

BUILDINGS

Thank you for the opportunity to comment on New York's draft scoping plan to achieve the goals of the Climate Leadership and Community Protection Act. I am grateful to the work of the Climate Action Council on creating this document, which includes many strong steps towards addressing climate change and places New York as a leader on climate. To address the building sector, which accounts for 32% of New York State's emissions, New York must rapidly adopt standards for NO NEW FOSSIL FUELS in buildings and strengthen assistance programs, especially for low-to-moderate income (LMI) households and those in Disadvantaged Communities, to electrify and receive the benefits of cleaner air that occur when we stop combusting fossil fuels. To ensure a livable future for all New York residents, the final scoping plan must:

- **Ban all fossil fuel equipment in new buildings.** All-electric building codes should adhere to the draft scoping plan's proposed 2024/2027 timeline or earlier, requiring all-electric new residential/mixed-use buildings by 2024 and all-electric standards for new commercial buildings by 2027. We must not lock in additional fossil fuel infrastructure for decades by postponing all-electric building codes any longer.
- **Ban new gas hookups.** Ceasing the installation of gas hookups in new buildings is essential for phasing in more sustainable technologies. According to Earthjustice, 70% of New York City's natural gas emissions stem from buildings.
- **Implement all-electric appliance standards.** Electric appliance standards should be accompanied by financial assistance for LMI households to increase affordability.
- **Dedicate at least \$1 billion per year to assist low to moderate income households with electrification.** Electrification upgrades can have high upfront costs so it is extremely important to dedicate public funding to support electrification for low to moderate income households. Not only does electrification significantly reduce household GHG emissions, it also results in substantial energy bill savings that could greatly benefit LMI households.
- **Prohibit state and utility marketing of fossil fuels.** New York and its utilities must serve the interests of New York residents by ceasing to promote fossil fuels. Marketing should instead focus on necessary electric technologies such as ground- and air-source heat pumps that will keep New Yorkers reliably warm through the winter without harming our climate and livelihoods.
- **End fossil fuel expansion.** The state must not grant new gas permits, nor require that utilities provide customers with fossil fuel service. New York must align utility regulations with stringent climate goals that achieve net-zero emissions by 2050.

- **Include the Gas Transition and Affordable Energy Act (S.8198)** to ensure equitable and affordable access to electricity for New York residents while necessarily aligning utility regulations with New York's commitments under the Climate Act.
- **Require leak detection in supermarkets to prevent powerful greenhouse gases from escaping into the atmosphere, and create a cash-for-clunkers program to ensure refrigerants from old appliances are safely recovered at their end of life.** Establish dedicated funding for grocery stores in disadvantaged communities to meet these requirements, and fully fund DEC resources to oversee and implement this requirement.

TRANSPORTATION

Thank you for the opportunity to comment on New York's draft scoping plan to achieve the goals of the Climate Leadership and Community Protection Act. I am grateful to the work of the Climate Action Council on creating this document, which includes many strong steps towards addressing climate change and places New York as a leader on climate. To address the transportation sector, which accounts for 28% of New York's greenhouse gas emissions, New York must advance transportation electrification and the expansion of reliable, electric public transport options rapidly and equitably. The final scoping plan must:

- **Introduce a feebate for zero-emission vehicles.** Since transportation emissions are so high, it is important to promote the use of electric vehicles. A feebate program for zero-emission vehicles would be a great way to incentivize the purchase of ZEVs and make them more affordable for LMI customers. Transportation is a constant in this world, thus it is necessary to create a feasible plan that tackles transportation head-on.
- **Expand a feebate program beyond vehicle purchases to include zero-emission vehicle leases.** We need full transportation electrification, which includes vehicle leases. Additionally, making ZEVs more affordable to rent through a feebate could increase familiarity with ZEVs and enable future purchase.
- **Allow zero-emission vehicle manufacturers to sell directly to consumers.** New York must remove all possible barriers for consumers to make climate-friendly transportation choices. This means allowing direct sales from manufacturers to consumers to decrease costs while increasing consumer choice.
- **Accelerate fast-charger deployment across the state.** New York can only achieve its Climate Act commitments if New Yorkers can get around the state reliably and emissions-free. New York must accelerate charger deployment to show that electric transportation will be dependable in every part of the state.
- **Achieve a fully-electric state fleet by 2030.** New York must lead the way in adopting zero-emissions vehicles by accelerating its transition to a fully electric fleet by five years, committing to a zero-emissions fleet by 2030.
- **Make a comprehensive plan for developing fully electric, extensive, and accessible public transportation.** New York must give heightened consideration to public transit systems within the state, which can help move more people with greater efficiency. We need full electrification of an expansive and physically accessible public transit system helping people connect to their work, their communities, and all New York State has to offer.
- **Address public transit beyond the New York City metro area to include expanded and electrified upstate transportation.** The Climate Act offers us the opportunity to

open doors for New Yorkers statewide. New York should develop a plan to expand and electrify public transportation to help upstate New York residents access economic, social, and cultural opportunities within their communities and across the state regardless of vehicle status.

