - Control	HVAC	HVAC Control	Motors and Drives	Other
Central Hudson	52		0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	100%		
Con Edison	347,118		0%	57%	15%	1%	6%	21%		
National Grid (KEDLI)	623		0%	0%	0%	0%	20%	80%		
National Grid (KEDNY)	29,914		0%	21%	0%	0%	10%	68%		
NFG	161		0%	0%	0%	0%	100%	0%		
NYSERDA	38,520	-2%	7%	20%	26%	0%	43%	0%	7%	
NYSEG	2,831		0%	16%	0%	74%	7%	2%		
National Grid (NMPC)	2,828		0%	14%	5%	36%	0%	46%		
Orange & Rockland	243		0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	100%		
RGE	7,864		0%	71%	0%	8%	7%	14%		
Total	430,154	0%	1%	51%	15%	1%	9%	23%	1%	0%

65

⁶⁵ NYSERDA measure mix is specific to the Multifamily Performance Program. Please note that other Multifamily program savings are not included.

Customer Awareness Outreach and Engagement (MWh)

Program Administrator	2023 MWh Savings	Lighting	Appliances	Building Shell	Domestic Hot Water	Domestic Hot Water - Control	HVAC	HVAC Control	Motors and Drives	Other
Central Hudson	125	100%	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%
Con Edison	20,743	98%	0%	0%	0%	2%	0%	0%	0%	0%
NYSERDA	-									
NYSEG	8,369	100%	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%
National Grid (NMPC)	2,202	100%	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%
Orange & Rockland	1,302	98%	2%	0%	0%	0%	0%	1%	0%	0%
RGE	3,228	100%	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%
Total	35,970	99%	0%	0%	0%	1%	0%	0%	0%	0%
Grand Total Savings	53,909	80%	3%	12%	0%	2%	1%	0%	1%	0%

Customer Awareness Outreach and Engagement (MMBtu)

Program Administrator	2023 MMBtu Savings	Lighting	Appliances	Building Shell	Domestic Hot Water	Domestic Hot Water - Control	HVAC	HVAC Control	Motors and Drives	Other
Central Hudson	-									
Con Edison	21,112		0%	0%	0%	100%	0%	0%		
National Grid (KEDLI)	812		0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	100%		
National Grid (KEDNY)	-									
NFG	-									
NYSERDA	-									
NYSEG	27,724		0%	100%	0%	0%	0%	0%		
National Grid (NMPC)	-									
Orange & Rockland	850		0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	100%		
RGE	17,567		0%	100%	0%	0%	0%	0%		
Total	68,066	0%	0%	67%	0%	31%	0%	2%	0%	0%
Grand Total Savings	772,732	0%	0%	61%	10%	4%	11%	14%	0%	0%

15. Appendix D: Realization Rates⁶⁶ by Program Administrator

15.1 Central Hudson

Sector	Program	Fuel Type Funding Source	2023 Scorecard Program Name	2023 Scorecard Program Code	Realization Rate	Effective from date	Effective to date	Previous Realization Rate	Effective from date	Effective to date
Existing 1-4 Family Homes	EmPower+	Electric	Empower (Electric)	CH-E-L-R-22	62%	2017 Q1				
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings	AMEEP	Electric	Clean Heat (CH) & Affordable Multifamily Energy Efficiency Program (AMEEP)	CH-E-L-M-21	Unevaluated					
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement	Distribute LEDs through Food Banks and the United Way	Electric	Community Lighting	CH-E-L-R-26	84%	2018 Q3				
Existing 1-4 Family Homes	EmPower+	Gas	Empower (Gas)	CH-G-L-R-23	73%	2017 Q1				
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings	AMEEP	Gas	Affordable Multifamily Energy Efficiency Program (AMEEP)	CH-G-L-M-20	Unevaluated					
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement		Gas								

⁶⁶ Verified Gross Savings (“VGS”) Realization Rates only.