- **Address tri-state commuting in public transit plans by investing in rail and bus systems; divert funding away from road infrastructure.** New York must consider community transportation needs by focusing on the larger tri-state area. New York brings in a lot of commuters, especially from New Jersey, and commuters should factor into the New York community. Commuters currently rely on single-occupancy vehicles, MTA, NJT, or coach buses into Port Authority, which are often unreliable and create a miserable commuting experience. New York must invest in public transit by improving user experience through increased frequency of service, more stop locations, and better communications, which will help reduce reliance on personal vehicles and thus reduce carbon emissions.

ELECTRICITY

Thank you for the opportunity to comment on New York's draft scoping plan to achieve the goals of the Climate Leadership and Community Protection Act. I am grateful to the work of the Climate Action Council on creating this document, which includes many strong steps towards addressing climate change and places New York as a leader on climate. To address the electricity sector, which accounts for 13% of New York's greenhouse gas emissions, New York must rapidly end all fossil fuel development while investing in storage and renewable energy resources and prioritizing a clean energy transition for Disadvantaged Communities that have borne the brunt of fossil fuel pollution and economic hardship. The final scoping plan must:

- **Close fossil fuel plants in Disadvantaged Communities and financially support a just transition.** The phase-out of fossil fuel plants in disadvantaged areas must consider the potential financial impacts on the local economy. Financial support must be provided to communities to ensure that reducing fossil fuel usage does not lead to significant unemployment or financial burdens.
- **Require fossil fuel companies to bear full responsibility for cleanup of polluted sites.** Fossil fuel companies must bear responsibility for remediating any damage caused to the local environment, as they are the actors who necessitated clean up. The burden for site remediation should not fall on public funds and/or entities.
- **Replace fossil fuel plants with storage infrastructure.** Bolstering storage infrastructure is essential to transitioning away from fossil fuels and enhancing the energy grid. With the consent of the local community, storage sites should be established at former fossil fuel plant sites.
- **Ban construction of fossil fuel facilities: NO NEW FOSSIL FUELS.** To achieve the goal of retiring fossil fuel facilities and reducing fossil fuel dependency, it is of paramount importance that no new fossil fuel infrastructure is constructed. Funds should go towards expanding renewable capacity, assisting disadvantaged communities, and investing in energy storage.
- **Set clear and rapid targets for ending fossil fuel generation.** Tangible, specific, and clearly articulated targets for ending fossil fuel generation must be established and evaluated to ensure adherence to climate goals.
- **Establish incentives for small-scale distributed solar and storage.** Incentives for solar and storage on a rooftop scale are essential, since introducing smaller scale solar and storage will effectively integrate more renewable resources into communities and reduce reliance on polluting power plants.

WASTE

Thank you for the opportunity to comment on New York's draft scoping plan to achieve the goals of the Climate Leadership and Community Protection Act. I am grateful to the work of the Climate Action Council on creating this document, which includes many strong steps towards addressing climate change and places New York as a leader on climate. To address the waste sector, which accounts for 12% of New York's greenhouse gas emissions, New York must enact policy immediately to reduce landfill waste, divert organic waste, and encourage sustainable use of materials. These policies must equitably serve New York residents. The final scoping plan must:

- **Create a surcharge on landfill waste.** The amendment and expansion of the Food Donation and Food Scraps Recycling Law tackles the organic waste issue at its financial core- that it is relatively cheaper to dispose of organic waste in the landfill than it is to recycle. By imposing a surcharge on landfill waste (making it more expensive) to financially support reduction, reuse and recycling, the price of disposing waste in landfills will be made closer to its real environmental, societal and economic cost.
- **Implement more stringent organics recycling and food donation programs for major food generators.** Stronger programs on major food generators (hospitals, universities, restaurants and supermarkets, etc) is a very efficient way to reduce and recycle organic waste. In addition to targeting the bulk of organic waste in the state, this will also set an example for smaller food generators as well as individuals and households.
- **Expand organics collection programs to multi-family and public housing.** Multi-family and public housing make up a relatively large portion of communities in New York, making it so that they can possibly collectively generate large amounts of organic waste that may be sent to landfills instead of recycled. Thus, expanding outreach and education to this population has potential in inducing effective shifts in organic waste divestment from landfills to organic waste collections. This is also significant in inviting communities who may be disproportionately affected by environmental injustice issues to be included in solutions that may have effects on their lives more strongly than others.
- **Immediately implement “by request only” single-use materials in restaurants.** A statewide “by request only” policy must be administered for single-use items with a requirement of reusable or refillable options. Single-use items, such as utensils and dishware in restaurants, can be phased out in favor of multi-use items that will reduce landfill waste.
- **Rapidly end single-use packaging.** Single-use packaging must be phased out and eliminated in retail stores and other locations, as it contributes to landfill waste consisting largely of non-recyclable material.