15.2 Consolidated Edison

Sector	Program	Fuel Type Funding Source	2023 Scorecard Program Name	2023 Scorecard Program Code	Realization Rate	Effective from date	Effective to date	Previous Realization Rate	Effective from date	Effective to date
Existing 1-4 Family Homes	EmPower+	Electric	Empower Electric	CE-E-L-R-32N	62%	2017 Q1				
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings	AMEEP	Electric	Affordable Multifamily Energy Efficiency Program (AMEEP) Electric	CE-E-L-M-5N	Unevaluated					
	Multifamily - LMI	Electric	Multifamily - LMI	CE-E-L-M-4N	38%	2017 Q1	2020 Q1			
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement	Energy conservation kits program for EAP customers	Electric	Efficiency Starter Program - LMI	CE-E-L-R-14N	100%	2020 Q1				
	Food banks LED distribution		Retail Lighting - LMI	CE-E-L-R-25N	58%	2022 Q1				
	Smart Kids		Smart Kids	CE-E-L-R-27N	100%	2023 Q1				
	Home Energy Reports		Residential Home Energy Reports - LMI	CE-E-L-R-17N	98%	2021 Q1				
Existing 1-4 Family Homes	EmPower+	Gas	Empower Gas	CE-G-L-R-32N	73%	2017 Q1				
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings	AMEEP	Gas	Affordable Multifamily Energy Efficiency Program (AMEEP) Gas	CE-G-L-M-5N	Unevaluated					
	Multifamily - LMI	Gas	Multifamily - LMI	CE-G-L-M-4N	91%	2021 Q4		88%	2021 Q3	2021 Q3
		Gas	NYCHA Program	CE-G-L-M-9N	87%	2021 Q4		100%	2021 Q3	2021 Q3
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement	Energy conservation kits program for EAP customers	Gas	Efficiency Starter Program - LMI	CE-G-L-R-14N	100%	2020 Q1				
	Home Energy Reports		Residential Home Energy Reports - LMI	CE-G-L-R-17N	69%	2021 Q1		88%	2020 Q4	2020 Q4
	Smart Kids		Smart Kids	CE-G-L-R-27N	100%	2023 Q1				

15.3 KEDLI

Sector	Program	Fuel Type Funding Source	2023 Scorecard Program Name	2023 Scorecard Program Code	Realization Rate	Effective from date	Effective to date	Previous Realization Rate	Effective from date	Effective to date
Existing 1-4 Family Homes	KEDLI HEAT	Gas	Gas LMI - Existing 1-4 Family Homes Program	KL-G-L-R-12	98%	2020 Q1				
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings	AMEEP	Gas	Gas LMI - Existing Affordable Multifamily Program	KL-G-L-M-13	Unevaluated					
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement	Customer Awareness, Outreach, & Engagement Program	Gas	Gas LMI - Customer Awareness, Outreach, & Engagement Program	KL-G-L-R-10	Unevaluated					

15.4 KEDNY

Sector	Program	Fuel Type Funding Source	2023 Scorecard Program Name	2023 Scorecard Program Code	Realization Rate	Effective from date	Effective to date	Previous Realization Rate	Effective from date	Effective to date
Existing 1-4 Family Homes	EmPower NY	Gas	Gas LMI - Existing 1-4 Family Homes Program	KN-G-L-R-12	73%	2022 Q1				
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings	AMEEP	Gas	Gas LMI - Existing Affordable Multifamily Program	KN-G-L-M-13	Unevaluated					
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement	Customer Awareness, Outreach, & Engagement Program	Gas	Gas LMI - Customer Awareness, Outreach, & Engagement Program	KN-G-L-R-10	Unevaluated					

15.5 National Fuel Gas Distribution Corporation

Sector	Program	Fuel Type Funding Source	2023 Scorecard Program Name	2023 Scorecard Program Code	Realization Rate	Effective from date	Effective to date	Previous Realization Rate	Effective from date	Effective to date
Existing 1-4 Family Homes	EmPower NY	Gas	EmPower	NF-G-LMI-R-3J	52%	2021 Q1				
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings	AMEEP	Gas	Affordable Multifamily Energy Efficiency Program (AMEEP)	NF-G-LMI-R-4J	Unevaluated					
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement										