- **Expand container deposit programs and incentives for proper recycling.** Container deposits must be increased throughout the state. Increased container deposits incentivise the collection and recycling of recyclable materials through a comparatively streamlined process.
- **Create a textile waste reduction program.** Not only would a textile waste reduction program reduce methane and CO2 emissions, but it would also reduce both the water waste and water contamination that goes into textile production. This initiative would, overall, promote a sustainable mindset in the textile industry, encouraging the recycling of products created.

AGRICULTURE & FORESTRY

Thank you for the opportunity to comment on New York's draft scoping plan to achieve the goals of the Climate Leadership and Community Protection Act. I am grateful to the work of the Climate Action Council on creating this document, which includes many strong steps towards addressing climate change and places New York as a leader on climate. Addressing the agriculture & forestry sector, which accounts for 6% of New York's greenhouse gas emissions, requires significantly strengthening mitigation in agriculture. The final scoping plan must:

- **Incentivize a shift away from nitrogen fertilizer use.** Nitrogen fertilizers produce potent greenhouse gas emissions in the form of nitrous oxide (N₂O) that must be comprehensively addressed.
- **Ensure that carbon sinks from improved forestry and soil management are *guaranteed* to achieve the >60 million metric tons of carbon dioxide sequestration required to meet New York's commitment to net-zero greenhouse gas emissions by 2050.**
- **Incentivize a shift towards climate-friendly animal feeding practices, including the use of dietary supplements for ruminant livestock that may significantly reduce methane emissions.**
- **Regulate Concentrated Animal Feeding Operations and their negative environmental impacts.**
- **Develop a plan to address emissions from tractors and farm equipment.** While emissions from tractors and farm equipment make up a small percentage of emissions from agriculture, this plan should include a practical pathway to decarbonize farm equipment that is essential to New York's food production while supporting New York farmers in this fuel transition.

INDUSTRY

Thank you for the opportunity to comment on New York's draft scoping plan to achieve the goals of the Climate Leadership and Community Protection Act. I am grateful to the work of the Climate Action Council on creating this document, which includes many strong steps towards addressing climate change and places New York as a leader on climate. To address the industry sector, which accounts for 9% of New York's greenhouse gas emissions, the final scoping plan must:

- **Address cryptocurrency with a plan to regulate its huge energy consumption and avoid the environmental impact of resulting greenhouse gas emissions.**
- **Collaborate with surrounding states to adopt complementary regulations that prevent emissions "leakage" and the export of New York industries.**
- **Follow the Climate Justice Working Group's recommendations on technological solutions to replace fossil fuel combustion in industry processes, recognizing that hydrogen combustion for high-heat processes can create harmful nitrous oxide emissions.**
- **Ensure that benefits from decarbonizing industry are equitably distributed and that any negative impacts, such as new pollution from combustion of green hydrogen, do not negatively impact Disadvantaged Communities.**
- **Support workers whose livelihoods are impacted by the decarbonization of industry.**

CROSS SECTOR

Thank you for the opportunity to comment on New York's draft scoping plan to achieve the goals of the Climate Leadership and Community Protection Act. I am grateful to the work of the Climate Action Council on creating this document, which includes many strong steps towards addressing climate change and places New York as a leader on climate.

However, even if we adopt all of the sector-based strategies within the draft scoping plan, we will still fall short of New York's commitments under the Climate Act unless New York implements a comprehensive, economy-wide strategy to make up the shortfall. The Scoping Plan asks for public input on such strategies which must be designed to avoid burdening low- to moderate-income households and Disadvantaged Communities.

The final Scoping Plan must:

- **Price carbon, using a fee and dividend structure to effectively internalize the costs of greenhouse gas emissions across sectors.** It is most fair for a carbon price to start low and gradually rise each year, and must apply to all sectors of the economy. New York's current strategy, under the Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative (RGGI), only prices the electricity sector and impedes the electrification of buildings and transit.
- **Adhere to the most stringent greenhouse gas reduction scenario (Scenario 4) in the draft scoping plan.** Climate change is a personal issue for each and every one of us. A scenario that gambles our livable futures away through reliance on highly uncertain "negative emissions technologies" and anything less than rapid and complete decarbonization of all emitting sectors acts in direct disservice to all New Yorkers. New York must lead on climate with bold commitments and relentless efforts to achieve zero emissions fully and equitably by 2050.