15.6 New York State Energy Research & Development Authority

Sector	Program	Fuel Type Funding Source	2023 Scorecard Program Name	2023 Scorecard Program Code	Realization Rate	Effective from date	Effective to date	Previous Realization Rate	Effective from date	Effective to date
Existing 1-4 Family Homes	EmPower NY	Electric	Single Family- Low income	ND-E-L-R-65	62%	2017 Q1				
		Gas			73%	2017 Q1				
	AHP	Electric	Single Family-	ND-E-L-R-66	53%	2017 Q1				
		Gas	Moderate Income		66%	2017 Q1				
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings	Multi-Year Affordable Housing Partnerships	Electric	LMI Multifamily	ND-E-L-M-28a	20%	2016 Q3				
		Gas			42%	2016 Q3				
		Heating Fuel			42%	2016 Q3				
	Technical Assistance for RetrofitNY	Electric		ND-E-L-M-28b	Unevaluated					
		Gas			Unevaluated					
	RetrofitNY	N/A	RetrofitNY- LMI	ND-E-L-M-61	Unevaluated					
Affordable New Construction	Affordable New Construction Housing Program	N/A	Low Rise New Construction Transition	ND-E-L-R-30	Unevaluated					
		N/A	Multifamily New Construction Transition	ND-E-L-M-39	Unevaluated					
		N/A	New Construction- LMI	ND-E-L-M-42; ND-E-L-R-42	Unevaluated					
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement	LIFE	N/A	Low Income Forum on Energy	ND-E-L-X-32	N/A					
	Regional Clean Energy Hubs	N/A	Regional Clean Energy Hubs	ND-E-L-X-88A	Unevaluated					
	REVitalize	N/A	REVitalize	ND-E-L-C-64	Unevaluated					
Pilots and Demonstrations	LMI Pilots	N/A	LMI Pilots	ND-E-L-X-29	Unevaluated					
LMI Solar	Solar for All	N/A	Solar for All	ND-E-L-X-69	N/A					
Beneficial Electrification	LMI Heat Pump Pilot	N/A	Heat Pumps Phase 2	ND-E-L-R-24	Unevaluated					
Additional LMI Initiatives	Healthy Homes	N/A	Healthy Homes Feasibility Study	ND-E-L-R-22	N/A					
	Healthy Homes	N/A	NYS Healthy Homes Value Based Payment Pilot	ND-E-L-R-48	Unevaluated					

15.7 New York State Electric & Gas

Sector	Program	Fuel Type Funding Source	2023 Scorecard Program Name	2023 Scorecard Program Code	Realization Rate	Effective from date	Effective to date	Previous Realization Rate	Effective from date	Effective to date
Existing 1-4 Family Homes	EmPower+	Electric	LMI 1-4 Family Homes	NS-E-L-R-7	62%	2017 Q1				
	EmPower+	Electric	LMI 1-4 Family	NS-E-L-R-7A						
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings	AMEEP	Electric	The Affordable Multifamily Energy Efficiency Program	NS-E-L-M-87	Unevaluated	2022 Q1		106%	2021 Q1	2021 Q4
			The Affordable	NS-E-L-M-6	Unevaluated					
			The Affordable	NS-E-L-M-6A	Unevaluated					
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement	Food banks, distributions to EAP, school kits	Electric	LMI Distributions	NS-E-L-R-77	83%	2022 Q1				
	LMI Retail Lighting		Retail Products LMI	NS-E-L-R-75A	101%	2022 Q1				
	School Kit Program		School Kit Program	NS-E-L-R-91	Unevaluated	2023 Q1				
Existing 1-4 Family Homes	EmPower+	Gas	LMI 1-4 Family Homes	NS-G-L-R-23	73%	2017 Q1				
	EmPower+	Gas	LMI 1-4 Family Homes	NS-G-L-R-23A						
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings	AMEEP	Gas	The Affordable Multifamily Energy Efficiency Program	NS-G-L-M-89	Unevaluated	2022 Q1		84%	2021 Q1	2021 Q4
	AMEEP		The Affordable Mul	NS-G-L-M-22	Unevaluated					
	AMEEP		The Affordable Mul	NS-G-L-M-22A	Unevaluated					
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement		Gas	LMI Distributions	NS-G-L-R-79	64%	2022 Q1				
	School Kit Program		School Kit Program	NS-G-L-R-93	Unevaluated	2023 Q1				
	Retail Products LMI		Retail Products LMI	NS-G-L-R-83A	Unevaluated	2023 Q1				

15.8 NMPC

Sector	Program	Fuel Type Funding Source	2023 Scorecard Program Name	2023 Scorecard Program Code	Realization Rate	Effective from date	Effective to date	Previous Realization Rate	Effective from date	Effective to date
Existing 1-4 Family Homes	EmPower NY	Electric	Electric LMI - Existing 1-4 Family Homes Program	NM-E-L-R-16	62%	2022 Q1				
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings	AMEEP	Electric	Electric LMI - Existing Affordable Multifamily Program	NM-E-L-M-17	Unevaluated					
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement	LED Foodbank Program	Electric	Electric LMI - Customer Awareness, Outreach, & Engagement Program	NM-E-L-R-14	Unevaluated					
Existing 1-4 Family Homes	EmPower NY	Gas	Gas LMI - Existing 1-4 Family Homes Program	NM-G-L-R-12	73%	2022 Q1				
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings	AMEEP	Gas	Gas LMI - Existing Affordable Multifamily Program	NM-G-L-M-13	Unevaluated					
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement	Customer Awareness, Outreach, & Engagement Program	Gas	Gas LMI - Customer Awareness, Outreach, & Engagement Program	NM-G-L-R-10	Unevaluated					

15.9 Orange & Rockland

Sector	Program	Fuel Type Funding Source	2023 Scorecard Program Name	2023 Scorecard Program Code	Realization Rate	Effective from date	Effective to date	Previous Realization Rate	Effective from date	Effective to date
Existing 1-4 Family Homes	EmPower NY	Electric	LMI Electric - EmPower	OR-E-M-R-11	62%	2017 Q1				
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings	AMEEP	Electric	LMI Electric - AMEEP	OR-E-M-R-13	Unevaluated					
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement	Foodbank, EE Kits, LMI Marketplace	Electric	LMI Electric - Customer Engagement	OR-E-M-R-15	Unevaluated					
Existing 1-4 Family Homes	EmPower NY	Gas	LMI Gas - EmPower	OR-G-M-R-12	73%	2017 Q1				
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings	AMEEP	Gas	LMI Gas - AMEEP	OR-G-M-R-14	Unevaluated					
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement	EE Kits, LMI Marketplace	Gas	LMI Gas - Customer Engagement	OR-G-M-R-16	Unevaluated					

15.10 Rochester Gas & Electric

Sector	Program	Fuel Type Funding Source	2023 Scorecard Program Name	2023 Scorecard Program Code	Realization Rate	Effective from date	Effective to date	Previous Realization Rate	Effective from date	Effective to date
Existing 1-4 Family Homes	EmPower+	Electric	LMI 1-4 Family Homes	RG-E-L-R-39	62%	2017 Q1				
	EmPower+		Homes	RG-E-L-R-39A						
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings	AMEEP	Electric	The Affordable Multifamily Energy Efficiency Program	RG-E-L-M-88	Unevaluated	2022 Q1		106%	2021 Q1	2021 Q4
			Multifamily Energy	RG-E-L-M-38	Unevaluated					
			Multifamily Energy	RG-E-L-M-38A	Unevaluated					
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement	Food banks, distributions to EAP, school kits	Electric	LMI Distributions	RG-E-L-R-78	83%	2022 Q1				
	LMI Retail Lighting		Retail Products LMI	RG-E-L-R-76A	101%	2022 Q1				
	School Kit Program		School Kit Program	RG-E-L-R-92	Unevaluated					
Existing 1-4 Family Homes	EmPower+	Gas	LMI 1-4 Family Homes	RG-G-L-R-55	73%	2017 Q1				
	EmPower+		Homes	RG-G-L-R-55A						
Existing Affordable Multifamily Buildings	AMEEP	Gas	The Affordable Multifamily Energy Efficiency Program	RG-G-L-M-90	Unevaluated	2022 Q1		84%	2021 Q1	2021 Q4
	AMEEP		Multifamily Energy	RG-G-L-M-54	Unevaluated					
	AMEEP		Multifamily Energy	RG-G-L-M-54A	Unevaluated					
Customer Awareness, Outreach & Engagement		Gas	LMI Distributions	RG-G-L-R-80	64%	2022 Q1				
	Retail Products LMI		Retail Products LMI	RG-G-L-R-84A	Unevaluated	2023 Q1				
	School Kit Program		School Kit Program	RG-G-L-R-94	Unevaluated	2023 Q1				